

DISSERTATION APPROVED BY

June 30, 2021

Date



Paul Moon, Ph.D., Chair



Mary Ann Kahl, Ed.D., Committee Member



Leah Georges, Ph.D., Program Director



Kevin T. FitzGerald, S.J., Ph.D., Ph.D., Dean

HOW SCHOOL LEADERS IN TITLE I SCHOOLS DEVELOP, INFLUENCE, AND
RETAIN BLACK TEACHERS

By
KAREN GRIFFEN

A DISSERTATION IN PRACTICE

Submitted to the faculty of the Graduate School of Creighton University in Partial
Fulfillment of the Requirements for the degree of Doctor of Education in
Interdisciplinary Leadership

Omaha, NE
(June 30, 2021)

Abstract

The purpose of this qualitative case study was to explore the practices of school leaders (SL) in Title I schools in developing, influencing, and retaining Black teachers (BT) at their current school site. Although exit surveys and research clarify reasons why teachers leave their positions, what remains unknown are the specific practices school leaders implement to develop, influence, and retain BT. Therefore, the aim of this study was to determine how SL in Title I develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site. The review of literature included (a) Critical Race Theory (CRT) as the theoretical lens; (b) several historical events that influenced the shortage of BT; (c) key ideas supporting the importance to why BT matter; (d) strategies used to promote BT talent and acquisition; (e) reasons explaining BT's flight from the teaching profession; and conclude with (f) a review of SL's leadership influence on BT's development and retention. This qualitative multiple case study involved individual semi-structured recorded Zoom interviews, a focus group, and three teacher handbooks as an artifact. The purposeful sampling size was 12 participants from 12 different Title I schools across five different Colorado school districts. The main themes found were Leadership Development for BT, Influences of Success for BT, and Retention Supports for BT. The proposed solution - *The Inclusive School House Project* - addressed the need for school leaders to embark on deliberate actions to increase BT retention in Title I or high poverty schools, through transformational leadership and culturally responsive leadership to increase the number of teachers of color to match the demographics of schools.

Keywords: Black teacher development, influences of success, retention supports, school leadership, Title I

Dedications

Every single second, minute, day, week, month, and year, this journey was only completed because Father, who art in heaven, you called me to take this walk. The hardest steps in this journey were the sleepless nights, and the sacrifices of missing all the fun time spent with my two sons that you have given to me.

This study is dedicated to my first born who is so ever kind, Solomon Jermaine Griffen. Throughout this long process, you have seen me transform from a seed of curiosity, then grew into a twig needing water to nurture my stride that was needed to come. Then I became a plant, kneeling and sharing my learned knowledge with others. I gained my beautiful flowers with tears of pain because it rained and it poured heavy burdens of sorrow and of loss of not having time spent with you. Son, I ask for your forgiveness.

Again, this study is dedicated to my second born who is my protector, Langston Jermaine Griffen. On a pink sheet of paper, you should scribble the letters, H.E.A.R.T. Why? You were the blood that flowed through my veins on our long travel each and every morning, whether it snowed, rained, or just the beautiful sun shining. You were there with me, and you were needed to keep my blood flowing. Then one day, my heart became stronger as I strived to finish this journey. Son, now, you should get a book, and read the golden words T.H.A.N.K. Y.O.U!

Solomon and Langston, I hope that the both of you will take these memories of each step of this God given journey I have taken with bare feet as a legacy to come in living your best life to come. Mommy loves the both of you. Today. Tomorrow. And Forever.

Acknowledgments

Whether it was a paper, a project, my candidacy, my proposal, and then this dissertation, you have been next to me through each step. As God knows, this final step has been wanted more for you than it has been for me. As we married and birth two sons, now we have birthed a legacy of knowledge for the two of us, our two sons, and for this world that God so ever created. Aaron ...Griff ... my Love, there is no way on this earth, I could not have done this without you. Never! I love you today, tomorrow, and always!

Mom, I can hear you bragging, "My daughter is a teacher! My daughter has a master's degree!" Now you would say, "My daughter is a Doctor!" Mom, I give you bragging rights, as you are in heaven!

Nana, Linda Dyer, on that specific Sunday, during the summer of 2014, God had a plan for you to join our family. We needed your prayer. I needed your pray...you prayed for me even when I didn't pray for myself. Thank you! Now I have learned to pray for myself. May we share our love until the final day and more!

Crystal, my beloved sister! You have been my family, and you have shared the love of our beloved mom. You had enough faith that I would finish for our two sisters, and our one and only brother. Thank you for being there from the start of my journey, and at the end of my journey. Love you!

Dr. Mary Ann Kahl, you have been the stone that has anchored me safe! My days have been rocky, and you have settled me still. I asked God to grant me grace to finish this journey. He gave me grace. He gave me joy. Then, he gave me you. Dr. Kahl, there is no way, on this earth, I would have completed this journey without you. You are my God send, and thank you!

Dr. Moon, thank you to the stars and back! We have conquered this journey. I wish you the best!

Carolyn Carpenter, my friend with the yellow hair, CC!!! I know you are so proud of me, as you look down from heaven!

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	iii
Dedications	iv
Acknowledgments.....	v
Table of Contents	vii
List of Tables.....	xiv
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION.....	1
Statement of the Problem.....	1
Purpose of the Study	3
Research Question	3
Aim of the Study.....	3
Definition of Relevant Terms.....	5
Methodology Overview	7
Delimitations, Limitations, and Personal Biases	8
Reflections of the Scholar-Practitioner.....	9
Summary.....	12
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	13
Theoretical Framework.....	13
Critical Race Theory	13
Five Tenets	18

White Dominance	20
The Jim Crow Era	24
Brown v Board of Education, 1954	27
The Civil Rights Movement.....	29
The Aftermath of Hurricane Katrina.....	31
Why Black Teachers Matter.....	34
Black Teachers Impact SOC's School Experience	34
Black Teachers as Culturally Responsive Instructors and Leaders.....	36
Black Teachers Impact in a Diverse Teaching Workforce	38
Black Teachers Talent and Acquisition	39
Recruiting Black Teachers	40
Hiring Black Teachers.....	41
Retaining Black Teachers.....	43
Developing Black Teachers	44
Black Teacher Turnover	47
Working Conditions	49
Whiteness in the School Site.....	51
Importance of School Leadership	53
The Role and Function of the School Leader	54
Transformational Leadership	57

The Experienced Leader	59
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY	63
Research Question	63
Method	63
Research Design Overview.....	64
Research Design.....	65
Recruitment Strategies	67
Focus Group Participants	70
Data Collection	70
Data Collection Procedures.....	71
Methodological Integrity	78
Ethical Considerations	82
Summary.....	83
CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS AND FINDINGS	84
Results.....	84
Title I School Organizational Structure	85
Profile of Participants	86
Data Analysis	91
Findings.....	98
Theme 1: Impacting Black Teacher Development.....	98

Subtheme A: Instructional Practices	98
Subtheme B: Culture Responsive Practices	114
Subtheme C: Leadership Practices.....	121
Theme 2: Influencing Black Teachers to Succeed	134
Subtheme A: Internal Motivational Influences	135
Subtheme B: Cultural Influences	144
Subtheme C: Relational Influences.....	163
Theme 3: Supporting the Retention of Black Teachers	178
Subtheme A: School Site Hiring Practices.....	179
Subtheme B: School Aligned Practices.....	185
Subtheme C: Equitable Opportunities	195
Focus Group.....	206
Theme 1: The Impact of Black Teachers	209
Theme 2: Influences That Lead Black Teachers Succeed.....	213
Theme 3: Supporting the Retention of Black Teachers	220
Discussion.....	224
Summary	226
CHAPTER FIVE: PROPOSED SOLUTION AND IMPLICATIONS.....	227
Aim Statement	227
Proposed Solution(s).....	228

The Inclusive School House Project	230
The Projected Plan	232
Evidence that Supports the Solution	233
Critical Race Theory	233
Culturally Responsiveness	235
Recruiting, Hiring, and Retaining	237
Working Conditions	238
Roles of School Leaders	239
Transformational Leadership	240
An Alternative Teaching Pathway.....	241
Evidence that Challenges the Solution	242
Implementation of the Proposed Solution(s)	243
Factors and Stakeholders Related to the Implementation of the Solution	244
Stakeholders.....	244
Potential barriers and obstacles.....	245
Buy-In	245
Financial/Budget Concerns.....	246
Guidance for the Process	246
Collaborative Communication.....	247
Emotional Stress	247

Culture.....	247
Continued Development	247
Timeline for Implementation of the Solution	248
Evaluating the Outcome of Implementing the Solution	250
Implications.....	251
Practical Implications.....	251
Implications for Future Research.....	252
Implications for Leadership Theory and Practice	254
Summary of the Dissertation in Practice	254
References.....	258
<i>Appendix A</i>	273
<i>Appendix B</i>	274
<i>Appendix C</i>	276
<i>Appendix D</i>	279
<i>Appendix E</i>	284
<i>Appendix F</i>	287
<i>Appendix G</i>	291
<i>Appendix H</i>	292
<i>Appendix I</i>	293
<i>Appendix J</i>	298

Appendix K.....300

List of Tables

Table 1. Pseudonyms	75
Table 2. Title I School Organizational Structure.....	86
Table 3. Participant Demographics	89
Table 4. Key: Abbreviations used in the participant demographics Table 3.....	90
Table 5. Length of Individual Interviews and Transcripts	91
Table 6. Combined Aligned Themes and Subthemes for Groups 1, 2, and 3	97
Table 7. Focus Group Participant and Role	208
Table 8. Length of the Focus Group and Transcript	208
Table 9. Focus Group Major Themes and Questions.....	208

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

Students of color (SOC) in public schools are increasing across the United States. As the SOC population increases, the Black teachers (BT) entering and remaining in education are declining (Carver-Thomas, 2018; Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2019; Department of Education, 2016; Kohli, 2018). SOC need to have teachers with whom they can identify and relate. However, with the decline in BT, this need is largely unmet. In this study, the practices and strategies implemented to develop, influence, and retain BT by School Leaders (SL) of Title I schools were explored in an effort to identify those practices and strategies that are most effective in increasing the number of BT in American teaching force.

Statement of the Problem

In the United States, school districts cope with teachers of color shortages and even more so BT. Reference to BT is used to identify individuals of African descent. It may be used interchangeably with the term African American teachers, minority teachers, and teachers of color (Department of Education, 2016). In the United States, at least 40 % of schools lack teachers of color (Partelow et al., 2017). BT disproportionately teach in high-minority and low-income schools, and those schools have higher turnover rates of BT than White teachers of 19% versus 15% (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017).

Within the 40% of American schools that lack teachers of color, the majority are Title I schools, high poverty schools, or hard-to-staff schools. In this study, high-poverty schools and hard-to-staff schools were used interchangeably as Title I schools. Title I schools are considered underserved due to the lack of staff and support to address student

needs (McFarland et al., 2019). Title I schools are supplemented with federal funding to assist with high student concentrations of poverty to meet educational goals. High-poverty schools are public schools where more than 75% of the students are eligible for free or reduced-price lunch. Hard-to-staff schools have difficulty in finding and retaining qualified effective teachers and are commonly found in inner-city urban areas or rural-farming locations. Whether a school is classified as Title I, high-poverty, or hard-to-staff school, the consequences of their location or economic status offer lower salaries and lack amenities that attract qualified teachers (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2019; Colorado Department of Education, 2020; McFarland et al., 2019). Typically, teacher turnover rates are 50% higher for teachers in Title I schools compared to affluent schools.

School leadership has a significant role in retaining BT (Goings et al., 2018; Partelow et al., 2017; Sutchter et al., 2017). Once BT are hired and assigned a teaching position, the SL in Title I schools have the most impact on the development, influence, and retention of BT? What remains unknown, concerns the SL practices and strategies used to develop, influence, and retain BT.

Furthermore, each year, there are less BT to reflect the population of SOC. SOC who have at least one BT are more likely to attend college (Gershenson et al., 2017). Particularly in the state of Colorado, the percentage of BT is steadily decreasing compared to White teachers. In the 2019 – 2020 school year, it was reported that 87% of Colorado public school teachers were White, yet the SOC identified as 47.5 %. Also, in the 2019 – 2020 school year, there were 891 BT compared to 48,344 White teachers in Colorado (Colorado Department of Education, 2020). Research indicates that exposure to

teachers of color, and more so BT, have a positive impact on all students regardless of race and ethnicity (Easton-Brooks et al., 2018; Kohli, 2018; Stohr et al., 2018). BT improve school climate for all students and reduce teacher turnover in Title I schools (Hughes et al., 2015). Even though many school districts provide exit surveys to clarify the reasons why teachers leave their positions, what remains unknown are the specific practices SL implement to develop, influence, and retain BT (Gist, 2018; Goings et al., 2018; Jackson & Kohli, 2016).

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this qualitative case study was to explore the practices of school leaders in Title I schools in developing, influencing, and retaining Black teachers at their current school site.

Research Question

How do school leaders of Title I schools develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at their current school site?

Aim of the Study

Troubling trends in education are not made known to many educators. The number of BT is shrinking, and the percentage of BT has not kept pace with the increasing number of the SOC population. Researchers have provided evidence that BT have higher expectations for SOC compared to their White colleagues (Kohli, 2016; Pizarro & Kohli, 2018). There is an advantage for SOC being taught by the same race teacher because SOC will more likely be successful in graduating from high school (Colorado Department of Education, 2017; Duncan, 2019; Kohli, 2016). Therefore, the data around BT educating SOC should create a renewed focus on increasing the

racial/ethnic diversity of the educational system. Retaining BT should be a national focus and a mandate to implement plans to develop potential candidates who are Black to become teachers in Title I schools.

Therefore, the aim of this study is to determine how school leaders in Title I develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site. Effective practices and strategies to develop, influence, and retain BT need to be explored, discussed, and implemented with SL for all school districts across the United States (Kohli, 2016). Due to the increase of the SOC population, retaining BT is crucial for student achievement. SL can acquire knowledge to implement practices and strategies which help in retaining BT in Title I schools. Teachers who aspire to become SL and are earning graduate degrees in education can also gain awareness to retain BT. Human resource leaders, recruiting teams, and professional developers can learn new practices and strategies to recruit, hire, develop, influence, and retain BT.

In this qualitative case study, Title I SL, such as principals, assistant principals, directors, instructional coaches, directors of instruction and curriculum are designated individuals assigned as SL in Title I schools, were recruited as participants to better understand their leadership practices and strategies on how they develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site. The term SL is used interchangeably with administrators, principals, and directors (National Association of Elementary School Principals, 2020). In this exploratory pursuit, contextual dynamics were also considered such as practices and strategies, leadership behaviors and relationships, and leadership influence and motivation (Cherng & Davis, 2017; Leithwood et al., 2019; Olsen & Huang, 2019).

Definition of Relevant Terms

The following terms are used operationally within this study.

Black Teachers: Used to identify individuals of African descent. It may be used interchangeably with African American teachers, minority teachers, and teachers of color (Department of Education, 2016).

Hard- to-staff Schools: Schools that have difficulty in finding and retaining qualified, effective teachers, and many are high-poverty inner-city schools or rural schools located economically depressed or isolated districts that pay non-competitive salaries (Hughes et al., 2015).

High Poverty Schools: Public schools where more than 75% of the students are eligible for free or reduced-price lunch (McFarland et al., 2019).

Inequalities: The degree to which a person's race, ethnicity, social background, or economic status influence opportunities in life of unequal treatment such as race, housing, and education (Diangelo, 2018).

Inequities: Situations of avoidable differences creating injustice and unfairness from those in power over marginalize people (Diangelo, 2018).

Influence: An emotional connection an individual makes with another person to build trust in a relationship while aligning views, beliefs, and values for a long-term gain (Leithwood et al., 2019).

Race: A grouping of humans based on shared physical or social qualities into categories generally viewed as distinct by society (Plachowski, 2019).

School Leaders: Designated principal, assistant principal, director, coordinator, and instructional coach, or another individual who is an employee or officer of an

elementary school or secondary school, local educational agency, or separate entity operating an elementary school or secondary school; their responsibilities may include the daily instructional leadership and managerial operations in the elementary school or secondary school building (American Federation of School Administrators, 2020; Kane & Rosenquist, 2019; National Association of Elementary School Principals, 2020).

Students of Color: Non-White students identified as African American, Black, Hispanic, Latino, Native American, Asian, or two or more races (Plachowski, 2019).

Teachers of Color: Non-White educators identified as African American, Black, Hispanic, Latino, Native American, Asian, or two or more races (Bolser, 2014).

Teacher Recruitment: A process in which a district or school proactively develop relationships with qualified applicants to become teachers (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017).

Teacher Hiring: The practice of recruiting, interviewing, evaluating, and establishing a working relationship with future candidates (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017).

Teacher Retention: A school, district, or state takes the annual measurement of employee count to empower teachers to remain in their current positions (Hughes et al., 2015).

Teacher Development: The perception that teachers are learning classroom practices, beliefs, and ideas associated with changing for improvement (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017).

Title I: Supplemental funds to school districts to assist schools with the highest student concentrations of poverty to meet school educational goals. Schools with 75% or

more students considered low-income must receive federal funding (Colorado Department of Education, 2020).

Methodology Overview

This study applied a qualitative research method to explore how SL in Title I schools develop, influence, and retain BT at their school site. The intent of utilizing a qualitative design was to allow an exploration of in-depth responses of the participants. A qualitative method provided a space and time for each participant to interact in an interview session. A quantitative method, on the other hand, would tend to restrict the interaction of having in-depth discussions on how SL develop, influence, and retain BT (Creswell & Poth, 2018).

The design of this qualitative method was a multiple case study. Multiple cases cull data and may fill gaps from one case or other cases (Yin, 2018). Therefore, a multiple case study allows rigor to be embedded throughout the interview protocol. This design included individual interviews, a focus group interview, and an artifact of a teacher handbooks. Within the case study, a triangulated method approach effectively increases the validity and accuracy of the information and strengthens the research by addressing the problem from multiple angles (Yin, 2018). Multiple sources of evidence permitted an appreciation of the case study's scope and opportunities to pursue a critical methodological practice of inquiry. Also, a case study permitted adaptability with rigor without rigidity. This strategy helped address unknown gaps and biases (Yin, 2018).

This included individual interviews of the SL. After completing each interview, a cross-case design to identify themes of every interview will be used. The themes of each case were compared with other cases and were analyzed for different perspectives of

what practices and strategies SLs in Title I schools employ to develop, influence, and retain BT. Based on data collected from the interviews, the participants' responses of rigor and intent determined which SL will be asked to participate in a focus group (Merriam, 1988; Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018).

The data collection process included individual virtual interviews, a focus group interview, and a teacher handbook from various participants. The qualitative data analysis was an inductive approach to organizing, preparing, analyzing, and interpreting data. The data was transcribed, hand-coded, and categorized to establish meaningful themes (Creswell & Poth, 2018). Through the data analysis process, an explanation building technique was used. Each case study varied in their detail, and each case concluded a general explanation that fits each individual case (Yin, 2018).

Delimitations, Limitations, and Personal Biases

Delimitations set boundaries for a study and narrow the study's scope (Roberts, 2010). One delimitation of this study is that research was conducted only in the state of Colorado. This qualitative study did not account for SL in other states across the country. Another delimitation is that this study pertained only to Title I schools. Title I schools have a higher number of BT compared to affluent schools (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2019). SL with at least two years of tenure within the same Title I school setting qualified to participate in this study, and each SL has at least one BT with at least two years of teaching within the same school setting. This study did not account for the reactions of BT regarding why they remain working in Title I schools nor BT who do not work in Title I schools (Bryant, 2004; Roberts, 2010).

This study also had limitations that may impact the generalizability of the results (Roberts, 2010). One limitation of this study is the relatively small sample size of SL in the state of Colorado. The projected sample size was 8-12 participants. Even though this count of participants represented a small number of SL in Title I schools, this size is considered a sufficient pool of eligible candidates for a screening procedure of a multiple case study (Yin, 2018). Another limitation is that this research was concentrated in one geographic area in the United States. In the 2019 – 2020 school year, in the state of Colorado, there are less than 13% of BT and there are at least 130 school districts compared to 178 school districts without one BT (Bryant, 2004; Colorado Department of Education, 2020; Roberts, 2010).

Finally, this research favored an idea that creates a bias. The bias includes favoring SL in Title I schools to develop, influence, and retain BT (Carver-Thomas, 2018; Roberts, 2010). To eliminate ethical concerns and behaviors, this study was conducted with clear expectations and goals. All data was collected and analyzed following the expectations of Creighton University and was vetted and approved by the university's Institutional Review Board (IRB).

Reflections of the Scholar-Practitioner

Preparing for the Dissertation in Practice (DIP) experience has been meaningful through relevant experiences from my childhood as a student, an undergraduate college student, a graduate student, and a professional in the educational profession. Various encounters in my life regarding inequalities and inequities due to race have allowed me to choose the dissertation topic, "How SL of Title I schools develop, influence, and retain BT." In addition, reflecting on my past encounters led me to include Critical Race Theory

(CRT) as the theoretical framework for this research. The utilization of CRT served to enhance the analysis of data and also provide insight to the findings (Delgado & Stefancic, 2001). I am highly vested in finding effective practices and strategies for developing, influencing, and retaining BT in Title I schools.

When I was a young girl, born and raised in Houston, Texas, I attended several high poverty schools. These schools stood with broken windows, no air conditioning, crumbled furniture, rodents, and high barbed-wire fencing. Not only did my schools lack resources, but my schools also lacked highly qualified teachers. Many teachers lost their jobs due to the effect of the Brown v. Board of Education, 1954. Once integration began, rather than have BT teach White children, many BT lost their jobs as Black schools were closed.

Despite experiencing inequalities and inequities as a child in school, I am grateful to have had many BT. In elementary school, I was taught by five Black female teachers. In middle school, I had seven BT, and some of them were male and female teachers. In high school, I had a combination of nine females and male BT. Today, I feel that most of my BT cared either about my academics, my behavior, or my safety. As a student, I had a strong sense of belonging, high self-esteem, and high confidence.

Analyzing my childhood experience, I remember always wanting to be a teacher. My BT made me realize I was smart, and I began to dream of one day becoming a teacher. I also had many White teachers. My experiences of being a student of some of my White teachers felt different than being a student of a BT. Typically, when my teachers were White, I was often ignored, always last in line, and frequently placed in the lowest reading groups.

While earning my Bachelor's degree to become a teacher, it was hard financially. I received grants and mainly loans, and I worked as a substitute teacher in Title I schools. While working as a substitute teacher, it was a memorable experience to engage with SOC. Many SOC were excited to see me inside their classrooms, as I was one of the few substitute BT to serve in their school district. I always tried to go beyond the teachers' lesson plans, and I always encouraged the students to do their best. Working with SOC made me feel motivated and confident in wanting to be a licensed teacher.

These experiences from my childhood and traveling the pathway to become a teacher drove me to learn more about developing, influencing, and retaining BT. Being the only and first-generation college graduate of my family and working in a White-dominated profession, I find it purposeful to solve relevant complex-world problems. While addressing the issues of inequalities and inequities that BT experience, I am paying it forward to BT and many SOC. I want to ensure SOC have qualified BT, have meaningful experiences, gain opportunities to flourish as students, and be prepared for the 21st century. Also, I want to see BT thrive and live out their dream of being a teacher while having joy for the profession.

My values evolve around Ignatian Values. To ensure SOC receive the best education they deserve, I will make sacrifices for continued studies. I am committed to doing what is best for the good of all people (Creighton, 2009). Being a persistent and resilient SL, I will develop policies that create safe spaces for conversations about race and poverty. Living in a diverse global society, I will address inequalities and inequities through the lens of CRT as I encounter Whiteness in the profession of education. I am a change agent through organizational structures, policies, and systems. Consistently, I will

advocate for the education of all children to ensure they are receiving fairness and justice through diversity, equity, and inclusion while learning in Title I schools and having BT.

Summary

Chapter 1 presented an introduction to the topical concerns the lack of BT in Title I schools. In the American school system, hiring and retaining BT is declining compared to the rise of percentage of SOC within the public school. The purpose of this case study was to explore how SL in Title I schools develop, influence, and retain BT. A qualitative multiple case study design was employed. In Chapter 2, the literature review therein presents discussions on the select topical areas that related to this study.

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

The purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to explore the practices of school leaders in Title I schools in developing, influencing, and retaining Black teachers at their current school site. Chapter 1 illuminated the problem of the lack of BT in Title I schools. Chapter 2 advances the understanding of the problem through a review of literature providing several perspectives on factors related to the problem. Specifically, Chapter 2 will highlights (a) Critical Race Theory (CRT) as the theoretical lens for the study; (b) several historical events that influenced the shortage of BT in the American teaching force; (c) key ideas supporting the importance to why BT matter in the American teaching force; (d) strategies used to promote BT talent and acquisition; (e) reasons explaining BT's flight from the teaching profession; and conclude with (f) a review of SL's leadership influence on BT's development and retention.

Theoretical Framework

This section is an overview of CRT and how it was applied in this study to explore the school leaders' practices in developing, influencing, and retaining BT in Title I schools. More specifically CRT provides a framework in which inequalities or inequities in those practices due to race may be revealed. Finally, a discussion of White dominance in the United States will inform the reader how race is perceived as a social construct and its power to create social forces and privileges in education.

Critical Race Theory

Using race to explore educational inequality and inequities has not been common in education (Ladson-Billings, 1998; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995). CRT is one of the most widely used theoretical frameworks in the study of education and race. Theorist in

the field of CRT focus on historically marginalized populations within the low social-economic status such as Title I school settings as well as the larger society. Historically, CRT was born out of the critical legal studies field (Delgado & Stefancic, 2001). CRT formulated a discourse that focused on issues of race and racism in the law in the same way that education scholars began to formulate a critique of race and racism in education (Crenshaw, 2002; Ladson-Billings, 1995; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995). Today, CRT has grown to be a credible and expansive movement of inner-disciplinary and cross-disciplinary studies regarding public education. That being said, CRT can be useful in illustrating, exposing, and giving voice to inequalities or inequities in development, influence, and retention practices for BT (Crenshaw et al., 1995; Delgado, 2000; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995) and validates the use of CRT as the theoretical framework for this study.

Ladson-Billings, Derek Bell, Richard Delgado, and Jean Stefancic are all researchers that have given credibility to CRT as an acceptable theoretical and analytical framework that challenges the traditional ways race and racism impact educational structures, practices, and discourses (Bell, 1992; Delgado & Stefancic 2001; Ladson-Billings, 2009; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995). Ladson-Billings, a distinguished professor, pedagogical theorist, teacher educator, publisher, and writer, maintains that CRT is a social science theory. Ladson-Billings introduced CRT to the education field in a discussion about the education debt the United States owes to African American people (Ladson-Billings, 2009). She exemplified several models for examining ways to reduce the academic disparity between dominant culture and SOC.

It would be fair to share that Ladson-Billings has immersed herself extensively in her work to improve the education of SOC. She supports the notion that in the United States, Whiteness gains unearned privileges for White students that African American students are not receiving (Diangelo, 2018). As Whites live the dream of accessing quality education, the African American community continues to suffer from disparities of receiving a poor-quality education. Ladson-Billings (2009) stated:

No challenge has been more daunting than that of improving the academic achievement of African American students. Burdened with a history that includes the denial of education, separate and unequal education, and relegation to unsafe, sub-standard inner-city schools, the quest for quality education remains as an elusive dream for the African American community. However, it does remain a dream -perhaps the most powerful for the people of African descent in this nation.
(p. XV)

Black students are also humans. Every human child deserves the right to learn, grow, and have joy while being in a safe, quality, inclusive, and equal environment.

Bell, one of CRTs founders, discussed CRT in his book *Faces at the Bottom of the Well* (1992). The three tenets of CRT highlighted in Bell's work include 1) the normalization of racism in the fabric and culture of the United States; 2) a dominant group or group in power's use of interest convergence for economic gain; and 3) the importance of counter-narratives to speak to the multiple truths of people of color in contrast to the single truth told by a dominant group.

The late Derek Bell, a law professor and a writer, is known as the spiritual Godfather of CRT and first articulated his interest in the convergence principle in 1980.

Bell (1992) stated:

Black people are the magical faces at the bottom of society's well. Even the poorest Whites, those who must live their lives only a few levels above, gain their self-esteem by gazing down on us. Surely, they must know that their deliverance depends on letting down their ropes. Only by working together is escape possible. Over time, many reach out, but most simply watch, mesmerized into maintaining their unspoken commitment to keeping us where we are, at whatever cost to them or us. (p. 5)

Depending on the circumstance of individual Blacks, interest convergence may be a benefit or a disgrace (Griffen & Griffen, 2019). In history, teaching was a notable occupation. Therefore, the interest convergence of BT in the southern region of the United States would be a dream come true.

The abolishment of slavery ended in 1865, but Whites remain profoundly in power as legalized racist exclusion against Blacks still remain. Overtime, there were laws that overturned the limitations placed on Blacks to obtain specific opportunities such as: Brown versus Board of Education of 1954, the Civil Rights of 1964, and the Voting Rights of all Blacks in 1964 (Diangelo, 2018; Kendi, 2016). Even though laws were enacted, Blacks still achieve minimum economical gains. Blacks seem to take on blue collar jobs, or roles of public service which service people of color. As Whites are the primary leaders of education, their power provides privilege in determining privileges

and opportunities to BT. Regardless of how hard or smart Black educators work, their next opportunities for hire or promotion in schools are primarily determined by Whites.

As CRT was birthed out of the critical legal studies field, Delgado and Stefancic chose to recognize how individuals experience racial constructs that affected their lives and living conditions (Delgado & Stefancic, 2001). Both law researchers affirm the role that CRT played in advances to equalize the educational opportunities for SOC. CRT announces the truth of affirmative action policies, improvement of urban planning, and fair housing rights (Delgado & Stefancic, 2001). Subsequently, CRT has been extended to addressing issues of practices of hiring of BT regarding state certification, and discriminatory issues: high-stake testing” of SOC (Ladson-Billings, 2006).

People of color are marginalized, and to gain opportunities in society, it will take the continuous effort of using voices, continued education, a commitment of life-long learning, and mentoring and advising others of marginalized groups. Simultaneously, it would take changing laws and policies which would call for a fresh start (Delgado & Stefancic, 2001). Delgado (2009) stated:

As marginalized people, we should strive to increase our power, cohesiveness, and representation in all significant areas of society. We should do this, though, because we are entitled to these things and because fundamental fairness requires this allocation of power. (p. 110)

BT are marginalized and need equity and equalities to gain fairness in the American school system. An allocation of power among BT and white teachers, would allow BT an opportunity to advocate for social justice. Then, SOC would gain an appropriate education which would be culturally responsive towards meeting their needs.

Five Tenets

CRT is comprised of six tenets; however, this research referred to the following five tenets: (a) racism is an ordinary and normal phenomenon; (b) race is a social construct; (c) interest convergence promotes self-interest; (d) narratives and storytelling expose and challenge Eurocentric ideologies; (e) Whites have actually been recipients of civil rights legislation (Bell, 1992; Delgado & Stefancic, 2001; Ladson-Billings, 1998; Taylor et al., 2009). Racial inequalities and inequities emerge from the social, economic, and legal differences individuals in power create to maintain an elite status in the workforce, politics, and law (Bell, 1992; Delgado & Stefancic, 2001).

Firstly, racism is an ordinary and normal occurrence in everyday society. Racism is a structure or system of discrimination or antagonism against a person or people based on their race, ethnicity, nationality, or religion (Diangelo, 2018; Kendi, 2016). Racial bias is entrenched in all sectors of society as Whites are the unrecognizable beneficiaries of the privilege and more so in educational institutions (Harrell, 2000; Ladson-Billings, 2006; Witherspoon & Mitchell, 2009). Secondly, race is a social construct, and a grouping of humans based on shared physical or social qualities into categories generally viewed as distinct by society (Plachowski, 2019). In the United States, race has been socially constructed to the detriment of Black people. Peering back in the United States history, race has been socially constructed as in the Dred Scott case of 1857, the United States Supreme Court declared “Negroes,” whether free or enslaved, were not citizens (Delgado & Stefancic, 2001). Blacks could not receive Social Security and could not receive subsidized low-cost loans for homeownership (Bell, 1992). In the institution of public education, racial oppression remains a substantial barrier as BT strive to gain

teacher licensure and teaching positions (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017; Kohli, 2016, 2018).

Thirdly, interest convergence promotes self-interest is a crucial component of CRT. Interest convergence stipulates that Black people achieve civil rights victories only when White and Black interests converge (Bell, 1992; Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017). In other words, interest convergence is the notion White will allow and support racial justice or progress to the extent that there is an economic gain or there is something positive in it for Whites. In education, BT may be hired to manage the behavior of SOC while enacting the role of being a role model (Bell, 1992; Kohli, 2016, 2018; Villegas et al., 2012).

Fourthly, narrative and storytelling expose and challenge Eurocentric ideologies in CRT is known as storytelling and counter-story-telling. The dichotomy-storytelling and counter-storytelling-is predicated upon the belief that schools are neutral spaces that treat everyone fairly (Gay, 2010; Ladson-Billings, 1994, 2009). However, school curriculum and instruction continue to be structured around White culture and middle-class values and standards. Also, strictly educating SOC using European standards and methods, SOC becomes marginalized through insensitive and inequitable curriculum and testing (Gay, 2010; Hackman & Rauscher, 2004; Ladson-Billings, 2005, 2009). In today's school, the needs of students with disabilities and members of other marginalized groups often go unmet, and more inclusive educational approaches need to be adopted to ensure that all students have access to a solid education (Hackman & Rauscher, 2004).

Fifthly, the notion that Whites have been recipients of civil rights legislation is also a tenet of CRT. President John F. Kennedy signed the affirmative action law on

March 6, 1961. This law was implemented to prevent discrimination of employment because of race, creed, color, or ethnicity. However, the irony is that Whites have undeniably been the recipients of civil rights legislation, as White women have benefited the most from the affirmative action law (Delgado, 1991; Delgado & Stefancic, 2001). In the teaching workforce, White middle-class female teachers count for at least 80% of the workforce.

White Dominance

In the United States, many have been taught to believe we are all treated equally. However, the United States economy was based on the abduction and enslavement of African people, and the colonizers brought with them deeply internalized patterns of submission and domination (Diangelo, 2018). From the deeply internalized patterns of colonizers or White people, the idea of racial inferiority was created to justify unequal treatment of African slaves. Throughout history, many people have accepted racist views that there is something wrong with Black people and not the policies that enslaved, oppressed, and confined so many Black people. This is the pathological detachment that Kozol (1991) referred to when discussing the lack of research or academic study done on values of those who create these systems of oppression. Thus, slavery, segregation, and mass incarceration have all produced racist views of Black people are deserving of confinement, segregation, and incarceration (Diangelo, 2018; Kendi, 2016).

Race has a perception. Visual differences such as skin color, hair texture, eye shape, and other physical traits define us as being smart, sexual, or athletic. However, under the skin, there is no biological race. The belief that race and the difference associated with it are biological is profound. It is deemed important to understand the

social and economic investments that created science to develop a society and its resources along racial lines is acceptable to many people (Bell, 1992; Diangelo, 2018; & Kendi, 2016).

Diangelo (2018) unmasked, race is an evolving social idea. The term “White” resulted in the late 1600s in colonial law. People were asked their race on the census report by 1790, and in the late 1800s, the concept of a White race was solidified in the United States. In 1865, slavery was abolished, and Whiteness was profoundly important as legalized racist exclusion and violence against African Americans continued in new forms (Kendi, 2016). To be a citizen in the United States, legally individuals were classified as White. Individuals who were “Mongoloid” or “Negroid” were not lawfully White. To justify these rulings, the law stated that being White was based on the common understanding of the White man. In other words, individuals seen as White got to determine who was considered White and who was not considered White (Diangelo, 2018).

Race is a product of social forces. The color of a human’s skin tone may determine the outcome of the economic life that will be lived. In history, Blacks were non-White and were granted fewer opportunities than Whites. Even poor White and working-class Whites were eventually granted full entry into Whiteness. Whiteness signified identity, status, property, freedom, and a sense of belonging. Working-class Whites experience classism, and not racism. Even though, working-class Whites may feel shameful for being poor, but their intrinsic feelings allow them to believe it is better to be White than to be Black (Bell, 1992; Diangelo, 2018).

Racism is about power. The direction of power between white people and people of color is historical, traditional, and normalized in ideology. Racism extends to prejudice and discrimination. All races of people have prejudices or preconceived opinions or biases against other races of people because of their skin color, religion, or nationality. However, Black people or other people of color lack the social and institutional power that transforms their prejudices into racism. People of color cannot pass legislation that prohibits Whites and others from buying a home in a particular neighborhood because people of color lack the social and institutional power that transforms their prejudice and discrimination (Diangelo, 2018).

To be White is a privilege. Whiteness carries a position of status. The advantages of being classified as White is a social and institutional status and identity instilled with legal, political, economic, and social rights and privileges that are denied to Blacks (Bell, 1992; Diangelo, 2018). In the United States, Whiteness developed the foundational premise. To be White is the norm or standard for human, and people of color as deviations from that norm. Whiteness is imposed on all people of color, and White fragility or entitlement hurts people of color because Whiteness has a social and institutional status of power (Diangelo, 2018; Kendi, 2016).

In education, there are far less BT compared to White teachers. There are far fewer Black administrators compared to White administrators which entail power, decisions, and outcomes are made without the intent of BT succeeding (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017; Kendi, 2016; Villegas et al., 2012). As the number of SOC increases, many SOC will never have a BT or teacher of color. Thus, it is important to

reflect on how teaching can uncover racial socialization and the message we receive from schools (Diangelo, 2018).

In education, some White teachers are not aware of the educational benefits awarded to them through their sociopolitical privilege and White fragility (Diangelo, 2018). White teachers expect SOC to conform to White dominance while learning White hegemony in curriculum and instruction, testing, policy, and procedures in the K-12 educational system. SOC are expected to assimilate the European American way through social and intellectual behaviors, values and standards, and physical and dress attire (Diangelo, 2018; Gay, 2010; Ladson-Billings, 2009). From the perspective of Blacks, the assumption all students will assimilate and conform to Eurocentric standards and expectation is problematic because the assimilation and conformity show that White teachers do not honor and respect SOC's home culture and the past experiences of BT upbringing (Kohli, 2018; Ladson-Billings, 2009).

Historical Events that Gave Rise to the Shortage of BT in America

This section of the literature draws attention to the impact that five key historical events had on the decline of BT: Jim Crow Era (1865-1965); Jackson Davis and the Lost World of Jim Crow Education (1910 - 1930's); Brown versus Board of Education Act (1954); Civil Rights Movement (1954 -1968); and Aftermath of Hurricane Katrina (2005). An added description for each event will illustrate how the tenets of CRT can be applied to each event in an effort to provide an increased awareness of the reason for the shortage of BT in America.

The Jim Crow Era

In the first common school, the teaching workforce was mainly White middle-class females, and schools were also segregated, separated by race and social class (Cremin, 1957). Whites did not want their children to be taught by non-White teachers, and Black female teachers mainly taught Black children. Therefore, Black female teachers had a legacy in teaching in Black schools (Farinde et al. 2016).

Many southern states provided the Black community with school sites that were impoverished, run-down, lacked resources, and received minimum government financial support. Some “schoolhouses” met in churches, old buildings, portable buildings called “shacks,” or tents. Regardless of the physical conditions of their common schoolhouses, “social graces” were integrated into the curriculum to teach Blacks to be appreciative. Blacks had to be thankful and behave in a pleasant, polite, well-mannered way (Beauboef-Lafontant, 2002). Blacks had to have a more gracious attitude than Whites, such as being more cultured, more considerate, more observant of the courtesies, and finesse of Whites to gain a decent place in society (McCluskey, 2014). Therefore, Black teachers, primarily female, needed to be signified as ambassadors of *gracious* behavior for their Black students.

BT were more than ambassadors for knowledge for the classroom but an extension of the parental authority of their Black students' lives. The Black female teacher was “the consciences” of the world in which their students entered as the birth of their formal learning experience (Beauboef-Lafontant, 2002). They perceive their Black female teachers as “other-mothers.” Other-mothering gives Black female teachers unwritten permission to assist blood-mothers with mothering responsibilities such as

discipline and nurturing. Other-mothering embraces the ethic of care through religiosity, spirituality, cultural awareness, and political and policy changes (Beauboef-Lafontant, 2002; Bernard et al., 2012).

With continued efforts of the collective African American community, BT entered and remained in the teaching workforce during the Jim Crow laws of 1868 to 1968. The Jim Crow laws constitutional provisions mandated the segregation of public schools, public places, public transportation, and the United States military (Bell, 1992; Thompson, 2019). Regardless of the segregation policies, BT remained motivated to educate Black students despite the odds against them (Beauboef-Lafontant, 2002; Muhammad, 2020; & Siddle-Walker, 1996).

Relating to CRT, the Jim Crow Era is a prime example of how racism was an ordinary and normal phenomenon. On any typical day in a southern state, it was usual to see White schools equipped with resources, cared for buildings, and an adequate teacher to student ratio. Black students would have limited worn resources, non-ventilated rooms, and tight physical spaces for learning. The Jim Crow Era signified to be “White” was a privilege. To be “White” was an entitlement. To be “White” was ordinary and phenomenal.

Jackson Davis and the Lost World

In the southern states, White schools grew and improved, Black schools remained frozen and outdated. White southern schools were reformed including longer school terms, higher teacher pay, and renovation of the physical plant. As time passed, in the early twentieth century, northern philanthropist initiated a modern intervention in the southern Black education system. The intervention was called the “Industrial Education.”

Industrial Education provided a minimal form of education of limited capacities of southern Blacks. Blacks were taught basic skills, habits of thrift and work discipline, and values of White morality (Link, 1992).

Industrial Education was supported and influenced to other southern Blacks such as Booker T. Washington. In 1865, Washington was born in Virginia into slavery, and he rose to become a leading African American intellect of the nineteenth and twentieth century. He was a dominant figure in Black public affairs from 1865 until his death in 1915. He was a teacher, author, orator, and an adviser to several United States presidents. Washington's belief was that Blacks should learn a trade, so they become capable of supporting themselves economically rather than emphasizing obtaining a high level of education (Andrews, 1996).

Washington's belief of an Industrial Education was supported by Jackson Davis. Jackson Davis was born in Virginia in 1882, and he was an educator, advisor, an author, and a foundation director who served as an intermediary between African American schools in the south and a philanthropic foundation in the north (Link, 1992). In a triangulated relationship, Washington, Davis, and several wealthy philanthropists developed educational centers to replace shabby, unattractive, and unhealthy worn down school shacks where Black students attended. Many of these schools were designed to fit twenty people, but at least one hundred students and two teachers attended these run-down rural Black schools.

Improving Black schools was part of an effort to improve conditions for African Americans. As improvement continued in the rural south, Davis enforced the educational reform by allowing some degree of ownership of the reformed schools. The industrial

educational reform was connected to community institutions such as farming, agriculture, carpentry, sewing, canning, printing, blacksmithing, laundry, bell-hopping, and dress making. Davis emphasized to the state school bureaucracies to permit Black school officials known as “Negro Supervisors” (Andrews, 1996; Link, 1992).

Negro Supervisors and BT or Jeanes teachers who worked in the Industrial schools across the southern states received additional training of industrial skills. Particular skills were needed to produce quality crafted products of the community organizations. While the industrial education progressed, northern philanthropist continued the coordination of the Jeanes, GEB, and Rosenwald’s efforts to solidify state support for Black education. Therefore, Davis and Washington ensured more Black teachers were trained to become Jeanes teachers to work within the Industrial Educational system (Link, 1992).

Through the lens of CRT, Jackson Davis and the lost world of the Jim Crow Education was an interest convergence promoting self-interest for Whites and Blacks as schools were reformed of clean and safe progressive learning centers. The White philanthropists invested in the rural Black south and earned financial gains from the Industrial school centers. With the aid of Booker T. Washington, the Black community was provided an opportunity to learn a trade and earn money to support themselves and their family, and some Blacks became Negro supervisors (Link, 1992).

Brown v Board of Education, 1954

The decline of BT in the southern states was a consequence of the process of desegregating schools. Down south, Blacks marched for the right to vote, and schools were highly segregated. There were televised images of southern police forces violently

attacking sit-in protesters and marchers for the civil rights of Blacks. BT and Black students were feeling the exterior pains of the Black community while teaching and learning occurred in distress (Bell, 2005). In the same school system of White schools and Black schools, Black schools had substantially insufficient resources to educate Black students. The Black community were determined to achieve racial justice, dignity, and respect (Bell, 2005).

Even though laws were being changed, many schools remained segregated until the Brown versus Board of Education of Topeka, KS 1954 decision was made. Unanimously, the Supreme Court ruled that racial segregation of children in public schools was unconstitutional even if the segregated schools deem the education of students were equal in quality (Bell, 2005). The resistance to desegregation was apparent. Many school systems preferred separate but equal schools; maintaining two equalized school systems would be too expensive and complicated to manage. It would benefit lawmakers to force desegregation of all schools even at the cost of disrupting the education of all children (Bell, 2005).

Black students were bused to schools across the city and integrated into majority White schools. This resulted in BT losing their jobs. Whites did not want their children to have BT, so numerous BT who taught in Black operated schools lost their jobs due to the closing of Black schools (Farinde et al., 2016).

Through the lens of CRT, the Brown v. Board of Education Act was an example of *interest convergence* promoting self-interest for policymakers and legislators (Horsford, 2010). Dual school systems were expensive to develop and maintain even if they were equal. Interest Convergence can be benefit for the Black community in gaining relief

from racial injustice; only if there is an alternative economic benefit to the Black community as well – the would be *reverse interest convergence* (Griffen, 2017, 2015; Griffen & Robinson, 2020). However more often than not than the harm suffered by the Black community outweighs any benefit. Some Blacks did achieve racial justice only when it accommodated the White policymakers for the political and economic interest of Whites (Bell, 2005). White society made facilities legally non-separate, and the demand for equality had been satisfied in their perspective, and with that Blacks no longer had just cause for complaint (Bell, 2005).

The Civil Rights Movement

From 1954 to 1965, the vast majority of Black schools in the southern region of the United States were staffed almost exclusively with BT. This practice of educating Black students was unique to the South as compared to other regions in the United States. However, segregated southern institutions were designed to minimize social and professional contact between Blacks and Whites. Beneficially, this practice created a Black middle-class of teachers. During this era, 45% of Blacks had completed some or all of post-secondary education were eligible to be teachers at Black Schools (Bell, 2005; Thompson, 2019).

Affecting the Black middle-class teachers, a subsequent court case similar to *Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka Kansas*, known as “Brown II,” expedited the integration of all schools (Thompson, 2019). Border States such as Oklahoma, Missouri, Kentucky, West Virginia, Maryland, Delaware, and Washington D.C. amerced with compliance with the federal ruling to integrate all schools. The compliance of these states resulted in a displacement of BT losing their jobs. Overtly, BT were fired due to the Civil

Rights Legislation. Thompson (2019) stated many BT received a letter in August of 1965 as follows: “Schools will be integrated beginning with the 1965-1966 school year in order to comply with the Civil Rights Law... and I must request you inform your teacher that [their] positions will be terminated on May 25” (p. 2). Termination letters were a surprise to many BT. They were left without employment, pay, and lack of opportunity to teach their Black students beginning the 1965-1966 school year. These BT were left without a plan or a dream.

The process of desegregation systematically reduced the employment of BT. Though the Johnson Administration promised to protect jobs, many BT lost their positions or were demoted to substitute status. Policy choices made by school authorities, policymakers, and federal courts consequently reduced the number of BT in the southern boarding states (Thompson, 2019). In 1972, it was reported at least 38,000 BT across the south and bordering states were displaced. Some BT across the south and bordering states did receive teaching jobs in previously White schools as Whites in those areas began a White Flight (Bell, 2005).

The efforts for racial balance departed along with White families fleeing from areas of town where both Blacks and Whites lived. Whites feared sending their children to desegregated schools and drove their children to all White school districts. This *White Flight* resulted in some Whites sending their children to all-White private schools, and some Whites even moved to all-White neighborhoods (Bell, 2005). There was belief that BT in Black schools were less experienced in the minority schools due to a lack of training and resources. Black students in White schools were treated with hostility by White teachers, who had little or no interest in the Black culture. This era of the Civil

Rights movement leading to further desegregation not only affected BT but was a disaster for of Black students (Bell, 2005).

Using a critical race lens, the enactment of The Civil Rights Act of 1964 supports the notion that Whites have actually been recipients of The Civil Rights Movement (Bell, 2005) and that the BT carried the burden, losing power and position as the school systems were being dismantled to accommodate the Civil Rights Movement. BT found themselves demoted and moved into White schools, and the BT associations became part of the National Education Association without supports to delimitate to consequences of integration.

The Aftermath of Hurricane Katrina

On August 29, 2005, Hurricane Katrina made landfall in Louisiana, causing the city's levee system to fail and leaving an estimate 80% of the city flooded. Homes, schools, and businesses were destroyed from the entire city being underwater. Elderly people, families, and pets lost their lives, while many scared and frighten people waited on roof tops and other floated on makeshift rafts for days to be rescued. As many were rescued to safety, they were displaced from their families with no plan in mind on how they would survive or where their children will attend school (Lincove et al., 2017).

After Katrina, the teaching ranks were upended. In the aftermath, the Orleans Parish School District (OPSD) dismissed 4,300 teacher contracts and of those dismissed contracts, 3,800 were BT contracts. OPSD teachers received no unemployment compensation, no pay, nor benefits. The cohort of dismissed teachers included 71% BT (Lincove et al., 2017).

By the fall of 2007, many of New Orleans' schools were rebuilt and transformed. However, New Orleans had developed the largest experimental site for urban charter public school system in the United States. Buras (2011) asserted how the urban charter network shaped the city's racial, economic, and spatial dynamics structure. Conscious capitalism developed by educational entrepreneurs strategically assaulted the Black communities of New Orleans. Although new school sites were restored, rebuilt, or developed and given new teaching materials, supplies, and resources, SL turned Black families away from their schools. Formal exclusion from selective admission was common, and there were policies which supported special education students' denial of entry. Students with grades of less than a C+ were denied entry, and any students with reported behavior problems and conduct grades that were less than satisfactory were denied entry to specific charter schools (Buras, 2011).

Thus, New Orleans's charter school network is a modern model of education, and severe changes were made for school reform. The local policies went away, the collective bargaining agreement went away, and a fresh start of new regulation and new teachers replaced the veteran teachers who were still floating in the waters of Katrina (Buras, 2011). Through teaching organizations like Teach for America, many charter school teachers were newly college graduates (Lincove et al., 2017). Only 63% of the pre-Katrina teachers were rehired in the New Orleans public schools by the fall of 2013. New Orleans teachers who had less than four years of teaching, lacked a master's degree, had more than 25 years of teaching experience, or taught at a failing school before Katrina landed did not return to teaching (Lincove et al., 2017). Educational entrepreneurs

profited in creating alternative teaching pathways, networks, and organizations and hired selected teachers from their residency and no other teaching pathways.

The aftermath of Katrina led to the dismissal of 3,076 BT. In fall 2007, approximately half of the pre-Katrina BT had exited public school employment in the state of Louisiana. BT were more than likely to return to New Orleans than White teachers, but BT were less likely to return to the teaching force of New Orleans (Lincove, 2017). New college graduate students were hired by educational entrepreneurs to teach in the reconstructive charter network system. When BT were hired, more than likely they worked in the New Orleans public schools versus a reformed charter school. Public school districts accepted students who were rejected from the reconstructed chartered schools (Lincove et al., 2017).

Drawing on critical theories of race, the aftermath of Hurricane Katrina was a social construct. When the Black community returned home to New Orleans, their physical ecology surroundings were reconstructed, and so were their Black schools. Before Katrina, many Blacks lived in racially oppressed communities and attended schools with poor working conditions, limited resources, understaffed schools, and overcrowded classrooms (Buras, 2011; Lincove et al., 2017). Regardless the Black working class contributed to the city's culture and historical elements for decades, the city's urban space was economically, socially, and psychologically consciously reshaped along racial lines, exacerbating inequity while enhancing capital gains, property rights, and Whiteness (Buras, 2011; Diangelo, 2018).

Why Black Teachers Matter

There is a critical need for more BT to teach SOC. BT have a unique awareness of the needs, experiences, and challenges of SOC (Carver-Thomas, 2018; Department of Education, 2016; Kohli, 2016; Ladson-Billings, 2009). This section of the literature review focuses on three primary elements as to why BT matter in Title I schools. More specifically, this section of the literature review will focus on the positive impact that BT have on SOC; the importance of BT as culturally responsive instructors and leaders; and the role that BT have in a diverse teaching workforce. Each section will conclude with an interpretation of why BT matter through the theoretical lens of CRT.

Black Teachers Impact SOC's School Experience

It is essential for SOC to have teachers with whom they can identify, relate, and consider role models. When SOC are exposed to teachers of the same race, they are more likely to view the BT as a positive role models in breaking down negative stereotypes and helping to prepare students to live and work in a complex, diverse society (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2019; Kohli, 2019). Then SOC can feel comfortable in the environment which includes BT.

Trusting relationships among BT and SOC are crucial in order for SOC to gain academic success. Trusting relationships are more likely to be developed with SOC when they share a common background with the teacher. SOC have the support of BT to advocate and confront issues of racism and push them to achieve and know their learning environment is a safe place (Burciaga & Kohli, 2018; Kohli, 2019). When BT interact with SOC, more likely a connection of understanding cultural nuances, dialect, or vernacular occurs, and BT then have a niche to motivate them to learn.

BT influence the academic outcomes of SOC by having a strong influence on student experiences, and BT also minimize the chances SOC are subjected to punishment that leads to suspensions and mitigate the implicit bias of SOC (Carver-Thomas, 2018; Kohli, 2016). Commonly in schools across the United States, SOC receive more discipline referrals compared to White students. Disparate disciplinary outcomes can lead to time out of school and away from instruction which in terms, SOC are set-up for failure. When SOC, and more so Black male students, experience harsh discipline measures, they are channeled into the “school-to-prison” pipeline (Griffen & Carrier, 2017; Lindsey & Hart, 2017). However, when SOC experience a trusting relationship with a BT, the SOC begins to see the BT as inspirational and a person of endearment. This can often lead to the SOC having fewer office referrals. Fewer office referrals result in more time spent in class increasing the opportunities for SOC to be academically successful (Bernard et al., 2012; Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2019; Department of Education, 2016; Evan & Leonard, 2013).

When White students have White teachers, which is common, they are more likely to be academically successful. At the same time, when SOC have the same race teacher, they have a better chance of attending college (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2019). BT or teachers of color are more likely to feel “called” to teaching in low-income schools. In addition to being called, research has provided convincing evidence that BT, relative to their White colleagues, have higher expectations for SOC, and BT are more likely to improve learning for SOC (Carver-Thomas, 2018; Kohli, 2016). BT serve as advocates for SOC by encouraging them and pushing them to take on academic challenges.

Through the lens of CRT, interest convergence promotes self-interest of the dominant group. Often, BT may be hired to fill a specific role or function which the dominant culture prefers not to perform. BT may be hired to teach students who receive special education services or students who live in highly underprivileged communities (Kohli, 2016). Thus, BT may very well thrive in these settings as “Black people are the magical faces at the bottom of society’s well” (Bell, 2009, p. 5).

Black Teachers as Culturally Responsive Instructors and Leaders

BT are particularly suited to teaching SOC because they demonstrate an inherent understanding of the backgrounds and experiences of their learners. After all, BT understand their SOC backgrounds and experiences (Villegas et al., 2012). BT often have teaching styles or strategies SOC can relate culturally or responsively to which then results in higher student engagement. Students can learn about themselves through speaking, acting, and movement of context in a non-White-Framed Setting. Culturally relevant teaching or responsive teaching allows BT to use their skills at teaching in a cross-cultural or multicultural setting (Hammonds, 2015; Ladson-Billings, 2009).

Using a culturally responsive pedagogy can provide SOC opportunities to learn about themselves. A culturally responsive lesson incorporates texts that are culturally responsive to students who are being taught. SOC can see, read, think, and speak of people and situations that are relevant to themselves or other people from different cultural backgrounds (Gay, 2010; Khalifa, 2018; Ladson-Billing, 2006). Knowing that BT are more familiar with the lives of SOC they are then better able to interpret the student’s experience from their homes and communities to make sense of the learning encountered in the classroom (Villegas et al., 2012).

Culturally responsive learning is engaging and meaningful for field-dependent learners. Field dependent learners often work well in teams or groups as they build interpersonal relationships (Gay, 2010). BT may explain new concepts with visuals or examples from their lives and embed new ideas and skills in problem-solving activities which are relevant and meaningful to SOC. BT also select instructional materials that tap the interest of SOC and will more often create learning groups. As students work in groups, the teacher monitor and evaluate the students' learning (Gay, 2010; Hammonds, 2015).

Generally, the teaching style of BT is non-traditional and contrast with European teaching methods. BT commonly prepare unscripted lessons for their students that are meaningful and relevant to their everyday living and movement styles (Boykin, 1983). For example, students of BT instruction may include a hands-on activity, a chant a rap, playing a game, or doing a dance that relates to the content. When students are engaged in varied lessons which relate to their community or world, students are being exposed to culturally relevant pedagogy (Evan & Leonard, 2013; Ladson-Billings, 2006, 2009). At the same time, non-White students also find culturally relevant pedagogy engaging.

As BT enact the role of being a culturally responsive leader, CRT supports the tenet, narratives and storytelling expose and challenge Eurocentric ideologies. BT can demonstrate their skillset, gifts, and talents while developing trusting relationships with SOC through engaging lessons with expression and familiarity. SOC can be exposed to multicultural authors, cultural experiences, and activities that permit storytelling through speaking, singing, and movement (Gay, 2010; Ladson-Billings, 2006; Tatum, 2005).

Black Teachers Impact in a Diverse Teaching Workforce

When Title I schools include a diverse teaching workforce it is more likely that closing the racial achievement gap is possible (Villegas et al., 2012). BT are important to the make-up of the teaching staff as they may bring unique skills that are grounded in their own experiences. BT are typically hired to manage student behavior and to deflect family conflict. BT have a natural niche for teaching SOC using a culturally responsive pedagogy. BT can share their expertise with White teachers on how to engage students of color in relevant responsive teaching (Kohli, 2016; Ladson-Billing, 2006).

Another benefit of having a diverse teaching force allows collaboration among BT and White teachers. Various perspectives can be shared and analyzed for problem-solving, and teachers can invent new approaches through shared practices. BT can then feel valued and appreciated and have a sense of belonging. White teachers will then learn new knowledge and gain additional strategies to ensure all students are successful. As White teachers learn new instructional methods, they will foster cultural pluralism and acknowledge the strengths of SOC (Gay, 2010; Khalifa, 2018).

Female BT, in particular, are important to the American teaching workforce. They are often considered “other-mothers” to SOC. Through other mothering, Black female teachers develop positive relationships with SOC, and in return, SOC have more favorable perceptions of BT versus White teachers (Cherg & Halpin, 2016). Also, female BT are seen as mentors and role model for young female students as they play an important role in building female students’ confidence and self-esteem.

Male BT also play a unique role in the American teaching force, and like Black female teachers, Black male teachers play a unique and critical role to SOC and

especially Black male students (Thomas & Warren, 2015). Black male teachers can be viewed as role models to Black male students by being big brothers and surrogated fathers and more so in the elementary intermediate grades, middle school grades, and high school grades. The interactions that Black male teachers develop with their Black male students can impact a positive impact on these students' developmental understanding of race and gender on their positionality in the American society (Warren, 2020). Also, Black male teachers' visible presence in the classroom develops students' academic confidence, cultural pride, and connectedness to the student environment through culturally responsive teaching (Thomas & Warren, 2015).

From a CRT perspective, interest convergence promotes self-interest among the dominant group in supporting a diverse teaching workforce. Various perspectives among teachers can be shared, collaborative, and inclusive decision making can become of the school culture. Also, White teachers can benefit from having BT to help manage the social and emotional stressors of SOC in Title I schools.

Black Teachers Talent and Acquisition

The teaching workforce faces several challenges at a time when more students need the highest-quality teachers (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2019). This section of the literature review focuses on four critical elements of BT entering and remaining in the teaching workforce. More specifically, this section of the literature review will focus on; Recruiting BT in Title I schools; hiring BT to work in Title I schools; the importance of retaining BT who work in Title I schools, and the development of BT in Title I schools. Each section will include findings of promising practices that would improve the hiring, retaining, and development of BT. Each section will conclude

with an interpretation of BT talent and acquisition methods through the theoretical lens of CRT.

Recruiting Black Teachers

Across the country and within the walls of higher educational institutions, fewer college students are enrolled in teacher education programs, and more so, less of those college students are Black. Teaching does not carry the prestige nor the status as a vital job for the American people versus other professions such as doctors and lawyers. A lack of training, low compensation, inadequate retirement, and less flexible mobility does not align with the career patterns of other degreed professions in the United States (Partee, 2014).

Therefore, growing teacher shortages nationally is increasing with a need for qualified teachers and more so BT. When teachers are not adequately prepared for their role, it is likely to expect turnover. The preparation that teachers receive prior to teaching can determine the outcome of their success (Farinde-Wu et al., 2019). Most BT enter the profession through alternative certification pathways and have little coursework which a traditional teaching program offers.

Though few, some school districts have pathways to recruit BT to work in Title I schools such as “Grow Your Own” teacher preparation programs. The “Grow Your Own” teacher preparation models are usually found in hard-to-staff communities by recruiting high school students, paraprofessionals, before and after school program staff, or other school community members into teaching. Some districts also offer residency programs that resemble the medical residency model.

The educational residency model helps new teachers develop relationships through university cohorts and provide ongoing mentoring and support once residents become teachers. For instance, in the state of Massachusetts, the Boston Teacher Residency is comprised of 50% people of color, and 71% of the Boston Teacher Residency graduates continued teaching in the district through year six (Carver-Thomas, 2018). The potential teacher trains in a high-needs school for an entire school year under the guidance and supervision of a master teacher while earning a master's degree from a partnering university. In exchange for earning an adjusted salary, master's degree, and a stipend for tuition and living expenses, the resident commits to teaching in the district for five years after the residency year (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017).

In the decision making of changing federal or state policy, the CRT tenet racism is an ordinary and normal phenomenon existing in political and social issues of the American school system. In reference, many school districts officials are aware of the shortage of BT as a commonality across the United States, and more pathways and opportunities are needed to recruit, hire, develop, and retain BT, which then results to SOC having more teachers that resemble them, and likely have more BT to advocate for their needs (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017).

Hiring Black Teachers

Hiring BT is crucial for SOC achievement and growth. When BT are hired, they are more than likely to begin teaching without completing comprehensive preparation and completing state-required teaching exams. The cost of a traditional teacher preparation program can become a “debt burden” faced by college SOC. Many college

SOC are first-generation or second-generation graduates and attend college on federal aid loans (Hanushek et al., 2016; Imberman & Lovenheim, 2012).

BT are more likely to enter teaching through an alternative pathway and are more likely to teach in schools where turnover rates are high for all teachers. When school districts accept BT from alternative pathways, usually, the teachers are late hires before the beginning of the first day of instruction or after instruction has begun. When BT enter the profession through an alternative pathway, more than likely BT begin teaching without completing comprehensive preparation and completing state-required teaching exams.

BT are often hired in schools that have poor working conditions and low salaries. Often times the BT hired in these schools are late hires. Late hire BT often miss opportunities for professional development and additional preparation for classroom work time (Papay & Kraft, 2016). Some promising practices are on the horizon. The development of programs to support BT candidates through service scholarships and significant student loan forgiveness programs should be considered. In exchange, BT could commit to serving in high-need schools and subject areas for five years.

The federal government can mandate states to adjust teacher licensure requirements to provide teaching candidates a choice to demonstrate their competency. Candidates could go through rigorous, authentic performance-based, subject-specific assessments such as the edTPA (Carver-Thomas, 2018; Petchauer et al., 2018) or elect to take a traditional multiple-choice test. Having a choice could recruit more SOC to enter the teaching workforce which in return SOC would be more successful. States could support Black candidates or candidates of color by funding intensive teacher preparation

support programs that offer ongoing mentorships for exam tutoring, exam stipends, and job placement services (Carver-Thomas, 2018). BT candidates are more likely to be available for hire earlier in the year if the state and the district implement an initiative to recruit and hire BT (Papay & Kraft, 2016). Districts can also partner with historically Black colleges and universities, to recruit candidates for hire.

In the lens of CRT, interest convergence promotes self-interest. At the same time, SL of Title I schools could be intentional in hiring BT as a benefit for student achievement. SL and school districts could analyze and apply data on how and where Black college graduates live within the United States. Intentionally, BT must be recruited by school districts or charter networks to be hired to teach in Title I schools for SOC achievement. White district-level administrators could create policies and processes to hire BT (Carver-Thomas, 2017, 2018).

Retaining Black Teachers

Retaining BT in Title I schools is challenging. Teachers in hard-to-staff, high-poverty, or Title I schools earn low salaries, have concerns about school safety, and have larger class sizes compared to affluent schools. Other challenges occur such as having limited accessibility to professional-learning opportunities, dealing with low student achievement, limited instructional resources, and have higher rates of student discipline problems. Typically, these schools are under-staffed and lack experienced school leadership (Partee, 2014; Tingle et al., 2017).

Most BT serve students in hard-to-staff schools. Many school districts of Title I schools could prioritize teacher financial incentives to gain BT in hard-to-staff and high-poverty schools to improve student achievement on high Stake testing. Studies have

proven incentives to help retain BT or teachers of color when the reward is an amount of money that exceeds at least 10% to 14 % of their base pay (Imberman & Lovenheim, 2012). Incentives include base pay, skill-based compensation systems, pay for individual performance, provide incentives for advanced coursework, or pay for organizational performance. Incentives may help increase the motivation of a teacher but could ruin the school's culture by decreasing the morale and eroding the organization's trust among staff. Performance pay can be challenging and competitive because student qualities and abilities are varied, and teachers' skills and experiences are varied (Carver-Thomas, 2018; Imberman & Lovenheim, 2012; Shifrer et al., 2017).

Through the lens of CRT, interest convergence promotes self-interest in retaining BT in Title I schools. Title I schools comprised primarily of SOC and of low social economics would benefit when BT are hired and retained as this would be a pathway to increasing student achievement. The BT would also gain a benefit when hired to teach in a Title I school pending the monetary gain of a skill-based compensation system (Bell, 1992; Imberman, & Lovenheim, 2012).

Developing Black Teachers

As the teacher workforce in the United States is disproportionate of teachers of color and especially BT, teacher education programs fall short in preparing them for the racial climate of schools (Kohli, 2018). When many BT enter into the workforce, many are non-certified and receive little or no training in teacher education (Carver-Thomas, 2018). Therefore, ensuring the success of BT should be a priority of SL to retain BT in Title I schools. The determination of the success of BT development for success is

depended upon onboarding, training and development, critical professional development, and teacher leadership.

When teachers enter the workforce, onboarding can determine the outcome of their success. When BT enter into the profession, specific knowledge, skills, and behaviors must be fostered by effective SL and teacher leaders to ensure their success. Effective onboarding and comprehensive induction are critical for BT in their first years of teaching. Professional learning which focuses on instructional supports through coaching and feedback from experienced teachers and administrators are crucial to develop and retain BT (Shifrer et al., 2017). New BT should have an appointed experienced teacher to guide them with instructional practices, behavior management, and administrative tasks. The school district and the SL should develop systems that provide checks and balances on ensuring BT are thriving (Imberman & Lovenheim, 2012; Shifrer et al., 2017).

Training and development are necessary for all teachers, but many BT feel as though they are exclusive, invisible, and isolated from trainings and critical meetings. BT need necessary tools to assist them in learning content, instructional strategies, and behavior management that are conducive to their students' needs (Carver-Thomas, 2018). When BT lack access and opportunities for receiving professional supports, it is often reflected negatively in their performance evaluations. Then BT experience harsh realities of feeling inadequate and viewed as incompetent and then ready to flee the profession. As literature demonstrates, BT are racially marginalized, harsh experiences become barriers, challenges, and failures to their success. BT need to gain awareness and supports through critical professional development (Kohli, 2018).

Critical professional development allows a safe space for BT to engage and become politically and socially aware and meet individuals who have a stake in transforming the culture of teaching for persons of color (Griffen & Griffen, 2019; Kohli, 2018). Within some urban settings, affinity groups provide safe spaces to process the racialized dehumanization BT experience in hostile school environments. Members of the safe space or affinity groups circle with like-minded individuals to strengthen their racial literacy and acquire skills to understand how racism is embedded in the teaching workforce. Critical professional development can be seen as a tool to increase culturally responsive development by allowing BT to share their narratives as a mechanism of personal and professional survival for BT (Griffen & Griffen, 2019; Kohli, 2018).

In Title I schools, BT are potential candidates who possess the potential to fill teacher leadership roles. BT can mentor other teachers, help with the decision-making of campus planning, and lead teams and committees. BT would then gain opportunities to learn with their White counterparts while improving organizational learning and student outcomes (Klar et al., 2016). As more BT take on collective leadership opportunities, than the chances of increasing Black SL will also increase (Kohli, 2018).

CRT supports that racism is an ordinary and normal phenomenon as many BT are not being developed in their skills and classroom practices. As “Whiteness” is a privilege in the American teaching force, critical professional development is a supplement which is needed for BT to survive or thrive versus development in a White Eurocentric way much like the learning environment for SOC. This stream would allow BT to join affinity groups to strengthen their resiliency and perseverance to remain in the predominately White teaching workforce (Kohli, 2018).

Black Teachers Flight from the Profession

The continuous heavy workloads, low compensations, critical evaluations, and lack of job satisfaction are all catalysts of why teachers and more so, why BT leave the teaching workforce. (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2019). This section of the literature review focuses on three critical elements of BT's experiences within the profession. More specifically, this section of the literature review will focus on BT turnover, working conditions of BT, and the experience of “Whiteness” in hostile school environments. Each section will conclude with an interpretation of BT flight from the teaching profession through the theoretical lens of CRT.

Black Teacher Turnover

The turnover for BT is steadily increasing in Title I schools. Turnover in Title I schools are nearly 50% greater than affluent non-Title I schools (Carver-Thomas, 2018). Math teachers' and Science teachers' turnover rates are at least 70% greater in a Title I school versus an affluent school. BT who receive alternative certification pathways have a 20% turnover versus a White teacher of a traditional teaching program. Also, teachers with more experience have turnover rates of nearly 80% higher in Title I schools than affluent schools. BT who work at schools serving SOC are more likely to leave their Title I school for a White student population (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2019). The main obstacles to retain BT are dissatisfaction with administration, dissatisfaction with high-Stake testing, and a lack of mentoring and support. (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2019; Hanushek et al., 2016; Papay & Kraft, 2016).

According to a previous qualitative research, “Recruitment, Employment, Retention, and the Minority Teacher Shortage” (Ingersoll et al., 2019), dissatisfaction

with school administration is the highest reason for minority teacher or BT turnover. Ingersoll et al. (2019) reported 81% of minority teachers or BT leave the American teaching force due to dissatisfaction with administration. The school characteristics were rural or urban, high poverty enrollment, and were secondary and elementary. Besides a lack of school leadership support, there was a lack of resources, little teacher autonomy, minimum subject-content-focused professional development, and minimum student-discipline-focused professional development.

Teacher turnover has adverse consequences for student achievement and is highly cause by teacher dissatisfaction with high Stake testing (Fuchsman et al., 2020). High Stake testing lowers teachers' job satisfaction and causes teacher movement from one grade level to another. The more experienced and skilled teachers in a school are commonly staffed in testing grades resulting from SL moving teachers from the lower teaching grades. As SL are responsible for student achievement, SL seek to maximize test accountability pressure for state-mandated test due to the No Child Left Behind Act of 2002 (Fuchsman et al., 2020). Generally, teachers are not given a choice in the switching of a grade level then results in teachers leaving their current school and transfer to another school within the district or out of the district. Depending on the race and gender of the teacher, the teacher may gain an opportunity to teach at a higher achieving school (Fuchsman et al., 2020).

A lack of mentoring and support also is a factor of why BT leave the profession. Besides, many BT enter the teaching force from alternative pathways with high student loan debt and a lack of generational support due to being first-generation college graduates (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2018, 2019). The lack of generational

support is partially attributed to the racial history of the United States of America toward people of color. The systemic and economic exclusion of BT in education and housing, for example, through redlining practices and “separate but equal” schools have attributed to poor working conditions in high-poverty urban or rural communities (Bell, 1992).

When BT work in high-poverty urban or rural communities, these poor working conditions added to the history of racial trauma speaks to looming challenges they face. Therefore, it is necessary BT have powerful and influential role models in leadership who have an interest in their success to thrive (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2018, 2019).

In the American teaching force, and more so in Title I schools, race is an ordinary and common phenomenon. Critical Responsive teaching is a square peg that will not fit inside a round hole. As BT are marginalized in a White dominant profession, White policy develops systems that contribute to job dissatisfaction, poorly skilled leadership, a lack of mentoring, and high- stakes testing (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2018, 2019; Kohli, 2016).

Working Conditions

Behind school doors, the setting can include macroaggressions and micro-aggressions of racism which take a toll on the success of a BT (Kohli, 2016). Macroaggressions and micro-aggressions are the two main forms of discriminatory insults that target a specific race, gender, disability, economic status, or overall difference of an individual. A macroaggression refers to a group of marginalized people, whereas a micro-aggression is intended to harm an individual verbally or nonverbally (Kendi, 2019). Within a school site, both create poor working conditions for BT which then leads

to racial battle fatigue. The psychological, emotional, and physiological affect are all implications of institutional racism for teachers of color and BT. Kohli (2016) disclosed a statement from an African American female teacher:

As a teacher of Color, I have had to juggle many hats, aside from just my teaching - I'm the faculty advisor to many clubs, the teacher that writes most students letters of recommendation, the one that stays late to help students, the one who drives them places. I'm a personal advisor, a mentor, etc. Many students call me mom, something common to several women of Color teachers on campus. (p. 17)

The teacher's statement above implies she is expected to enact certain roles within her school site. The busyness of wearing multiple hats develops an aftermath. Which is fatigue, exhaustion, and burnout resulting to dissatisfaction of the school site or the profession (Kohli, 2016).

When many SL hire teachers of color or BT, they may expect the marginalize culture to perform multiple tasks for SOC due to being a teacher of color (Kohli, 2016). The marginalized culture may experience macroaggressions for being a hard worker and a multi-tasker as though they were in slavery (Kendi, 2016). As the marginalize culture perform tasks in the school site, they may also undergo the experience of micro-aggressions (Kendi, 2016). Individuals of the dominant race may ask questions regarding their desire of dress or their dialect of speech.

Eventually, BT may feel burnout from the stresses of their working conditions. Burnout occurs when teachers emanate from their perceptions of unmet needs and unfulfilled expectations. BT may feel devalued when they do not get recognized verbally, socially, or financially (Kohli, 2016). Alongside harsh working conditions, some BT

experience racial isolation and make it complicated to completing administrative tasks, instructional task, and navigate through political situations in the school site.

When BT experience racial isolation and displacement, then BT feel a loss of obtaining their purpose, mission, passion, and goals. Eventually, BT often begin to feel like they do not belong in the profession. At some point of being isolated, BT may realize they are undergoing tokenism. Tokenism entails a BT to assimilate to the White teaching force and forfeit their own style of dress, speech, body language, and accepting you are an employee of color or Black employee (McDonald et al., 2005). Being one of the few or the only BT, the BT's skin tone becomes salient within the school community (Diangelo, 2018; McDonald et al., 2005). The BT will stick out while being visible, and the increase of visibility creates performance pressures and a need to prove their worth, value, and ability. In effort, the BT or token teacher assimilates a highly polished and over performing professional persona which will result to burnout.

Whiteness in the School Site

In a White-dominated teaching force, Whiteness is a privilege. Whiteness is the study of the structures that produce privilege, power, supremacy, and systemic racism (Diangelo, 2018). BT may feel some categories of discrimination are minor as long as there is no physical violence. However, insults, insensitive comments, remarks, questions, or actions are painful because they have to do with BT experiencing feelings of not belonging to the school community (Pizarro & Kohli, 2018). In this literature review, three critical elements of Whiteness will be made known: invisibility syndrome, micro-aggressions, and color-blindness.

The Invisible syndrome affects the well-being of BT which causes racial battle fatigue and eventually affect BT retention (Diangelo, 2018; Pizarro & Kohli, 2018). The invisibility syndrome occurs when repeated actions of discrimination can create isolation and jeopardize the well-being of BT (Diangelo, 2018; Franklin & Franklin, 2000; Franklin, 1999; Harrell, 2000). Pizarro and Kohli (2018) expressed racial battle fatigue develops a psychological, emotional, and physiological toll of confronting racism. As the invisibility syndrome occurs, the BT internalizes they are not seen as a person of worth. This state of feeling is psychological invisibility because of not being valued, respected, or appreciated. The BT does not receive any recognition, no rewards, no validation, no respect, and no legitimacy (Franklin & Franklin, 2000). This form of racism can traumatize, humiliate, confuse, and prevent the growth and development of BT (Harrell, 2000; Pizarro & Kohli, 2018). Eventually, the BT feels hopeless and leaves the profession.

Racial micro-aggressions occur in the teaching force constantly, are often automatic subtle, stunning, and nonverbal exchanges which are put downs toward BT. Some micro-aggressions are related to an individual's race or experiences (Diangelo, 2018; Lewis & Neville, 2015) and make BT feel like their invisible and second-class citizens. When verbal or nonverbal remarks occur consciously or unconsciously, they serve as micro-stressors such as being ignored or spoken over while attending a White-dominated team meeting of teachers. In the White-dominated profession, most micro-aggressions have to be ignored or allowed to pass to prevent disputes and protect one's sanity (Harrell, 2000; Pizarro & Kohli, 2018). Eventually, the BT becomes depleted and leaves the profession-burnout.

Color-blindness is another kind of Whiteness and is an act that allows White teachers to ignore racial differences and utilize White privilege while working with BT and SOC. When White teachers claim to be color-blind, they are protecting their feelings from discomfort, shame, or personal Responsibilities for the reality of racism (Jayakumar & Adamian, 2017; Kohli, 2018). Color-blindness is racist and be enacted overtly or covertly. For instance, a White teacher may overtly or verbally state she or he is color-blind to a BT in a conversation. Color-blindness minimizes the existence of the BT and SOC by invalidating their lived experiences (Harrell, 2000; Jayakumar & Adamian, 2017). Through racial hostility and silence, the BT loses their fulfillment and leaves the profession.

In the framework of CRT, race is an ordinary and normal phenomenon within the White teaching workforce. While most White teachers are thriving in the profession, most BT enter into the profession from alternative teaching pathways versus traditional student teaching. BT begin with a deficit and face macro and micro aggression to explain their existence in a White construct. They strive to survive inequalities and inequities of conditions of economics and education.

Importance of School Leadership

SL demonstrate their leadership competency through teacher efficacy and student achievement while establishing trust among their school community (Boyce & Boyers, 2018; Burkhauser, 2016; Northouse, 2019; Yan, 2019). This section of the literature review focuses on three critical elements of the importance of school leadership in Title I schools. More specifically, this section of the literature review will focus on the roles and functions of the SL, the impact of transformational leadership, and the impact of an

experienced SL. Each section will conclude with an interpretation of the importance of school leadership through the theoretical lens of CRT.

The Role and Function of the School Leader

Leadership has been defined numerous times from decade to decade. Northouse (2019) stated, “Leadership is a process whereby an individual influences a group of people to achieve a common goal” (p. 5). The role and function of the leader affect their followers in a positive or negative manner. Therefore, a leader’s trait approach or character mood can determine the outcome of the school community. Several trait approaches include intelligence, Insight, persistence, self-confidence, tolerance, and integrity. The trait approach for a SL develops over time when gaining personal awareness and reflection (Lowney, 2003; Northouse, 2019).

Title I schools need experienced SL for school improvement. However, it is common Title I schools continuously have high SL turnover. With the devastating effects of rapid SL turnover, the teaching force is affected. Approximately 25,000 SL leave annually, and 50% of new SL quit during their third year (Baptise, 2019; Kohli, 2018). SLs need a skillset to meet the challenges of the school role in which it is inherited (Tingle et al., 2017). School districts across the country hold SL accountable for student achievement and growth, increasing college readiness, and student behavior. Therefore, SL must be able to effectively demonstrate their competency in change management, school development, teaching and learning, and school culture (Wahlstrom & Seashore-Louis, 2008).

Change management approaches the preparation and support collectively through a school setting (Klar et al., 2016). Experienced SLs should understand the importance of

managing change within a Title I school. SLs must be effective change agents to execute the process to influence and instill positive attitudes among all teachers and especially BT towards change. Knowing that Title I schools have high BT turnover, efficient methods, and effective communication is crucial in managing change. Change produces a range of emotions from different people, and their attitudes are the most significant in determining a successful change (Klar et al., 2016). Therefore, the SL must use inclusive practices when defining the school's mission, managing instructional programs, and developing the school's culture.

School development is an integral part of defining the school's mission and vision. The school community must know and understand the purpose of the SL's goals and vision to ensure the mission is carried out. Teachers and students must share the same perspective of the meaning of the mission. The mission must be stated every day, and the mission must be visible to the entire school community. SLs must articulate within the mission a set of values that answer the fundamental questions about the purpose of how learning will be carried out. (Gurley et al., 2014). When all members of the learning community share the same common goal, which is to accomplish the school's mission, the SL will need to be strategic in managing the school's instruction.

Teaching and learning are primary functions of a SL, and the SL's role is to develop a teacher's efficacy through professional development and training. Teachers need opportunities and exposures to learn new skills and grow professionally to sustain the competitiveness of the teaching workforce (Department of Education, 2017, 2020). Managing the school's instructional program has a significant impact on student learning. Therefore, the SL must consistently and adequately supervise and evaluate the progress

of teacher performance, supervise the coordination of the curriculum and instruction, and ensure students are receiving a high-quality education. Strategically, the SL must allow BT to be included in decision making and the implementation of processes (Klar et al, 2017; Kohli, 2018). The SL may consider acknowledging BT for their contributions, hard work, efforts, and successes to feel valued and appreciated (Kohli, 2018). Therefore, the SL must perform as an instructional leader and have the knowledge and skills to increase student achievement.

School culture shapes the perception, beliefs, attitude, and relationships of the school community and develops the school's learning climate for student achievement. The school must function cohesively and inclusively with the highest quality of instruction. In the planning of rigorous and culturally relevant lessons, the SL must allow teachers to provide their iNSIght, their expertise, and their experiences to build capacity and collective efficacy (Boyce & Bowers, 2018; Klar et al., 2017; Wahlstrom & Seashore-Louis, 2008). To show the school community they are valued, visibility of the SL is meaningful and purposeful through engagement with the school community.

Through CRT, the role and the function of SL in a Title I school encourages interest convergence promotes self-interest within a school environment. Through change management, school development, teaching and learning, and climate and culture; a SL may Consider BT as a part of the collective leadership within the school community (Carver-Thomas, 2018; Kohli, 2016). Therefore, the intent of the SL decisions impacts the outcome of the student achievement.

Transformational Leadership

Today's SL must understand their influence on how their behaviors or actions influence BTs' development and retention in their current school site. Transformational leadership is a modern style of leadership which gives attention to the charismatic and effective elements of leadership. When a SL demonstrate transformational behaviors, then teachers' emotions, values, ethics, standards, and long-term goals are all considered of their well-being (Baptise, 2019; Northouse, 2019). Hence, a SL's influence effects the trust, belief, acceptance, affection, engagement and confidence among him or herself and their teacher followers.

Within transformational leadership, the team leadership approach is prevalent in work teams or professional learning communities. Team leadership allows members of teams or professional learning communities must rely on one another to analyze complex problems and structures. When the SL implement the team leadership approach it will attempt to increase school's organizational capacity and enhance student growth and learning outcomes. The SL expresses the need to improve conditions through collaboration and to problem-solve with teachers and stakeholders of the community. In addition, teachers gain influence, autonomy, development, and satisfaction. When SL can provide a sense of teacher satisfaction, teacher commitment, and teacher retention are more likely to occur (Boyce & Bowers, 2018; Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017, 2018). Team leadership allows the SL to include the school community in building school vision and goals, provide meaningful conversations, and offers another strand of support among the work team (Baptise, 2019; Northouse, 2019).

Also, transformational leadership allows the approach of shared leadership. Shared leadership occurs when the transformational SL utilize experienced teachers' gifts, talents, and skills to lead teams, departments, committees, professional development, and other administrative tasks. Trust, acceptance, engagement, and confidence are all demonstrated from the teacher followers while data, instructional planning, and policies are determined (Klar et al., 2016; Northouse, 2019). The teacher leaders can assist the SL with challenges such as attendance issues, academic plans, behavior management, safety, wellness, and organizational management. Shared leadership allow SL to build teachers' efficacy, skill, will, knowledge, and capacity (Klar et al., 2016; Muhammad, 2018). The SL must create the conditions for teachers to orchestrate their talents and leadership capabilities to help move the school forward. When teachers are engaged and valued, and they feel supported by the administration, then they are somewhat satisfied with their job (Griffen & Griffen, 2019).

It is no surprise many BT look to their SL as role models or parent-like individuals. Many BT are first college graduates and need assistance as they travel into a new journey of being an educator in the American public schools. While in the school site, new teachers and more so BT, have a need for reassuring authority figures to fill their parent shoes. BT prefer to have SL who provide security, certainty, and make them feel chosen or special to work in their SL's school site. Also, when the SL is a Black female, the BT thrives on other-mothering from the Black SL (Bernard et al., 2012; Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2018; Lipman-Blumen, 2005).

Last, all leadership begins with self-leadership which is to know yourself. Like any leader, a SL demonstrates principles of ethics such as respecting others, serving

others, shows justice, manifest honesty, and builds community (Northouse, 2019).

Therefore, a SL must establish a foundation including goals and values and know their strengths and weaknesses. As the SL commits and devours into practices of developing, influencing, and retaining BT at their current school site, it is crucial he or she invest equally in their human skills to have the capacity to lead (Lowery, 2003).

Through the lens of CRT, interest convergence promotes self-interest through the SL behavior. When the SL of a Title I school demonstrates transformational behavior school, BT feel valued and appreciated. BT can become engaged in the collaborative school community through team leadership or shared leadership. The SL can feel competent and accomplished by being a transformational leader of good ethics (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2018; Griffen & Griffen, 2019; Northouse, 2019).

The Experienced Leader

Over the past decade, the decision of hiring teachers has change from the school district and the school site. Therefore, it is crucial SL utilize their experience in making the best decisions for their school site. Many SL have gain influence on which candidates should become teachers in their current school site. As SL have influence in hiring, selecting the right teacher can impact student learning. The SL's basic leadership practices impact school improvement. While monitoring school improvement, a SL then influence staff motivation, working conditions, and job satisfaction. Therefore, the determination of who the SL hires is crucial for student outcomes.

Hiring the right teacher is important. In some districts, SL may interact with applicants at job fairs or in-person interviews at their school sites. The interactions with a teacher applicant can help a SL determine how an applicant will best fit the student

population and school culture. Also, a SL determination of hiring an applicant based on the applicants' personality, experience, skillset, data profile, and the applicant's teaching philosophy (Engel et al., 2018). However, the applicant pool of BT for Title I schools often may be slim to none (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2018).

The SL's basic leadership practices impact school improvement. SL has a significant effect on the systems and policies within the school setting. The systems and policies of the SL influences the quality of teaching and learning of teachers and students. Leadership practices shape the academic culture, collective teacher efficacy, and student behavior. Critically, the SL of a Title I school must hire the right teachers with specific beliefs, values, motivation, skill, and the will to support the conditions in which they will work. The teachers of a Title I school must obtain the goals, mission, and vision of the SL. Therefore, the SL will need to hire teachers of color and BT. The teachers of color and BT, will need to implement instructional practices to support the academic culture, contribute to the collective efficacy of the school community, and make contribute to the decision making of student behavior (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2018; Kohli, 2018; Leithwood et al., 2019).

While monitoring school improvement, a SL then influence staff motivation and the working conditions of the school site. School leadership have an indirect effect on student behavior and student performance. A SL practices shape school performance by setting expectations, building relationships, support desired practices, and improving the instructional program (Leithwood et al., 2019; Nicholas & West-Burnham, 2016).

Commonly in Title I schools, teacher turnover is greater than affluent schools. Therefore,

the SL's vision, relationships, shared leadership, and instructional support can determine the outcome of the development, influence, and retention of BT.

Teacher job satisfaction can be contributed by SL support. Turnover rates are high for public school teachers and even higher for teacher who identify as Black, Latino, or a teacher of color (Ingersoll & May, 2011). As BT leave their school sites, the revolving door is harmful for SOC. The academic performance and student behavior may decline due to the lack of BT or teachers of color leaving the school site. BT desire the interaction and collaboration of their SL. Fairchild et al. (2012) revealed possible reason non-White teachers lack job satisfaction when compared to White teachers include decreasing opportunities for mentorship, teachers of color leaving the force, high levels of stress. Therefore, the SL may consider exploring protector factors to improve non-White teacher satisfaction such as improve school climate and SL support (Olson & Huang, 2019).

Through the lens of CRT, interest convergence promotes self-interest through the influence of an experienced SL. The SL of a Title I school, may consider the teacher characteristics upon hiring. The teacher's characteristics will play an important part of job satisfaction. When the SL of a Title I hire teachers to support the SOC population and school culture, job satisfaction will become more likely for BT (Olsen & Huang, 2019). Then, school improvement will become more attainable for student achievement, student behavior, and the school culture. Therefore, a SL influence can matter whether or not a BT stay behind the school door or determine whether or not the door will continue to revolve.

Summary

Chapter 2 presented a review of select topical areas that relate to the development, influence, and retention of BT in Title I schools. The topical areas included the theoretical framework of CRT, history of BT, why BT matter, BT talents and acquisition, BT's flight from the profession, and leadership influences. In the following Chapter 3 will be a presentation of the research methodology, design, data collection procedures, data analysis, methodological integrity, and ethical considerations.

CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY

The purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to explore practices and strategies of SL in Title I schools use to develop, influence, and retain BT. Semi-structured interviews occurred with a sample of SL who are employed in the state of Colorado. The research question and sub-questions framed the data collection and the thematic analysis.

Research Question

How do school leaders of Title I schools develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at their current school site?

Method

A qualitative multiple case study was chosen to explore how SL of Title I schools develop, influence, and retain BT. A multiple case study allowed an exploration of various perspectives of the problem as opposed to a single case study which focuses only on one perspective. A multiple case study provided a more convincing analysis which allowed for a more in-depth understanding of the problem (Yin, 2018). Using a multiple case study approach provided a richer opportunity to identify commonalities and differences among each case with regards to the practices of developing, influencing, and retaining of BT. Furthermore, a multiple case study provided a greater awareness of the problem of why there is a lack of BT.

This qualitative multiple case study involved the use of semi-structured individual interviews, a focus group, and three teacher handbooks as an artifact. The nature of this study aligned the purpose of the study to the research question (Yin, 2018). The boundedness of this study included 12 different Title I schools of five different school

districts in the state of Colorado. Each school is considered a case for this study. Each school included one SL whether being an instructional coach, assistant principal, or principal to participate in individual interviews. Once all individual interviews were conducted, a ranking process occurred to decide which participants would be prioritized to invite to the focus group. The qualifying factor was dependent on the participant's responses to the questions content that indicated the most relevant and rich, thick data regarding the research question. Potential participants received between a 1 and 3 ranking based upon their most relevant responses. The qualifying participant from each group received a 3 rank, and the alternate of the group received a 2.5 or a 3 rank. Each participant who received a 3 rank was invited to the focus group discussion. The focus group consisted of four participants which is an adequate number (Yin, 2018). However, six total participants were invited to join the focus group. The focus group participants each represented four of the five Colorado school districts in this study.

Research Design Overview

A quantitative research method for this study would not have allowed the SLs' voices of Title I schools to be heard through their expression on how they develop, influence, and retain BT in their current school site. A quantitative approach might have focused on an account of events or behaviors instead of exploring how participants understand these events, and how this understanding leads to behavior and new experiences. Obtaining numerical data and statistical analysis would not have been useful in presenting the important nuances of varying levels of decision-making that this study concerns (Creswell & Creswell, 2018; Stake, 2009).

In this study, a qualitative method allowed for the eliciting of in-depth rich responses through semi-structured interviews. A qualitative research method for this study gave SL of Title I schools a voice to explain their viewpoints and perception of how they develop, influence, and retain BT at their current their school site. I gained an opportunity to gather evidence on these perceptions and perspectives of each participant who work within the given context (Yin, 2018).

Research Design

The multiple case study design allowed the study of individual cases independently and then evaluated them against each other to identify themes. Each case studied is within a bounded system which, in this study, is the SL's location and the context is the development, influence, and retention of BT in Title I schools (Creswell & Poth, 2018; Merriam, 1988; Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). Stake (2006) referred to a cross-case design in which cases are examined by a theme to give a more in-depth look into the issue and are interpreted as “the common relationship across the cases” (p. 39). Also, a cross-case design provided a more robust understanding of the issue. The case study design offered a practical understanding of experiences, thoughts, and processes of each participant while allowed for analysis across the cases to identify themes. In addition, this process made the data more valuable to readers by including thick and rich details which applied to their current situation or professional interest (Yin, 2018).

In a social setting, numerous research has been conducted using qualitative studies (Creswell & Creswell, 2018). Grounded theory research was briefly considered for this study because the development of theory of particular actions and events of a given situation would be appropriate. However, Creswell and Creswell (2018) noted a

grounded theory approach is not fitting for a study as the one explored, because acquiring 20-30 participants to interview for data collection would be complex in some circumstances (p. 186). In the state of Colorado, there is a limited number of BT who work in Title I schools. Therefore, the limited amount of BT results to a limited number of SL who have BT in their current school site in the state of Colorado.

A multiple case study design was appropriate for this study. The issue of this study concerned the shortage of BT in American schools. The data collection of individuals in one social setting or unit became a case study in itself. The multiple case study delivered reliable results to answer the research question: How do SL in Title I schools develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site? Yin (2018) stated multiple case study data collection methods have been refined throughout generations of scholarly research and are proven to add rigor and contribute credible results which can be replicated by other researchers. Besides, a single case study would have limited the results of the data collection methods and would have provided less rigor and insight to answer the research question for this study (Yin, 2018).

Participants and Demographics

This research study focused on SL of Title I schools in the state of Colorado. Even though the population seemed small for this study, it is due to the American school shortage of a lack of BT (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017; Department of Education, 2016). In the state of Colorado, the percentage of BT is steadily decreasing compared to White teachers. In 2019-2020 school year, 87% of Colorado public school teachers were White, yet the SOC identifies as 47.5%. Also, in the 2019-2020 school year, there were 891 BT compared to 48,344 White teachers in Colorado (Colorado

Department of Education, 2017, 2020). Moreover, in the 2019-2020 school year, in Colorado, there were less than 13% of BT and there are at least 130 school districts compared to 178 school districts without a single BT (Bryant, 2004; Colorado Department of Education, 2020; Roberts, 2010).

Therefore, SL in Title I schools who had at least three years of leadership experience, a tenure of two years at their current worksite, and at least one BT who have two years of teaching experience in their current school site met the participant criteria for this study. The SL in this study are principals, directors, assistant principals, instructional coaches or directors of instruction and curriculum. In this study, the terms principal and director are used interchangeably, and an instructional coach and director of instruction and curriculum are also used interchangeably. SL with at least three years or more experience provided in-depth responses for rich data regarding the development, influence, and retention of BT at their current school site. SL who had consistently been at their current Title I school site recollected a pattern of memories that occurred in the past two years regarding events, circumstances, or situations.

Recruitment Strategies

Participants were recruited using purposeful sampling. Also, snowball sampling was used to help with locating participants. Snowball sampling is a common form of recruiting and it allowed me to ask a few key participants who already met the criteria for this study to refer others they know who would meet this study's requirements (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). I cross-checked each potential participant's current school-site to ensure their school site was a Title I school or a high poverty school using the Colorado Department of Education's website. This website allowed accessed to the 2019-2020

“Teacher by Ethnicity/Race and Gender” page and was another source to locate Title I SL (Colorado Department of Education, 2020). Title I nonpublic and private schools were not considered for inclusion in this study due to the non-funding of Title I or high poverty status. Commonly, nonpublic and private schools are not classified as high-poverty schools or hard-to-staff schools, and so were not considered in this study (Hughes et al., 2015; National Center for Educational Statistics, 2020).

A constructed flyer was used in the recruitment process. A determination of whether or not the potential participant’s school site is defined as a Title I school or high-poverty school was determined using the Colorado Department of Education website (Colorado Department of Education, 2020). Once the determination was made, the flyer was sent to the SL’s email address (see Appendix A).

The flyer included a description of myself, the university I attend, what the study is about, a description of the criteria to become a participant, and a statement sharing the interview will be conducted via Zoom. Also, the flyer included a Creighton University email address and a phone number by which the potential participant contacted me. The flyer was shared with through friends, mentors, and former colleagues currently working in Title I schools or high poverty schools in the educational profession who reside in the state of Colorado. Once the SL contacted me, I conducted a quick screening via phone or email using a checklist to ensure the SL met the participant criteria (see Appendix B). If the potential participant met the requirements, the participant was informed of the next step, which was the individual interview.

Once the participant agreed to the interview, a scheduled date to conduct the interview was made. Before the actual interview, the participant was emailed an

information letter including the Bill of Rights (see Appendix C). At the end of the interview, the participant was asked to provide access to a teacher handbook as an artifact for observation purposes and to gain a better understanding of concepts, practices, and strategies of their school site. All participants were interviewed outside their working hours, and permission to conduct an interview was not needed from each participants' district due to each participant being nineteen or older, and the research not involving data or actual students.

When selecting a sample for qualitative research, population specificity and implementation of an appropriate sampling methodology is crucial to research integrity (Yin, 2018). Participants were recruited from the district where I am currently employed, from the district which I previously worked, from two nearby districts, and from a district which a family member works. The participants were different races, female and male gender, different ages, and each participant has at least a master's degree, three has a doctorate degree, two are doctorate candidates, and one had doctorate studies but has accepted the term - all but dissertation (ABD). The sample size included 12 participants to make the study manageable for cross-case analysis (Yin, 2018). Even though participants represented a small number of SL in Title I schools or high poverty schools, 12 participants were appropriate for this multiple case study, which led to data saturation from the interview process (Yin, 2018). The determination of the sufficiency of the sample size was based on factors that included the aim of this study and resources to ensure reliability was met (Creswell & Creswell, 2018; Merriam & Tisdell, 2015; Yin, 2018).

Focus Group Participants

Stake (2006) explained focus groups are advantageous when seeking to delve into participants' tacit beliefs and deeply held values. A facilitated discussion among three principals and one assistant principal from four different school districts shared their perspectives of differing opinions and points of view regarding developing, influencing, and retaining BT. The focus group interview consisted of four participants and it was held after all individual interviews have been completed and analyzed. In selecting the participants for the focus group, the data collection of the initial interviews was rated from 3 being the highest and 2.5 being the lowest of each participant in their assigned group to determine which participants to include in the focus group. Three instructional coaches were assigned as Group 1; three assistant principals were assigned as Group 2; and six principals were assigned Group 3. The participants who received a 3 ranking during the determination of themes were invited to join the focus group. This strategy ensured the methodological integrity of this research is met. I ranked the interviews to provide a critical and rigorous focus group discussion for additional data collection (Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). Once the data were analyzed, the highest ranked participants were emailed an invitation with a specific date to attend the focus group discussion, and the email included the information letter and the Bill of Rights to participate in the focus group (see focus group information letter in Appendix E). In the invitation, the time, structure, and format were described for the participants' consideration.

Data Collection

This section includes the data collection procedures for this qualitative multiple case study research. To explore how SL in Title I schools develop, influence, and retain

BT at their school site, data are collected from human participants. The data collection procedures included individual interview protocols, a focus group interview, and viewing of three teacher handbooks as an artifact.

Data Collection Procedures

An information letter was emailed and provided to each participant. The letter included the purpose of the study, rights as research participants, and other pertinent items (see information letter in Appendix C). Due to the participants' positions, their identities are kept confidential and pseudonyms assigned. The information letter was emailed to the participant before the interview started, and the information letter was read to the participant before the start of the interview.

Individual semi-structured interviews were recorded using Zoom. Zoom is a communication technology device that provides video tele-conferencing and online chat services using a cloud-based peer-to-peer software platform and permits recording (Zoom, 2020). Zoom was suitable for face-to-face interviews because it allowed a videography introspection and interaction of each participant.

The participants engaged in a semi-structured interview using prepared questions for sake of consistency across all interviews (see Appendix D). The interviews were conducted to a point where findings reached saturation, and new findings were no longer pertinent information (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). The aim of the interview was to probe the perceptions, behaviors, experiences, beliefs, practices, and strategies of SL of Title I schools or high poverty schools on how they develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site. The selection of the various SL ensured variability. The variation of SL also increased reliability and replication of inquiry of being a SL of a Title I school.

At the end of each interview, each participant was asked to allow access to their teacher handbook. However, the handbook was not a requirement to participate in the individual interview or the focus group discussion. The teacher handbook was used as an observable tactile artifact. The artifact was reviewed for informational purposes only for the possibility to heighten my understanding of concepts, policy, and processes of the case site (Yin, 2018). Also, each participant was informed of the possibility of joining the focus group. The interviews were conducted individually and assigned in groups for classification and management of data. The average length of the individual interview was 45 – 50 minutes. Group 1 consisted of three instructional coaches. Group 2 consisted of three assistant principals, and Group 3 consisted of six principals. Once the interview was completed with each participant, the interview data were transcribed. Next, the participant was consulted via email for member checking of accuracy and verification before beginning coding. Once the member checked was confirm, I began analyzing the data.

Data Collection Tools

The individual interview protocol was a semi-structured approach to gather in-depth and thick and rich responses. The interview protocol consisted of three overarching of open-ended questions that focused on the research question regarding how SL in Title I schools develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site. The open ended semi-structured interview questions elicited responses, to collect sufficient data on practices and strategies and gathered to conduct a data analysis. The semi-structured interview method was intended to enhance my ability to understand the problem from the participants' perspectives (Creswell & Creswell, 2018; Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018).

The interview protocol for this study consisted of four sections. The individual interview protocol was vetted by my dissertation committee members. The first section consists of pre-interview questions and social demographic characteristics (e.g., How many years have you worked in a Title I school as a School Leader?). Section two are questions regarding how SL develop BT at their current school site (e.g., How do you enhance practices of culturally responsive teaching?). Section three consists of questions about how SL influence BT at their current school site (e.g., How do you think Black teachers perceive your leadership style?). Section four are questions about how SL retain BT at their current school (e.g., What kind of mentorship, onboarding, induction programs, or affinity groups are provided for Black teachers once they are hired in your school site? (Individual interview protocol can be found in Appendix D).

This study also solicited access to teacher handbooks as an artifact. Teacher handbooks were sought from participants in this study but were not required for participation. In the state of Colorado, some districts require SL to have handbooks, whereas some districts' handbooks are optional due to union bargain agreements (Alexander & Alexander, 2018). The artifacts were reviewed for informational purposes only and possibility to heighten the awareness of concepts, practices, policies, and strategies of SL.

The focus group interview protocol consisted of several sections including an introduction, reading of the information letter, covering the norms, welcome statement, format and structure of the discussion, interview questions, and a closing statement. The introduction information shared my role as the facilitator of the focus group. Reading the information section provided parameters of the participants' rights and the norms set the

expectations for the interview. Next, the welcome statement allowed each participant a minute to provide a general introduction. The format and structure of the discussion was explained to all participants to ensure trustworthiness of the interview. The interview questions were presented to begin the discussion of how SL develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site while including sub-questions for clarity and to help stimulate critical thinking and in-depth expressions of experiences (Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). A sample question and follow-up question which were presented in the focus group were: What role if any do you think your race plays in the influence and impact of building relationships with Black teachers? The follow-up question: How does your race matter in building trust, a long-standing commitment, and an enactment as a role model or parent-like figure to Black teachers?

A thematic analysis is used frequently in qualitative research and was a good fit for this study due to the flexibility allowing an in-depth investigation of the collected data and helping to define and name themes (Creswell & Poth, 2018). To develop themes, both inductive and deductive approaches were used. The inductive approach included the process of coding which occurred without trying to adjust the data into a pre-existing frame. An inductive data analysis was used to discover emerging themes from raw data. A deductive data analysis was used to confirm the research question being addressed. The deductive approach allowed the analysis to occur and the results of coding to be placed into existing frames along with the data from the inductive approach (Creswell & Creswell, 2018).

Data analysis occurred in three phases. Phase 1 included a utilization of constant comparative method as a means of becoming more familiar with the data as it is being

collected. Phase 2 included a refined coding process. Phase 3 was a process of theming and organizing the emergent themes into final set of themes (Creswell & Poth, 2018; Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018).

After transcribing each interview, the participant's name and the name of their district was assigned pseudonyms and written on a master list. The participant pseudonym was assigned with historical significance. Their significance represented an American historical educator who I felt was a representation of the participant's character:

Table 1

Pseudonyms

Pseudonym	Historical Significance
Elizabeth Jennings Graham	One of the 1 st teachers to teach in a "Slave" African Free School
Helen Keller	Disability Rights Advocate
Mary McCloud Bethune	Educator, Civil Rights Activist
Jovita Idar	Teacher, Journalist, Civil Rights Advocate
Septima Poinsette Clark	Educator, Civil Rights Advocate
Grace Lee Boggs	Author, Social Activist
Edward Alexander Bouchet	1 st African American PhD
Eleanor Roosevelt	First lady of the United States, Activist
Charlotte Forten Grimke	Teacher, Anti-Slavery Activist
Fanny J. Coppin	Teacher, Principal, Warrior – School name replaced Andrew Jackson
Richard Theodore Greener	1 st African American to graduate from Harvard
Horace Mann	American Educator, Reformer

This strategy helped me utilize a culturally responsive approach to remember the exact facts of each participant.

Next, the Zoom audio-recording of the individual interview was sent out to a transcribing company or I transcribed them through a software called NVivo. The researcher requested that the transcription company used a time stamp in each participant's transcript. Then Zoom recording was reviewed to include edits and revisions

to the manuscript to prevent tainting the meaning of the data (Saldana, 2016). When the transcriptions were returned to me, I then listened to the interviews again to discover any nuances that potentially would not show up on the transcription completed by the transcription company, as I did the same for all of the transcription processed by me. Then the transcripts were sent to each participant for member checking. Once the participant approved the transcription, it underwent coding (Yin, 2018).

Thematic Coding

After the member checking was completed, the transcript was hand-coded using Microsoft Word (Saldana, 2020). Again, I read each transcript and began the process of coding responses and comparing codes within each transcript; descriptive coding and pattern coding both occurred to analyze the data. Descriptive coding allowed labels to be assigned and summarized in a word or short phrase for indexing and categorizing data. Pattern coding allowed themes, sets, constructs, and meaning or words and phrases to be organized (Saldana, 2013).

Then, I immediately identified potential themes and subthemes: “Qualitative inquiry demands meticulous attention to language and deep reflection on the emergent patterns and meanings of the human experience” (Saldana, 2013, p. 10). Microsoft tools such as highlighters, markers, and “find” function were navigated to identify keywords, key phrases, and similar sentences from the individual interviews. Mark-ups, jot notes, and highlighting to identify important and key items to undergo descriptive coding and pattern coding were recorded in my dissertation journal.

Hand-coding using Microsoft Word was used as part of thematic analysis. The thematic analysis allowed meanings and significances from the formulated keywords, key

phrases, and significant sentences to develop categories and themes. First, I highlighted identified meaningful chunks of each transcript that fit the research question that belonged to a specific category which is develop, influence, and retain. Once I completed categorizing, I then merged similar categories to make smaller groups to become subthemes. Next, I merged the subthemes into potential themes. Once the potential themes of each case have been identified, pattern matching for common themes were identified from one case to another case. Then a comparison and commonality of one case to other cases were made for similarities and differences (Saldana, 2020; Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). Then, I categorized the themes and data into a matrix which became a codebook. I highlighted the key terms, words, phrases, and sentences in light of the research question. Lastly, I analyzed how each section identified with the five tenets of CRT which will be shared in chapter 5.

The final stage permitted the coded and rated transcription approval to begin selecting and contacting the potential participants for the focus group interview. Pronounced words and key phrases of the participants were collected, combined, noted into a developing codebook to receive a highly rated transcription approval to qualify for the focus group. After the completion of the focus group interview, the data underwent the data analysis process of phases 1-3 as outlined above. The major themes of the focus group were merged with the major themes of the individual interviews (Yin, 2018).

Constant Comparative Analysis

In qualitative research, the process of a constant comparative analysis is a common strategy (Glaser & Strauss, 1967). The constant comparative analysis approach allowed an opportunity to engage deeply into the data. This analysis was conducted

during the coding process of the transcribed interviews. In qualitative research, the constant comparative analysis is an approach which leads to a comparison of themes from one interview with emerging themes to the next interview. The constant comparative method in the study continued until all interviews were completed (Kolb, 2012).

Methodological Integrity

Methodological integrity is essential to produce a qualitative study that is trustworthy, which is conducted carefully, thoughtfully, and correctly in terms of reasonable standards (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015; Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). I provided quality control over the transparency of methodological disclosure and reporting. Throughout the process, I was able to be explicit, open, and clear about of the research study with my dissertation committee, participants, and respondents (Stake, 2006). The purpose of the study aligned with the selection of an appropriate methodology. Credibility, transferability, dependability, confirmability, and trustworthiness are all components of trust while conducting this research study (APA, 2020).

Triangulation of multiple or many sources are better in a study than a single source because it leads to a greater understanding of the problem (Creswell & Creswell, 2018; Creswell & Poth, 2018; Yin, 2018). Triangulation was established by collecting data from multiple sources – individual interviews, a focus group, and a collection of three teacher handbooks as an artifact. Triangulation was accomplished through sequential data analysis, comparing findings, validating emerging themes, member checks, and identifying areas of further analysis (Yin, 2018). Triangulation increased the

fidelity of the interpretation of data by using multiple methods and enhanced the validity and trustworthiness of the study (Kolb, 2012).

An audit trail was kept from the beginning of the study. The audit trail is a log kept for documentation of events, situations, or concerns throughout the process of the study (Stake, 2006). Reflexivity can become a threat of validity due to my positionality. Therefore, in being a reflexive researcher, I incorporated continuous awareness of reflecting (including self-reflection), examining, and exploring the research process of my study (Kolb, 2012). The audit trail provided a scaffold to me to remain mindful of my bias, threats, and weakness, so I could better manage those dynamics to proceed in research work with minimum distractions and interference.

Trustworthiness included credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability (Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). I demonstrated trustworthiness by reporting and processing the data analysis in a precise, consistent, and exhaustive manner through recording, systemizing, and disclosure of the methods of analysis with ample details to enable the reader to determine whether the process is credible (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015; Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). In trustworthiness, the validity includes credibility and transferability. The reliability of trustworthiness includes dependability and confirmability.

All threats, bias, and weakness of this study were minimized through credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability. The credibility ensured I accurately reported the experiences of each participant (Yin, 2018). Next, transferability ensured I adhere to the policy and procedure directed by Creighton's IRB. Also, I ensured dependability by accurately documenting and using techniques to collect, analyze, and

report data. Last, I accurately and clearly coded ample evidence for confirmability (Yin, 2018).

Credibility is described with internal validity and accurately represents the experiences of the participants. My experiences include a description of background qualifications and indication of my work as a SL administrator. Triangulation of different data collection methods, varied informants, and different locations were employed. Also, 12 individual interviews, one focus group interview, and a collection of three teacher handbooks as an artifact support the credibility of this study. Additional strategies to ensure credibility included deep engagement to carefully listen to participants, accurately document processes and facts, and achievement of saturation of data. Member checking also increased the authenticity of the final transcript. Continued observation, saturation, cross-case synthesis, are all strategies I used for credibility (Merriam, 1988; Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). The credibility of data was dependent on the research design used within this qualitative research method to respond to the study's research question. In this multiple case study design, the importance of an appropriate sampling strategy emphasized each participant's uniqueness and varied skillset, so the participants represent members of a broader selection of SL of Title I schools in the state of Colorado (Yin, 2018).

Transferability was applied to policy, practice, and future research to apply to other people or context (Merriam & Tisdale, 2015; Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). The result of a detailed design allows the reader to comprehend the context of the research study and evaluate whether the subsequent setting is sufficiently similar to apply the findings of this study to other contexts and participants (Yin, 2018). Transferability in this instance relied on in-depth, rich, descriptive data provided by each SL of Title I schools which will

convey detailed practices and strategies used to develop, influence, and retain BT (Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). The study purposefully selected SL of Title I schools in Colorado with three years of leadership experience and at least in their second year of tenure at their current school site. The Title I school included at least one BT of two years of teaching experience which increased the likelihood of transferability of findings.

Documenting the procedure of a research study contributes to dependability (Merriam & Tisdale, 2015; Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). This study included overlapping data collection methods, such as semi-structured individual interviews, a focus group interview, and an artifact, that enabled comparing and contrasting themes within and between cases based on the analysis from multiple sources used to triangulate where themes intersected (Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). Throughout the study, an audit trail was used to document the inquiry process. Evidence included full transcripts as well as careful documentation of data of audio and/or video recordings. Further, an in-depth methodological description provided a comprehensible record of collected and analyzed data. Also, the data analysis process produced a codebook, details of the process of how themes were developed, documentation of initial codes including a description and occurrences, and major themes and codes (Saldana, 2013).

Confirmability allowed opportunities for future researchers to validate the affirmation of the findings of this research study. The establishment of confirmation in this data and interpretations of the findings were empirically supported and not be created or imagined. The findings are clearly derived from the data collection (Yin, 2018). I achieved a point of confirmability by enacting measures to establish a rationale that findings are evidence-based and void of predisposition. Instruments and tools were used

to avoid manipulation and use data collection strategies such as purposively selected variant sample and an audit trail throughout the process of the research. The audit trail reflects my background, context, prior understanding, questions, thoughts to express assertion of the collected data (Yin, 2018). Using a thorough organization method allowed me to consider rival explanations and positive cases to identify examples that fit an emerging pattern. These data collection methods and refined scholarly research added rigor and can be replicated by other researchers. In addition, code analysis highlighted the themes and support the explored problem (Yin, 2018).

Ethical Considerations

Ethical principles and guidelines for protecting human subjects of research were followed to avoid any deceptive practices. This study followed the guidelines of Creighton University's IRB. Participants were emailed and read an information letter prior to participating in the individual interview and the focus group interview (information letters can be found in the appendices). Participant names and school districts were given pseudonyms. At any time, the participants were able to withdraw from this research study without any repercussions, and confidentiality of all participants is upheld. A confidentiality agreement stated by the transcription company, the transcripts, collected data, and the study results are stored in a lockbox as well as on a password-protected personal computer (Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018).

An ethical consideration of this study is my positionality. I am an African American woman who is a cisgender-female and heterosexual. I am an administrator who works in a Title I school with high teacher turnover and a small number of BT. Previously, I have taught elementary school and middle school. I have taught an

abundance of SOC. There have been occasions where I have been the only BT or teacher of color. As a SL in the past and currently, I am the only Black administrator at my Title I school site. As this study concluded, I am familiar with many Colorado school districts' practices due to previously working in a former district, befriending colleagues in other districts, or I have a relative who is employed in a participating school district. I conducted an ethical research by not interviewing individuals I know personally or those closely connected to me professionally. Using transferability, credibility, dependability, and confirmability throughout this study, I understand I am committed to methodological integrity. Triangulation, audit trail, and member checking all disclose the reported findings clearly and accurately (Stake, 2006; Yin, 2018). Last, I remain ethical and committed to all methodical integrity of this research study.

Summary

Chapter 3 addressed the methodology, design and approach, data collection procedures, data analysis, methodological integrity, and ethical considerations. A triangulated approach including individual semi-structured interviews, a focus group, and the teacher handbooks as an artifact were used in this study. Chapter 4 provides the analysis and results from the collected data that will serve to address how SL in Title I schools in the state of Colorado develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site.

CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS AND FINDINGS

The purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to explore the practices of SL in Title I schools in developing, influencing, and retaining Black teachers at their current school site. The research question that guided this study was: How do school leaders of Title I schools develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at their current school site? This chapter provides an organizational structure of a Title I school, a demographic profile of the participants, and a time lapse of each participant's interview and the focus group interview. Also, included in this chapter is an overview of the data analysis process and descriptions of themes that emerged from the data analysis. This chapter closes with the discussion of the findings and summary.

Results

For the purpose of this research, SL were defined as a designated principal, assistant principal, director, assistant director, coordinator, and instructional coach, or another individual who is an employee or officer of an elementary school, or secondary school, local educational agency, or separate entity operating an elementary school or secondary school; their responsibilities may include the daily instructional leadership and managerial operations in the elementary school or secondary building (American Federation of School Administrators, 2020; Kane & Rosenquist, 2019; National Association of Elementary School Principals, 2020). The unit of analysis for this study were SL of Title I schools involved in the leadership of BT at their current school site. This study was conducted to determine the practices and strategies used to develop, influence, and retain BT. The aim of this study was to share effective practices and strategies used by SL of Title I schools to develop, influence, and retain BT with SL for

all school districts across the United States; teachers who aspire to become SL and are earning graduate degrees in education; human resource leaders; recruiting teams; and professional developers.

Data collection included 12 open-ended semi-structured participant interviews, collected handbooks as artifacts, and a focus group discussion to capture the practices and strategies SL of Title I schools used to develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site among five school districts in the state of Colorado. Twelve SL including two Directors of Instruction and Curriculum and one Instructional Coaches, six Principals, and three Assistant Principals accepted invitations to interview individually via Zoom using a four-part 78 semi-structured protocol. The first section consisted of demographic questions. The second set of questions focused on “How SL develop BT?” The third set of questions focused on “How SL influence BT?” The final section focused on “How SL retain BT?” Also, three separate handbooks of three different schools were viewed to gain an in-depth insight of the participants’ current school site. Additionally, a four person focus group discussion was conducted. The focus group protocol initially had five major questions and each major question was aided by a follow-up question. During the occurrence of the discussion group, only three major questions were asked focusing on developing, influencing, and retaining BT due to time.

Title I School Organizational Structure

The organizational structure of the Title I schools studied was as follows: one school principal/director, one or more assistant principal/assistant directors, and one or more instructional coaches. The school principal/director is the primary school-base leader, followed by the assistant principal/assistant director who reports to the school

principal/director, and the instructional coach who direct supervisor is the school

principal/director (see Table 2).

Table 2

Title I School Organizational Structure

Traditional P-12 Public Schools Hierarchy Structure	Public Charter School Hierarchy Structure
Principal	School Director
Assistant Principal	Associate School Director
Instructional Coach	Director of Curriculum and Instruction
Dean/Teachers	Dean/Teachers

Profile of Participants

For this study, Group 1 contained three instructional SL: an instructional coach (IC) and two SL called directors of instruction and curriculum (DIC). In the teaching profession, a DIC is commonly known to be called an instructional coach. The gender included three females; two African American and one White. The identified age group for all three females was 31-45. Assignments ranged from one elementary school, one charter middle school, and one charter high school. The total years in education for the three instructional SL are 58 years, and together their total average years in education are 45 years. The total years in leadership for the instructional SL are 25 years and their total average of leadership experience is eight years. Their combined years working in Title I schools are 36 years and their average years are 13 years. One instructional SL is employed in the suburban Central district, and the other two instructional SL are employed in the urban North Park district. Both school districts are located in the state of Colorado.

Group 2 contained three assistant principal SL. Their gender includes three females; one African American, one Biracial Asian-White American, and one Hispanic-Latina American. The identified age group consist of two in 31-45 range and one in 46-60 range. Assignments ranged from one elementary school, one middle school, and one high school. The total years in education for the three assistant principal SL are 48 years, and together their total average years in education are 33 years. The total years in leadership for the assistant principal SL are 21 years and their total average of leadership experience is seven years. Their combined years working in Title I schools are 44 years and their average years are 15 years. All three assistant principal SL are employed in the urban Southlands district located in the state of Colorado.

Group 3 included three principals and three director SL. In the teaching profession, school directors are also called principals. Therefore, this study references directors and principals interchangeably. The gender included two African American males, two African American females, one White female, and one White male. Three participants' ages are 31-45 and other three participants' ages are 46-40. Principalships ranged from two high school principals; one middle school director; one Pre-K – 8 charter school director; and two K-5 elementary school principals. The total years combined in education for all six principals SL are 130 years, and together their total average years in education are 22 years. The total years in leadership for the principal SL are 75 years, and their total average of leadership experience is 25 years. Their combined years working in Title I schools are 94 years and their average years working in Title I schools are 32 years. One principal SL is employed in the suburban Central district; one principal SL is employed in urban Southeast district; one principal SL is employed in the

urban Northeast district; and two principal SL are employed in the Southlands district. All four school districts are located in the state of Colorado.

The focus group consisted of four SL, and each of the SL is employed in four different urban Colorado school districts. The participants consisted of one African American male, one White male, one White female, and one African American female. Combined, the four SL were three principals and one assistant principal from one high, two middle schools, and one PK-8. All four focus group participants' age range is 31-45. The total years combined in education for all 4 SL are 64 years, and together their total average years in education are 16 years. The total years in leadership for the focus group participants is 32 years, and their total average of leadership experience is eight years. Their combined years working in Title I schools are 45 years, and their average years working in Title I are 11 years. Below is a table of the participant demographics:

Table 3*Participant Demographics*

Pseudonym	Age	Race	Level Ed	YRS Ed	YRS LS	YRS in Title I	Role	School District Pseudonym	District Type
Elizabeth	31-45	AA	M.Ed.	17	3	14	DIC	North Park	Small Urban
Helen	31-45	W	M.Ed.	21	7	7	IC	Central	Large Suburban
Mary	31-45	AA	Ed.D.(c)	20	15	15	DIC	North Park	Small Urban
Jovita	46-60	His (LA)	Ed.D. (ABD)	16	6	16	AP	Southlands	Small Urban
Septima	31-45	AA	M.Ed.	12	5	12	AP	Southlands	Small Urban
Grace	31-45	B (AW)	Ed.D.(c)	16	10	16	AP	Southlands	Small Urban
Edward	46-60	AA	Ph.D.	21	15	21	P	Southlands	Small Urban
Eleanor	31-45	W	MBA	17	11	17	SD	North Park	Small Urban
Charlotte	46-60	AA	Ph.D.	30	18	30	P	Southland	Small Urban
Fanny	46-60	AA	M.Ed.	27	15	10	P	Central	Large Suburban
Richard	31-45	AA	M.Ed.	15	8	8	P	Southeast	Large Urban
Horace	31-45	W	Ed.D.	21	8	8	SD	Northeast	Small Urban

The participants of this study reflected a varied population of gender, race, sex, age, and location of employment. Each participant obtained a graduate degree and have 12 or more years in public education. In addition, each of the SL has three or more years in leadership and seven years or more working in a Title I school. All participants' school sites are Title I schools or a high poverty school regardless of the district type and size.

Table 4

Key: Abbreviations used in the participant demographics Table 3

Pseudonym - Participant	G –Gender	M – Male	F – Female	YRS –Years	Ed –Education
AA – African American	B –Biracial	(AW)-Asian-White	His-Hispanic	(LA)-Latina	W-White
M.Ed.- Master’s in Education	MBA-Master’s in Business Administration	Ed.D.- Educational Doctorate	(c) Candidate	(ABD) -All But Dissertation	P –Principal
LS – Leadership	Admin - Administration	SD –School Director	AP-Assistant Principal	DIC Director Of Curriculum	IC Instructional Coach

The key table explains the abbreviations used in the participant chart. The information in the participant demographic was data collected from the individual interviews. The abbreviations were used to help the organization and the flow of the participant demographic characteristics for the reader’s understanding.

All interviews and the focus group interview occurred through Zoom. The summary length of time notes the minutes and seconds of the interview omitting the reading of the Informational Letter and the Bill of Rights. Also, a mock interview occurred to ensure the researcher was skilled with the tools and techniques of using Zoom to navigate the share screen tool, record the video, and prepare for potential trouble shooting that may occur.

Table 5
Interviews and Transcripts Report

Length of Individual Interviews and Transcripts

Participant	Duration (minutes)	Single-line Spaced Transcript pages
Elizabeth	25.26	8
Helen	65.20	14
Mary	56.15	6
Grace	38.16	10
Jovita	55.13	11
Septima	60.06	15
Charlotte	71.32	15
Edward	86.08	22
Eleanor	79.30	22
Fanny	44.03	15
Horace	61.27	14
Richard	57.18	17
Total	699.24	132
<i>Average</i>	58.27	11

Time results of all individual and the focus group interviews were 771.71 which is equivalent to 12 hours and 9 minutes. The interviews occurred in the spring of 2021 via Zoom in various weeks outside of the SL's working hours. The mock interview is not included in this total interviewed minutes but used as a learning tool to understand the Zoom software.

Data Analysis

The participants were divided into three groups: instructional SL, principal SL, and assistant principal SL. The data collected from each group were divided into three categories in response to segments of the research question, including how SL develop BT at their school site, how SL influence BT at their school site, and how SL retain BT at

their school site. Three main themes were discovered, each supported by subthemes for each of the three SL groups and the focus group.

Microsoft Word software was used to code the data which later evolved into a codebook. The first transcription of Group 1 was coded using a deductive approach that revolved around the research question, and the number of times each code was found in the first transcript was counted. Similar codes were placed into three categories. The three categories centered on how SL in Title I schools develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site. The categories were labeled, “develop,” “influence,” and “retention.” After placing the codes into the three categories, each category was skimmed to explore possible themes and subthemes. The possible themes and subthemes were recorded into a journal.

Next, the second transcription of Group 1 was coded using the same deducted codes from the first transcription, and new codes were discovered using an inductive approach and combined the codes from the second transcription with the codes from the first transcript that were placed in the labeled categories. A second cycle of coding of the first transcript was conducted to explore whether the new codes from the second transcription were embedded with the first transcription. Then once again, the number of codes and recorded the numbered codes were added and recounted into the journal to be used as patterned codes for the third transcription.

During the cycle of searching for the codes of the third transcription, the combined deducted codes were used to pattern the number of times the codes would be found in the third transcript. Continuing the coding cycle of the third transcript, an inductive approach was included to explore new codes. The new codes were run through

an additional cycle to explore pattern codes of the first and second transcript. As the inductive, deductive, and multi-cycled exploration of codes derived, a constant comparison approach was included to explore themes and subthemes. The same process was repeated for the three assistant principals in Group 2. The principals in Group 3 were divided in half to effectively handle the data. During the handling of management, the female principals' data was placed into subgroup A and the male principals' data into subgroup B. There was no particular reason of gender placement other than for effective organizational purposes.

During the constant comparison approach, the categories that consisted of groups of codes that would become possible themes and subthemes were analyzed. Similarities were sought by analyzing the codes with the highest amount of frequency of all combined transcripts. The codes with the highest amount of frequency were embedded into the overall categories which were develop, influence, and retain. The highest frequent codes were identified as leadership, develop, influence, retention, growth, practice, support, race, culture, and success.

The highest frequent codes created the three major themes: Leadership Development for BT, Influences of Success for BT, and Retention Supports for BT. Within each major them, the frequent codes were grouped into subthemes. The less frequent pattern codes were group into the subthemes within the category of the major theme and its three subthemes. During the process of analyzing the data of this study, there were 2,985 codes, 36 categories, three themes, and nine subthemes.

Once all of the codes were placed in categories from Group 1, categories were combined and analyzed for themes and subthemes. Throughout this process of cross-

categorizing, then codes were placed in groups or categorized based on the codes with the highest numbers were prioritized into themes, and the codes with less numbers were combined into sub-themes. To ensure this process was organized for credibility, notes were taken and recorded consistently into a log, and a code book was developed and updated throughout this process (Saldana, 2020).

Also, a hand-coding technique was applied with the use of Microsoft Word. Key words, phrases, or sentences were highlighted with identifying colors of green for development, yellow for influence, and blue for retention. The participant with the highest amount of identifying colors received a ranking of 3. The 3 ranking was the highest level of interest of responses to the research question in reference to develop, influence, and retain, and the number 1 was the lowest ranking level of interest of response to the central question. Then, each point for each category were given a 3, 2, or 1 score, then added together, and divided by 3. The points received was a score of 9, and the lowest score received was a score of 6. The scores that sum to 9 divided into 3, and 3 became the rank. Each participant that received a 3 were invited to the focus group. Group 1 had one participant ranked a 3, Group 2 had one participant ranked a 3, and Group 3 had five participants of a 3 ranking. In addition to the participant's ranking, the participant's name and school district were assigned pseudonyms for identity and confidential purposes (Yin, 2018). As data were collected, transcribed, coded, categorized, and analyzed, the same process occurred for Group 2 which are assistant principals, Group 3 which are principals, and the focus group participants.

The process employed described above is a constant comparison method. Yin (2018) noted the constant comparative method is used as an inductive strategy to

determine outcomes of behavior or events. Constant comparison method allowed the themes of the first case to be compared with the second case, and then the third case, until all cases have been compared for similarities and differences of incidents of each group. Then each's group's codes and themes were compared with the other groups' codes and themes. The results from the coded data collection of the individual interviews were a determination the participants for the focus group. The individual interviews were ranked in each group from high of 3 to low of 1 regarding the participants' responses of relevancy, richness and thickness of the interview content related to the research question of their practices and strategies used to develop, influence, and retain BT (Yin, 2018). Once each group's highest-ranking participants were identified, strategically other potential focus group participants were identified based on their ranking order.

The first-round selection of focus group participants were selected from the individual interviews who received a 3 ranking, and the second round selection of focus group participants were participants who received a 2.5 ranking. After the ranking of the potential focus group participants, six participants were invited to participate. However, one participant declined to participate and another participant was unable to make the focus group discussion. The focus group discussion included four participants and each were from four different districts in the state of Colorado. The focus group interview took place for 72 minutes at an agreed time per the participants. The facilitation of the focus group was recorded through Zoom. During the discussion, some participants had their cameras on or off or a combination of both (Yin, 2018).

Based on the commonalities between the responses of each participant within this study and the focus group discussion, themes and subthemes emerged to align with the

research question: How SL in Title I Schools develop, influence, and retain Black teachers in their current school site? The results of the findings derived from 2,985 initial codes, 56 categories of patterned and focused coding, 12 themes, and 24 subthemes. Beginning the reading of the findings, Table 6 displays the results of the thematic analysis. Following the thematic table, an explanation of the key concepts of develop, influence, and retention are explained to express the importance of including practices and strategies into school leadership to retain teachers and more so BT.

The three overarching themes about how school leaders in Title I schools develop, influence, and retain Black teachers include: The Impact of Leadership on Developing Black Teachers; Influences that Lead to Black Teacher Success; and Supporting the Retention of Black Teachers. Supporting each theme were three subthemes of the reporting of three groups which include: Group 1 participants who are instructional coaches; Group 2 who are assistant principals, and Group 3 who are principals. Then each group's key points were noted for each subtheme. The subthemes for theme 1 are instructional practices, culturally responsive practices, and leadership practices. The subthemes for theme 2 are internal motivational influences, cultural influential supports, and relational influences. The subthemes for theme 3 are hiring practices, align practices, and equitable supports. Within the subthemes, each groups' recollection of their roles, actions, and perceptions were bulleted.

Table 6*Combined Aligned Themes and Subthemes for Groups 1, 2, and 3*

How School Leaders in Title I Schools Develop, Influence, and Retain Black Teachers in their Current School Site		
Theme 1 Impact of Leadership on Developing Black Teachers	Theme 2 Influences that Lead Black Teachers to Succeed	Theme 3 Supporting the Retention of Black Teachers
Subtheme A: Instructional Practices	Subtheme A: Internal Motivational Influences	Subtheme A: Hiring Practices
Group 1: Instructional Coaches <i>*Individual Coaching</i> <i>*Informal Feedback</i>	Group 1: Instructional Coaches <i>*Background</i> <i>*Commitment</i>	Group 1: Instructional Coaches <i>*Non-responsibility</i>
Group 2: Assistant Principals <i>*Feedback</i> <i>*Formal Observations</i> <i>*Supervision</i>	Group 2: Assistant Principals <i>*Philosophy</i> <i>*Upbringing</i>	Group 2: Assistant Principals <i>*Candidate Characteristics</i>
Group 3: Principals <i>*Brief Check-ins</i> <i>*Managing of Curriculum and Instruction</i> <i>*Managing Evaluation System</i>	Group 3: Principals <i>*Experiences</i> <i>*Philosophy</i>	Group 3: Principals <i>*Equity and Friendly</i>
Subtheme B: Cultural Responsiveness Practices	Subtheme B: Cultural Influential Supports	Subtheme B: Aligned Practices
Group 1: Instructional Coaches <i>*Cultural Relevant Skills</i>	Group 1: Instructional Coaches <i>*Climate and Culture</i> <i>*Race Talk</i>	Group 1: Instructional Coaches <i>*Coaching and Mentoring</i> <i>*Ideal Support System</i>
Group 2: Assistant Principals <i>*Multiple Curriculum Skills</i>	Group 2: Assistant Principals <i>*No Race Problems</i> <i>*Harsh Realities</i>	Group 2: Assistant Principals <i>*Professional Development</i> <i>*Increase in Black Educators</i>
Group 3: Principals <i>*Conscious Awareness</i>	Group 3: Principals <i>*Positive Settings</i> <i>*Race Matching</i>	Group 3: Principals <i>*Mentors and development</i> <i>*Emotional Support</i>
Subtheme C: Leadership Practices	Subtheme C: Relational Influences	Subtheme C: Equitable Supports
Group 1: Instructional Coaches <i>*Self-directed Learning</i> <i>*Perceptions</i>	Group 1: Instructional Coaches <i>*Advising a Graduate</i> <i>*Coaching Teachers</i>	Group 1: Instructional Coaches <i>*Leadership or Mentor</i>
Group 2: Assistant Principals <i>*Individuality</i> <i>*Expectations</i>	Group 2: Assistant Principals <i>*Encouraging a Graduate</i> <i>*Leading Teachers</i>	Group 2: Assistant Principals <i>*Leadership Opportunities</i>
Group 3: Principals <i>*Authenticity</i> <i>*Perceptions</i>	Group 3: Principals <i>*Elevated Professional Growth</i> <i>*Main Priorities</i>	Group 3: Principals <i>*Leadership Opportunities</i>

**Note: These items are a recollection of the assigned Group's actions or concepts that are enacted in their roles.*

Findings

Responses were varied from the 12 participants of this study. The different SL, whether instructional SL, assistant SL, or principal SL of Title I schools, all shared their thoughts on the importance of developing, influencing, and retaining BT. The current study demonstrated that all 12 participants believed there is value in having the presence of BT within their school environment, and each participant shared varied practices and strategies to assist with retaining the BT at their school site. Also, besides responses being recorded from the 12 SL, four of the 12 SL accepted an invitation to join a focus group in order to further volunteer to express their in-depth thoughts about practices of developing, influencing, and retaining BT at their current school site.

Theme 1: Impacting Black Teacher Development

First, developing BT is a critical concept to apply to increase retention in the American schools (Carver-Thomas, 2018). To “develop” is aiming to grow and mature into an experience or grow or mature from an experience which evolves or process a positive and progressive changes within the teaching and learning community (Ingersoll et al., 2019). In these findings, each group of participants shared commonalities of the importance to supporting instructional practices, culturally responsive practices, and leadership practices for BT development.

Subtheme A: Instructional Practices

In Title I schools, effective instructional practices are critical in for the development of BT. In the teaching profession, instruction refers to having a purposeful direction of the learning process along with planning and management in a classroom

setting. The purposeful direction becomes a framework for educational activities, policies, and programmatic approaches to achieve positive changes in students' attitudes or academic behaviors (Gay, 2000; Muhammad, 2018).

Group 1: Instructional Coaches. Individual coaching and informal feedback are essential practices to help BT reach their teaching and learning goals. During each interview, I asked each coach, "What is your primary focus and level of involvement in managing curriculum and instructional programs?" Elizabeth emphasized, "I work heavily with managing the curriculum and instruction component of teaching and learning. So, I work with my school director on making my role's focus area about me coaching all teachers." Helen stated:

My primary focus is planning for daily instructional practices and strategies, gain progress, teaching and delivery, and monitor assessment... and I support all grade levels K-5 at the team level and at the individual teacher level. I also support the Special Ed department, our Specials Teachers, our ELS department teachers, and our Intervention staff with instruction.

Mary shared:

I'm part of a team that overlooks instruction. The team includes instructional leaders which consists of our principal, our assistant principal, and then three leaders who monitor curriculum instruction. My role is called a DCI, which is a director of curriculum instruction. The main functions are to coach and support all teachers instructionally as an individual and as a whole person. This kind of coaching and instruction includes monitoring trends and data. In our school, also

any testing or related things are encompassed in my role along with other partners.

All three coaches' primary focus and level of involvement in managing curriculum and instructional programs is working with and coaching all grade level teachers. Elizabeth and Mary work directly with their principal in supporting and coaching teachers. Hellen did not indicate that her principal provides direction for coaching and supporting teachers. Nevertheless, like Elizabeth and Mary, supporting teachers across multiple grade levels with instruction to improve assessments and learning is essential to her role.

To follow up on their coaching and support of teachers, I asked, "How do you provide feedback to your teachers and more so BT?" Elizabeth responded,

We give lesson plan feedback through email and then we give observational feedback from observing classes." I provide feedback to some teachers more so than others depending on my director's expectations, or the need of the teacher. However, feedback occurs continuously at my school.

Helen explained:

I'd say for all teachers, it's pretty informal for most, unless I'm working directly with teachers in a coaching cycle. What I prefer is to ask the teacher that I'm working with directly, how they prefer to get their feedback in terms of a format. Do you want feedback in an email? Do you want feedback face- to- face? Do you want feedback like a voicemail? Or whatever the case may be. That is how I provide feedback to my teachers.

Mary said:

It depends on, what is the style that you're looking for?" Are you looking for a list of things that you're doing well and one or two things to work on? Are you listening and are you looking for all the pros and cons about your taught lesson? Do you want me to focus on one particular aspect of practice that you would like specific feedback on? So, it really kind of depends on what the teacher is looking for in terms of feedback. I think it's important to tailor it to the individual, so that they actually get out of it what they are wanting to get out of it... and the purpose of providing feedback to the teacher in general is to improve or change practices.

All three coaches provide continuous teacher feedback to improve or make instructional changes. Elizabeth's feedback to teacher depending on her director's expectation. Helen and Mary mentioned how their feedback is tailored to meet the needs and the learning style of the teacher.

Then I asked each coach, "What does success look like for a BT working in your school?" Elizabeth responded:

I think success happens when they need to feel that they have a voice in what we're doing at the school. That they are heard in terms of their opinion that they're able to give feedback, that they are being developed professionally, and that they feel confident about their role and know they are effective.

Helen exclaimed:

I think it has a lot to do with the climate and culture and the building in which you work. I've worked in buildings before where the climate and culture was such that... Anyone couldn't bring their voice, let alone a teacher of color. I've worked

in buildings where we didn't have a deep understanding of equity and race, and because of that, we didn't know we were to be looking out for that. We didn't know there was a perspective that was completely overlooked or even acknowledged... And because of that, success, to me, looks like creating a climate and culture and a space that allows for people to bring their truth, and people to bring their experience and be valued and trusted.

Mary expressed:

Professional growth is success! Success looks like whatever (word whatever ever is enunciated) that teacher want it to be like. I think people get the name what success looks like too many times of what Black teachers have to look like a certain way...or how teaching have to look a certain way in order for it to be deemed as successful or effective.

Two coaches, Elizabeth and Helen both agreed that success is allowing BT to have a voice in what they are doing and what they are thinking. Helen mentioned success for a BT is creating a climate and a culture a space to bring their truth and experience and be valued and trusted. Also, Mary that success for BT is professional growth.

Group 2: Assistant Principal. Supervision, formal observations, and feedback are stands assistant principal adhere to from their principal. Instructional practices are strategies or methods teachers used with their students to gain positive outcomes such as differentiation and cooperative learning (Gay, 2000). While interviewing, I asked Grace, “What's your primary focus and level of involvement in supervising curriculum and instructional programs?” Grace responded, “My primary focus is in supervising the math instruction and the special education instruction of our school.” Jovita said: “My level of

involvement in curriculum and instruction is supportive, but my principal leads, and I follow her lead, and then I help build all the supports she wants in place to build her system.” Septima’s shared: “The primary focus is with managing and making sure that we are utilizing curriculum and programs that are... I don't want to say appropriate, but effective for our students, according to the data that we're utilizing.” All three assistant principals are involved in curriculum and instruction. The primary focus involving curriculum and instruction includes Grace managing the math and special education curriculum. Jovita is involved in being supportive in curriculum and instruction as her principal takes the lead. Septima is involved in curriculum and instruction in managing curriculum and programs.

There are various methods of providing teacher feedback to assist with teacher growth. I asked each assistant principal, what are the particular strategies you use to provide feedback to teachers, and more so Black teachers, to help them improve and their teaching practices?” Grace shared:

I only supervise one African-American teacher, and honestly, he was someone who had graduated from Castle Hill, so he had great relationships with the students. The focus for him was not necessarily on the sense of community. It was on improving his ability to teach higher level math at the time, simply because we lacked a number of students that were joining things like AP courses.

Jovita shared:

Well, I do provide feedback... for our probationary teachers, which both of our Black teachers are probationary only because one of them was new to Southlands and didn't have her professional teaching record. I do a total of eight informal,

two formal, and then the final summative. So, all feedback happens with them after each walkthrough or observation. Also, I make sure that I give them feedback that is consistent with our PD, with what the expectations are. So, we had to develop a feedback form that incorporated all of that, and we need to make sure that everybody is on the same page, and everybody's getting the same information.

Septima shared:

My biggest piece is giving feedback that is actionable and relates to their specific content or practice they were engaging in. I believe in giving targeted feedback that supports the teachers in their academic focus or in their professional goal, or their personal goal they're developing.

All three assistant principals provide feedback to BT in reference to instruction. Grace intentionally supervises a Black male teacher gain math competency. Jovita provides her probationary BT teachers consistent feedback after each walk-through observation, and semester formal observation every semester. Septima gives targeted feedback that supports the teachers in their academic focus or in their professional goal.

During the interviews, I explored how instructional practices connect with teacher success, I asked each assistant principal, "What does success look like for a Black teacher working in a predominantly white profession?" Grace shared,

The person I mentioned earlier, I think he thrives more when the focus is on cultural competency to build relationships and just equity in instruction. When our leadership changed, things completely were different. And I could tell this Black

male teacher is not happy. I think I realized that it was the first time he might be looking elsewhere.

I interrupted with, “As far as another job?” Grace responded, “Yeah, and it's in a different school where there are more Black educators.” Then I said, “Okay, you have any idea on why he probably wanted to work somewhere else with more... black educators?” Grace also said:

I think it has to do with the support that he isn't receiving, honestly... from administration. It had nothing to do with the students. It had everything to do with the fact that there isn't a focus on cultural competency anymore. Don't get me wrong! He's still works here right now. He enjoys working with his math team. I was curious, so I asked, “Okay, how many years he's been there?” Grace said, “He's been there a long time. He's been here probably six, seven years now.

Jovita shared:

Well, success for a Black teacher working with us is basically that they have extra access to all things, whether it's training, whether it's feedback, whether it's observation. We make sure that they're involved in professional development, and that they know how to process what they learned. So, my principal and I do all of those things to make sure that all of our teachers can be successful.

Septima expressed:

In my perception, success looks like the BT is being able to operate from their characteristic, and from their expertise. They are included, and their voice is heard. They are not just there because a Black number needs to be filled, but they're there because they actually have the expertise and the accountability of the

teaching field to physically be infused throughout the school community. And they are infused because they have the know-how, the knowledge, and the skillset to thrive. And they are part of the team. That speaks success to me!

All three assistant principals perceive success for a BT working in a White teaching profession differently. Grace expressed success is when a BT is given the opportunity to teach in a culturally responsive setting. Jovita express success is when a BT having access to training, feedback to make sure they are learning. Septima expressed success is when a BT is able to express their opinion and operate from their own expertise and use their voice without being seen as angry or aggressive.

Group 3: Principals. Effectively managed evaluation system and curriculum and instruction system include brief check-ins. I asked all six principals, “What is your primary role of focus regarding curriculum and instruction? Charlotte stated, “It's always content, but this year my assistant principal and I are improving student engagement. Edward responded, “Well according to the national experts, I'm supposed to be the instructional leader. So that is my top priority. However, I share our school’s instructional accountability with my assistant principals, department chairs, and instructional coaches.” Eleanor shared:

I am definitely the person that's ultimately in charge of curriculum and instruction. This year for the first time, I have a number two who is not quite ready to be a number two across all school functions, but really loves instruction. So, I would actually say that I am responsible for many of the decisions of application, changes, and curriculum.

Fanny stated:

I am heavily involved in managing curriculum. My biggest love is reading...I love to see children joyfully reading their books. So, anything we do, we do it as a team, the building, and with fidelity and alignment. I like for everyone to be on the same page.

Horace said:

I managed a little bit of everything, but the assistant principals are more aligned with the grade level curricula. Then I support all content areas across the grade levels and specifically with special education. I will support wherever I am needed.

Richard shared:

My primary focus is to ensure that we have quality curriculum and program offerings that prepare students to be college and career ready by the time they graduate from high school, as well as accelerate their learning opportunities in various ways.

All six principals' primary focus is curriculum and instruction, alongside their assistant principal or instructional support team. However, Eleanor, Fanny, and Horace have taken on a more direct role in the actual involvement of the management of curriculum.

Charlotte, Edward, and Richard support the management of curriculum.

During each principal's interview, I asked, "What ways do you provide feedback to your teachers, and more so BT?" Charlotte said:

Our district require spot classroom walkthrough observations and share my feedback of the walkthroughs through email using a specific form. If I do not

have a concern, I required the teacher to signoff with their signature so that I know that it was read. However, I always share what was effective. Then, I give an example of how that suggestion can be implemented. But, interesting enough, I do have one Black teacher who truly needs face to face feedback, and I am learning that I need to do give more in-person feedback with all teachers.

Edward shared:

So, across the board, pretty much daily, we are required to go into the classrooms and do what is called spot observations which is a part of the evaluation system for our district. When we are doing spot observations, we gently walk into a classroom, and quickly observe the behaviors around the objective, the standard alignment, and also some of the engagement practices that are going on in the classroom. At the same time, I am also observing culturally responsive practices among the teacher and students' interaction.

Edward continued:

We do equity audits for Black teachers in particular. It was very similar to what we do with demand, but not with Whites. We make sure we give that feedback to the teacher immediately. Sometimes our feedback would be one on one after a spot observation, or it can be right there on the spot while having a private conversation with a black staff member that might be struggling. In this relationship, the teacher knows that I was trying to develop them. So, I would actually have a conversation with them about leadership opportunities, because we want to see more Black teachers move into leadership. So, I would start to

develop them if they were interested in their instructional leadership, and then into cultural leadership.

Eleanor's shared:

I think at a fundamental level, our feedback to all teachers is very similar. However, I have made it my number one priority since I've been a director to diversify my team and particularly to racially diversify my team of staff members. And in doing so, I also make a commitment to keep my teachers of color year over year in the classroom with our kids wherever possible. And so, it is very important to me that the application of those shared practices around coaching and feedback are working for our teachers of color and definitely for our Black teachers in particular." so, we do weekly coaching which involves, depending on where the teacher is and what they need, anything from an ops feedback session to looking at lesson plans and looking ahead to a data meeting. We try to be generally aligned as an instruction team on the things that we're focusing on, but what component of those things any teacher is working on, and any given time is really specific to their practice and their place in the grander scheme of things.

Fanny shared:

Our district requires us to conduct at least two formal observations per year for probationary teachers, and one formal observation once a year for experience teachers of four years or more. However, I provide feedback to my staff any time I deem necessary, whether it is being formal or informal. My goal is student achievement. Also, if the feedback is not directly from me, then it will come from my assistant principal or one of my coaches.

Horace explained:

We do we have three official evaluations a year. But we also provide weekly or biweekly coaching, which involves visiting the classroom, observing, and then providing a one on one feedback to those teachers. And this is for all teachers across the school. So, the black teachers would be included in that. And whether it's weekly or biweekly is determined based on their level of expertise, their comfort in their own request. So, some teachers want to have it every week, and some teachers want to have it every other week. If they're brand new teachers, we tend to do it more regularly as well or try and push them to do it more regularly.” Also included in the feedback are that tie around culturally responsiveness. And then part of our feedback to our teachers is directly about that cultural responsiveness, and how well they are allowing space for their children to be welcome and to be seen in the school environments.

Richard remarked:

Oh, that's an interesting question, because now that I am thinking about it, I don't necessarily evaluate any of our black teachers. But the feedback is through regular teaching or observation of feedback cycles that's usually required by the state as well as our district's master agreement. So, meeting the X number of observations per year, while also monitoring the goals and professional outcomes that teachers are required to complete at the beginning of the year as a part of their annual evaluation. As far as Black teachers, the way I support and provide feedback to them, especially the ones that I'm not their direct supervisor or evaluator is I go around and have touch points with them, I make sure that I observed.

The he stated,

If not an entire class or part of a class, or at least a portion of it. I try to observe and see them in action, and then just give them brief qualitative feedback. Then, I just let them know that I see them, and I appreciate the work they're doing, as well as any feedback and opportunities for improvement on what I observed.

All six principals provide feedback to all of their teachers as expected by the state requirements and their district's requirements. All six principals provide in-person brief feedback. Edward's feedback includes equity audits and on-the-spot feedback, Eleanor does opt-sessions, weekly coaching, lesson planning, and data meetings. Fanny provides additional feedback when deemed necessary. Horace's feedback is dependent of the comfort-level and expertise of the teacher, while observing for culturally responsiveness. Richard currently does not evaluate any BT but visits the classroom and does brief check-ins.

I asked each principal to share their perception on "What does success look like for a BT in a predominately White profession? Charlotte described:

Strong relationships... one example of success is when I am out and about after school or before school. I am getting compliments, not about me per say, but about a particular teacher. It is when parents coming in the school, and during the last two weeks of school, they are requesting a particular teacher for their child's placement in that teacher's room for the next school year. Usually, the request is one of my Black teachers. It is student achievement that is happening in those Black teachers' classrooms, and that is what the parents want for their child - their child happy and achieving.

Edward's included:

Well, the success must be consistent with the success of everyone else. We all are going to start at the same place, but also success means that I as the leader have to recognize that my person has a unique skill set because they're going to bring something that everyone else does not have. "For instance, the research shows that black teachers tend to show up already culturally relevant and are able to connect with pretty much all the children in the classroom. That's the research. People may not want to hear that, but that's the absolute truth.

Edward continued:

So, I know that I have a black teacher who is building rapport with students, and this teacher has respect for the students and the community, I'm going to see if this person is willing to sponsor a boys' group, or girls' group. Are you willing to meet professional development to help our staff begin to develop their relationships with students as well, like you do? Are you willing to lead us in culturally and relevant ways for success? For me, that is a nontraditional teaching.

He continued:

And given that person a platform, especially if they're the only one Black teacher, we can make sure that as the leader, I'm creating a moment for that person and showing the rest of the staff that this person out here had been talking about this as a part of the community. And that means sometimes I need to advocate and be an ally for this person, and even push them beyond their comfort level. We will have some staff of color who don't feel confident and competent enough, especially in an all-white environment. We are socially constructed to believe we

are less, and that's what's called stereotype threat. So, it would be very important for me to name stereotype threat when it happens and help that person to overcome it with me. So therefore, I use that as a personal transition.

Eleanor shared:

Success for a Black teacher is when there is an open up space for them to define what success looks like for themselves, and not expect them to come in and sit a mold that I'm looking. Success is having fantastic student data and participating in the school community doing things that are enjoyable to your interest. In our network, a successful person can be what we call our "Flower Man", which means to be our spreader of joy and bringer together. Success is being a staple on our campus. Success is also being honored in our system, and our team needs to be open to what that looks like for folks. Success is allowing people to drive their own learning and development.

Fanny expressed:

Oh, gosh! Success to me, when BT are able to look like they're able to show up as their authentic selves. They're not silenced, and they are able to speak their truth when it's necessary. They're able to advocate for kids in the same way that a White teacher would advocate for kids. They can also use curriculum, resources, and materials that would support developing the identity and the critical consciousness of the students that are in front of them. That success to me!

Horace stated:

You know, I just I think that it looks like that teacher feeling honored and seen and heard and respected in a way that that, you know, I think the dominant culture of schooling might not see them or might not honor them.

Richard shared:

Success for a Black teacher is showing up each and every day, finding authentic ways to sustain themselves while also being highly effective in the job. And by that, I mean respected by colleagues as well as by the students that they serve.

All six principals described what success looks like for a BT in a White profession.

Charlotte stressed strong relationships. Edward described consistency of success with everyone else, and the ability to be culturally responsiveness to develop students and teachers. Eleanor, Fanny, Horace, and Richard described success is allowing a BT to be honored and drive their own learning and development while speaking their truth.

Subtheme B: Culture Responsive Practices

Culture Responsiveness is a mindset of being competent and having an awareness of one's own cultural identity and views about difference. One who has a culturally responsive mindset has the ability to learn and build on the varying cultural and community norms of students and their families (Gay, 2000). The specific mindset can manifest in formal and informal conversations, interactions among a group of people, and through policies to achieve positive student outcomes.

Group 1: Instructional Coaches. Culturally relevant skills include high student engagement. BT are field-dependent learners which leads to an in depth understanding of SOC wanting stimulated learning about the world which they live (Gay, 2010). Therefore,

I deemed it necessary to ask each coach, “How do you enhance practices of culturally responsive teaching?” Elizabeth responded,

Well, we try to make sure that each teacher gets an equal amount of attention and support. Some teachers might need more based on their need. And then we try to make sure that we respond to the teachers’ development based on data. And really, through observations so that our teachers feel like the feedback and support they're getting is relevant.

Helen responded:

I will tell you that it is a part of my everyday conversation when I'm talking to teachers about the way they're planning for instruction, and the way they're delivering content and material. We talk a lot about what does engagement look like in this particular space with this particular group of kids, with this particular content, concept, or skill. What does relevance look like and the wonderful thing about? It is about what kind of climate and culture in which I work, people are willing to be open-minded and to listen and to take risks.

Mary expressed:

I think more so through the coaching conversations about, “Where are the students represented in your content? Then, “Where are other cultures represented in the continent?” “How are you exposing them to other cultures, so they can develop an appreciation for different kinds of diverse groups?” So just making sure that we are super aware of all of those pieces, not just thinking about culture from a Black, White, Latinx standpoint, but across the board, and ...what it means around my work, and around cultural responsiveness in the classroom.

All three coaches' school sites enhance culturally responsive learning. Elizabeth's idea of enhancing practices of culturally responsive teaching is providing equal amount of time to develop BT based on their data and through classroom observations. Helen and Mary keep student diversity in the forefront of their minds. Helen and Mary enhance culturally responsive teaching practices through coaching conversations about their planning, content, delivery, and engagement.

Group 2: Assistant Principal. Multiple curriculum skills used by teachers are evident in assistant principal observations. During each assistant principal's the interview, instructional practices was still being questioned. The Assistant Principal SL were asked, "How do you enhance practices of culturally responsive teaching?" Grace shared:

So, I for the Black male teacher I am supervising, I wanted him to have some leadership opportunities, and to be able to eventually train and work with our staff. But I don't think that administration was his focus at the time. And so, it wasn't something that was going to be allowed, all truthfulness. Then it became more of him sponsoring clubs or meeting with students, like student unions and stuff like that instead.

Jovita's expressed:

Well, for example, this year I lead a diversity group, and we meet once a month to develop a calendar of activities like Women's Month, Black History Month, and Hispanic month. So, we did all main events for these different months that focused around diversity and culture. And then, my principal and I have all K-5 teachers to incorporate books and activities either during writing time or their

community time to go over a cultural book with the kids and connect it an activity.

Septima shared:

I think it's very important that teachers take those opportunities to get to know their students, not just from a personal level, but from a knowledge level. So, thinking outside of the box, and I say that the same way that I responded in how we're responding. We are gaining an understanding of the students in our classrooms, their backgrounds, their history and how that affects their learning environment. The teacher has to understand that curriculum is developed in one way. Activities are developed in one way. There has not been a sit down and it seems like it, but there's not a sit down of, "Let's look at all these different ways in all these different experiences or the lack of experiences that our students bring to the table. Next, together, let's develop the curriculum to meet our students' needs.

Each of the three assistant principals perceive culturally responsive teaching practices differently Grace disappointment aligned to limitation of BT leadership opportunities of adult learning and restricted on to having exposure of student leadership. Jovita developed a diversity group and co-plans monthly activities for campus wide cultural student activities. Septima have sit-downs to organize curriculum planning with her teachers to meet the needs of their students.

Group 3: Principals. Professional development on conscious awareness address biases that occur in the classroom. I asked each principal "How do you enhance practices of culturally responsive teaching?" Charlotte explained:

When I think of culturally responsive teaching, I have to say, unfortunately, it's not so much my Black teachers who need that support, it's my White ... teachers, even my Hispanic teachers. When we think of culture, I think of culturally responsive. I'm thinking, again knowing your audience. We've done some book studies on poverty. I've pulled articles from different urban journals that I can draw on about being culturally responsive. I facilitated studies on about - how to deal with the unique needs in your classroom. So, it's kind of sometimes, I have to educate teachers a little deeper than only about student achievement. We have to kind of look at where the students are coming from, and some other barriers that might be stopping the student from being a reader. So, it's actually educating them about their students' culture.

Edward explained:

Well, first, I have to be glad I made it myself. I have to make sure I'm a working definition. I'm talking about a fork, so I have to make sure that I know the research, and all the experts who do this. So that way, when I start to bring this to staff members who are really proud of some of this practice, we can become proud of what we have done and then apply it to the work that we're doing. The key is not to bring in instructional practices. Responsiveness and relevance is not a strategy. It is a mindset. So, we have to make sure that we take a curriculum that exists as it is and juxtapose a response from road construction to where we're delivering the curriculum in a culturally responsive and relevant way that connect to our students' experiences and who they students are.

Eleanor expressed:

Besides myself, I have Black teachers and Latina teachers who have adopted the mindset of enhancing culturally responsive teaching among themselves and with others. They're pushing themselves to think about what texts we are putting in front of kids. And then I think at an obviously very overly simplified level, I think a lot of the rest of culturally responsive teaching is about pushing for staff self-awareness for understanding how they show up, and who they are... impacts how they're experienced. It impacts how I train and support teachers, and how my leaders train and support teachers around engaging with kids, around giving room for student voice. Everything about our school is based around a restorative community. So that's another way that we are raising consciousness. And they've been going through a series of empathy interviews being able to sit in the discomfort of knowing you just can't ever share that with your kids if you're a White teacher. There's this very different approach to how we talk to each other and connect on a human level. And if you're not willing to trust that I can listen to you, and that you can talk to me directly, then I don't have a lot of respect for you.

Fanny explained:

Enhancing culturally responsive practices is what I do in every single aspect of what we do as a school community. We enhance our culturally responsive mindsets through a partnership with an equity consulting firm. This allows us to do racial consciousness training with the entire staff and not just small pockets of teachers. And so that training has gone across the building and through that training, we've actually done some work on public narratives. Also, through that

work, we have created a re-entry plan. We actually have created a new educational system for our students that actually oversees and protects and supports the social emotional learning of our students. Another thing that we do is: We make sure that we have an equity team that can absorb some of the implicit bias the Black teachers are dealing with. Any sort of concerns that we have in terms of racism and white supremacy practices and policies that are in the school. We can kind of disrupt those issues and analyze challenges through our equity team. And then we attach ourselves and align ourselves with curricular pieces that actually honor the lived experiences of our students. So, it's multifaceted. It's not just one approach we use to address that need. The need is really multifaceted where there are many different things that address it in a very comprehensive way.

Horace shared:

Certainly, we talk about it explicitly. Our school culture includes ways of having kids think about and talk about themselves and who they are. And we try and do a lot of representation of the various cultures. So, we talk about cultures and cultural backgrounds in the ways that that we come into school with ways that we do things differently at home. You know, some of our families, there's two parents who are both women and they're both men. In some families, there's only one parent, or so we allow space for students to talk about these matters. So, we create a culturally responsive environment. And then part of our feedback to our teachers is directly about that cultural responsiveness and how well they are allowing space for their children to be welcome and to be seen in the school environment. Then I think also we do professional development explicitly about culturally

responsive teaching. So, we try and define what those are and what they look like. We continue to work and learn together, and we give space for our teachers to present what their practices are. We also have external experts, whether that's through a book or a curriculum or something.

Richard shared:

We try to have fun and celebrate everything as best as possible. When people are doing great things in their classrooms, we try to celebrate it, when people have birthdays, we try to celebrate it. So, I think fostering a sense of belonging is how we do that.

Five principals explained how they practices of culturally responsive teaching at their school. Charlotte includes facilitated book studies on dealing with unique classroom needs. Edward himself is a working definition to apply his studied research to shift mindsets to connect to our students' experiences. Eleanor, Fanny, and Horace support culturally responsiveness awareness development and practices for all staff. Richard supports having fun and celebrating successes to foster a sense of belonging.

Subtheme C: Leadership Practices

In education, culturally responsive SL develop BT to become leaders whether being a lead teacher, a leader of a program, or an administration leader. Ideally, SL provide BT opportunities to lead others whether being students or adults at their fullest potential to maximize the success of the school community (Khalifa, 2018). Culturally Responsive Leadership is a way of transforming Title I schools.

Group 1: Instructional Coaches. Leadership practices promote perceptions that question whether a BT is ready to take own a leadership role. This may vary among SL.

However, as coaches invest in self-directed learning, they may also share the importance of this practice with BT. I asked each coach, “How did you develop your leadership style? Elizabeth said, “When I decided to teach, it was a second calling for me. So, I was really determined to do well. In most schools where I worked... not only race, but also a religious minority.” Elizabeth continued:

And through that, I sort of decided that I needed to just constantly prove myself and make sure that I was doing the best job I could possibly do. And I think I just also have a passion for making sure that everything that I do for kids is done at the very best level... because it's essentially when it comes down to it, even if I'm supporting teachers, we're doing it for the students. When it comes down to it, the students, they are always in the forefront of my mind in terms of every initiative or policy that we decide to do at our school.

Helen stated:

So, it is like we're in the trenches together, we're doing the work together. We all just serve a little different in roles that help get students to a successful place. So, when I think about how I extend that to the black teachers that I serve alongside...again, just being that open and honest and transparent person that I am.

Helen said:

I developed my leadership style through self-learning. Like, I think about my first year at my school, I just really observed, listened, and tried to take in all of it, so I could understand the dynamics of a team and understand the climate and culture

of our building. Then as I started to really build those relationships with teacher teams, with individual teachers, with the committees that I serve.

Mary shouted:

Trial and error! I would say more so, like just living! I think I embarked on this journey of like being a life coach a couple of years back. So, I took this curriculum, and their focus is connected to like one of their main tenets is like you are naturally creative, resourceful and whole. That mindset that a person doesn't need me to fix them. They already have all that they need within them like that helped develop my coaching philosophy as well.

All three coaches' leadership style developed differently. Elizabeth developed her leader style to her commitment being called to an educator for passion for the kids. Helen and Mary developed their leadership style by being a self-director learner.

During the interviews, I asked each coach, "How do BT view your leadership?"

Elizabeth said, "I am not sure, I haven't heard anything about my leadership." Helen shared:

First of all, I don't in terms consider myself a part of leadership, I have very much tried to distance myself from being part of the admin team. Yes, I am part of the admin team because I deal with some administrative things like testing. But I am not part of the admin team in terms of like evaluation and budget and, you know, all of that kind of stuff. Therefore, I feel as though I have a closer relationship with teachers than admin. With that said, I allow myself to always just being open, being transparent, truthful, but helpful, and I think others see me the same way as I do.

Mary said, “I am not sure, but for me, it is important that I help them navigate through our school system.” All three coaches’ viewpoint on leadership are similar. Leadership practices are viewed as administrative versus coaching. Elizabeth and Mary both are not sure how BT perceive their leadership. Helen does not view herself as a part of the leadership team, so she may have closer relationships with teacher as she thinks they see her as open, transparent, and truthful.

Group 2: Assistant Principals. Leadership practices drive expectations are set and monitored through assistant principals from their principal. However, some assistant principals are able to show individuality through the work project that may create. During each assistant principal interview, I asked the question, “Describe your leadership style?” Grace said:

I am a leader who is hardworking, dedicated, and love my job. I am in it for the kids, and I will do whatever it take to complete my job. Most teachers would say that I am a very busy and serous person, but kind.

Jovita said:

I am the type of leader who will do what I say that I will do. I am hardworking, and I love the people that I work with. I value people for who they are, and I treat people the way I would want to be treated which is with dignity and respect.

Septima shared:

My leadership style came through experience and time, reading, and having mentors. One important thing about me that is I don't like to water things down. So, with that being said, it motivates me to provide structure and support, and not just at this higher level ... because I have a master's degree or because I have the

knowledge. But because when knowledge is given in a loving and caring manner, it is received and then it is built upon. But with a growth mindset of we're going to move beyond this matter, because of how we completed the structure. And because my goal is to teach you how to fish, so you can go back and do it again, and I am not to constantly hold your hand or not hold you accountable.

All three assistant principal leadership style varies. Grace and Jovita are hard workers.

Septima is a transparent leader who provide a caring and structured environment.

Leadership behaviors shape the climate and culture of a school. During the assistant principal interviews, I asked, "How do BT view your leadership?" Grace shared:

I know that my beliefs are that students, all students should be expected to have great opportunities to learn from great teachers, who are willing to go the extra mile, which means that I too, have to do the same thing. I feel like I have a high expectation of our staff, but in that it's only because then I know the outcome for students.

Jovita shared:

I think they call me the queen of follow through and follow up. I know that our teachers count on me! I know that our students count on me! I know that if they need something that they can come in at any time, that when I say I have an open door policy....I think ... that my own personal commitment to that staff and Black teachers and their ability to trust in me, to confide in me, to feel like they can come to me about anything and it wouldn't impact our relationship ... is maybe why they... I don't know, but I had been voted me assistant principal of the year twice!

Septima expressed:

My expectations don't change, for Black teachers or otherwise. My expectations for a teacher or my expectations ... they're high, and I expect all of them to meet those expectations. What I expect from Black teachers, I will say this is, to break the rule, the status quo or the stereotype. I don't want them to be viewed as, "Oh, they're here because they're Black." I want them to be viewed because they are here, because they have the skillset, and because they love teaching...And because they love children. And because they're going to do what's best for their educational environments. One thing that I often impart is, don't give people, students, colleagues, that vision, that they see from a streamlined television show, or from that one piece that they saw, and that's how they sit everyone who is Black.

All three assistant principals shared their thoughts on how BT view their leadership. Grace stressed that her focus is about the students. Septima and Grace have high non-changing expectations and everyone knows it. Jovita is known to be the queen of follow-up and follow-through while being crowned as the assistant principal of the year.

During the interviews, I asked each assistant principal no how do BT perceive their leadership and how did they gain BT commitment. Grace shared:

Sure, I feel like one of the things that teachers have always shared with me is that I'm very visible. I will always come and say hello and talk with them. I value what their opinion is. As for teachers of color, no different than me visiting everyone else. Maybe that's just my philosophy in getting around to classrooms or

getting around to seeing our staff. I feel like that relationship building, that sense of community.

Jovita expressed:

In my opinion, I've always thought that it is just the way I practice it. Whether it's your teachers or other staff, if you show appreciation to people for even the little things, they do ... and if you notice them and thank people for that ... and if you keep that humble heart about you, people will work beyond your expectations. They will be loyal to you beyond your expectations. If they know that you appreciate them and that you are loyal to helping them ... and you are true to helping them, they'll be loyal back to you and go beyond what you need. That's what I think, and that's the kind of leader I try to be! And I try to tell people, I try to notice the little things, even if I have to give feedback that may not be comfortable. I try to sandwich it with a lot of, "But I appreciate this... And I see you doing that... And this is really helpful because ... and maybe you didn't think about this ...but it's really helpful.

Septima made this statement before sharing, "Be open, be willing, hold your standards, but keep those expectations!" Then Septima said:

You keep the expectations, you model them, and then you give us the resources and tools to walk that talk. So, I am very big on doing what I say, and say what I'm going to do and be very purposeful and intentional. If I'm asking the teacher to do something, I'm going to be able to do it. I'm going to be able to model it. I'm going to be able to show them. And I've always in my leadership style, being able to hold those expectations, acknowledge when I'm wrong, acknowledge it didn't

go correctly, but being willing to learn, listen, and hear. And that's been a big influence on my modeled behavior for Black teachers.

All three assistant principals were able to share how they gain commitment from the BT at their school site. Grace believes being visible to the teachers and the students. Jovita shows people that appreciate them and she acknowledges them for who they are. Septima believes to be open, be willing, hold your standards, but keep your expectations and model those behaviors for your Black teachers.

Group 3: Principal. Leadership practices vary but may allow BT to show their authenticity and gain the perception they are a part of the school team. I asked each principal to describe his/her leadership style. Charlotte shared:

Working through engagements, I honestly believe that I just always keep my faith. So, I was throughout before becoming a leader, I was a substitute. I've been a teacher's aide, and I've been a primary teacher, middle school, and an intermediate teacher. And my leadership style is always remembering even when I am like ... oh, my goodness! You know, and I pull back, and I put my feet in that teacher's shoes, and I figure it out. So, it is always remembering where you've been. You know, within education, and so I feel I am blessed to have been in all of those shoes...that many Black teachers have experienced.

Edward voiced:

Dedicated community, lifelong learning to pursuit excellence and every endeavor.” This is my school’s mission. To be social justice oriented, means you have to provide aid to agency ... an opportunity for people to be all they can be. That means you take your hands off and allow people to “pray.” “So, my

leadership style is not so much a delegating style. Yes, I can delegate, but my leadership style is more so very autonomous. I trust the people to do what I hired them to do. I delegate, but I also sit down, and I lead with a lot of vision, a lot of conviction; but my team gives me feedback and they guide me.

Eleanor shared:

I am a leader who is super extroverted in the workspace. I love getting involve with the students and the staff with everything that is happening in our school. This brings me energy, and I feel connected. I loved them hard, and they loved me hard. And I think fundamentally that I really love people and each human deserves to have that opportunity. I protect my staff and I lead with my heart while making sure that kids have positive outcomes in meaningful ways.

Fanny expressed:

My leadership style allows me to be my authentic self. I am able to lead while not being on egg shells. The teachers in my school can trust me to speak up, follow through, and deliver on my words. The students are my first priority, and my love is to see children engaged in reading. I enjoy working with a team that supports structure, but at the same time enjoy celebrating.

Horace said:

I think myself, who I am being a trusting person matches with my personality. I'm not a detail-oriented person all the time, so to really sweat someone else on the details do not make sense if I wasn't going to sweat all those details myself. So, you know, that's where that trust fills in." I think I saw and I worked with leaders who did that, and I worked with leaders who didn't do that. I felt a lot better to be

with leaders who trusted the people around them to do their work, and I hire people who I trust will get the job done.

Richard said:

It's my personality. I am pretty calm, laidback, poised, but serious. You know, I always try to not only lead with my heart but lead with my mind as well. I'm always reading, trying to find new things that research says we should be doing, or researching information that will improve and enhance the things that we're currently doing.

All six principals describe their unique leadership style. Charlotte and Edward's leadership style is faith based. Edward and Howard autonomous leadership style allows them to trust the people to they hired to do their jobs. Eleanor's and Richard's leadership style is centered on the heart. Fanny's change agency leadership style allows her to be her authentic self.

Leadership style are the behaviors enacted within a role. I asked all six principals, "How do BT perceive your leadership?" Charlotte shared:

I have to walk ... Oh, goodness, Karen, I have to walk a fine line, because if I were east or southeast, you know, somewhere where there were just kind of half in half. But again, I do have a few more people of color on the staff who are not teachers. So, I really have to catch myself and ensure that I'm very professional, but purposeful when I lead the Black teachers. My Black teachers think very highly of me. I am like a mother figure, mentor, or advisor to them. One of those black teachers also attends church with me, and there's a personal connection. My Black teacher struggles with dyslexia, but I gave him a chance. So, he feels, oh,

my goodness, this lady gave me a chance! She hired me. So, I want to still hold them all to the same standard as my White teachers.

Edward expressed:

What I've heard is that they say I lead with passion. I tell it like it is, but they like the fact that I'm willing to get dirty with them. That I know what I'm talking about. Like, I never talk about stuff unless I've done the research. And I can usually share with them what the research is, and I can point them right to research. And they like the fact that I'm always trying to get them to be better. And I showed them that I always better myself. I'm always reading something. I'm writing something. They love the way I dress. They know that I wear a suit every day. I enjoy my job and that I love the kids. They know that, too, that I just love kids!

Eleanor shared:

In general, my BT would say that ... you're my people, you're my family, and to the point, you can't leave her school. Eleanor is totally committed to our success and she will give blood, sweat, and tears for us. She is there for your ups and downs in your life.

Fanny shared:

I believe my BT view me as competent, hardworking, caring, and supportive. She is very approachable but assertive about structures and students' learning. Ms. Fanny does have high expectations, but she will help you meet her expectations. She accepts us for who we are, and she will advocate for us as long as we are

meeting the expectations of increasing student achievement and growing as learners.

Horace shared:

For the most part, I think the BT at my school perceive my leadership to be supportive. They may think that I am caring and open to all people regardless of whether they are an adult or student, Black, White, Latinx, Asian, or any race. He is open and easy to talk to, and he is fair. They would also think that I enjoy learning and interacting with the kids.

Richard shared:

I don't want to say everyone likes me because everyone doesn't like the principal, and no principal is liked by everyone. But I would say that people think that I'm approachable. So, if anyone ever needs anything, they know they can come and ask for help. You know, if I see my black teachers need help at my school, I'll come and talk to them, and I'm encouraging, and I'm always thanking people for what they do.

All six principals shared how they thought their BT perceive their leadership. Charlotte's BT see her as a mother figure, mentor, or advisor. Edward heard they view him as a passionate researcher who loves his job and the kids, while willing to get dirty. Eleanor thinks her BT view her as a committed family member who is there for your ups and downs. Fanny, Horace, and Richard think their BT view them as approachable.

I asked each principal, "How do you gain commitment from BT?" Charlotte shared:

I gain commitment from BT by being who I am ...a Black woman. I genuinely show my Black teachers that I care about their careers. I encourage them to learn all they can, and I will send them to another school to learn, or have a teacher come over here to train them. When I think they are safe teaching and working with their students, I offer them leadership opportunities. However, I do expect for them to beyond the basic expectations that are set for any teacher.

Edward expressed:

By being Black! Being authentically ... a fully black leader. If I am not authentic and fully Black, then Black teachers can't be authentic and fully Black. If, I'm not showing up one hundred percent, maybe they can show one hundred percent down.

Eleanor shared:

I'd love to hear my Black teachers answer this question. I mean, I've gained commitment by committing to them. I think people commit where they're committed to. I mean, it's sort of a joke, but like not really a joke that once your mine... you're mine! I commit to them, and they commit back to me because I love the people I am committed to.

Fanny shared:

I would like to hope that I gained commitment from my Black teachers as they commit to the love of the students learning. I intentionally take the time every day to invest in my BT to ensure they are getting what they need in the same way that I make sure the students at my school are getting what they need.

Horace shared:

Yeah, I haven't thought about are they committed to me. I just want them to be committed to their jobs. I mean, I think that I just allow them to be who they are. It allows them to bring themselves into the building. I don't expect them to be like me in any way. I expect them to look to the mission and vision of the school and to figure out what that means and how they express that in their own instruction, which I think is important because obviously, my experience of the world is different than theirs.

Richard said:

But at the end of the day, commitment is about... showing up and doing your job, I don't think anyone is committed to me. Because I am not the institution, I am an employee within the system, and in any institution, just like they are to do their job. So, I think it's my job to steer the ship directorship. But I didn't build the ship, and it's not my ship, I don't own it, and I don't own the rights to it. I am definitely just manning the ship and guiding its crew, per say.

Three of the six principals feel as though they have gained BT commitment. Horace and Richard believe commitment lies in doing a good job and being who you are, and not people. Charlotte, Edward, Eleanor gained commitment by being themselves through genuinely caring. Fanny hopes that she has gained BT commitment to ensure that they are getting what they need.

Theme 2: Influencing Black Teachers to Succeed

Influencing BT in a white teaching environment starts with leadership (Goings et al., 2018). The concept of “influence” is to assist with increasing teacher retention. In the

teaching profession, influence is a great motivation that affect or change someone or something in an indirect but usually important way (Cannata & Curran, 2018). However, to influence others, mean to start with self-motivation.

Subtheme A: Internal Motivational Influences

Motivation can occur internally and externally. It is a force that accounts for the arousal, selection, direction, and continuation of behavior. When BT are progressing to meet their teaching and learning goals, a motivation from others can impact the of teacher retention. This study reports the internal motivation that drive SL of Title I schools to support BT (Northouse, 2019).

Group 1: Instructional Coaches. Motivation varies based on a SL background experiences, and their commitment to their role. While interviewing, I asked, “What is your leadership philosophy?” Elizabeth shared, “My follows are the network’s core values”. Helen said, “Always believe in yourself because no one else will.” Mary shared, “I follow the core values of my network.” A philosophy can mold a leader’s character. Elizabeth and Mary’s philosophy is the core values of their network. Mary’s philosophy is to “always believe in yourself because no one else will.”

While interviewing, I asked, “What motivates you to work in a Title I school.” Elizabeth shared:

I think I'm motivated by our mission to close gaps. So, I find that the shared vision and mission among the staff to close gaps between students of color, students of multilingual learners, and sped students. There's a real desire to get students to and through college is really inspiring... And it creates a staff culture that is very invigorating and exciting to work at. So, it feels every day like we're

doing something good, and we're making a difference, and that everyone on board is there for the same reason. And that it's nice to work in a place like my school.

Helen expressed:

I spent 3 years in an affluent school as a classroom teacher just because I wanted to see what different “graphics” look like. Is the grass greener? Affluent schools have their own pros and cons. But the thing that drove me to Title I in the first place was just my own experience with public education. I grew up in a in a very dysfunctional home, and school was my safe place. It was a place where I was valued and seen for the person that I was.

Mary concluded:

I had teachers that genuinely care for me as a human being and not me as the letter grade or me as the high school graduate or whatever. So, I went into education and particularly into Title I wanting to be that same type of human being that show kids their own natural value as a human being ... just an existence. Importantly, showing kids and guiding kids through their own resilience is what really makes me stay. I think what motivates me... has always been what motivated me to start like this. It's the place that I come from. So, yeah, I've always been a Title I kid ... let alone been in a working Title one space that was who I was. And so that's where my appreciation lies... is with my people, and quite frankly. So that's what motivates me to continue the work in Title I.

All three coaches are motivated, committed, and desire to work in Title I schools.

Elizabeth desires to accomplish the mission to close gaps for student achievement. Helen and Mary's background is a connection to their motivation of working in Title I.

Group 2: Assistant Principal. SL's philosophy may be developed based on their upbringing. During each interview, I asked, "What is your leadership philosophy? Grace said, "I know that my beliefs are that all students should be expected to have great opportunities to learn from great teachers; who are willing to go the extra mile...which means that I too, have to do the same thing". Jovita stated:

My philosophy really is ... and it is part of our district's and our school's mission. Which is... All kids are deserving of and capable of excellence in learning. We shouldn't accept anything else. So that really is my philosophy.

Septima shared:

I truly believe that the prerequisite to a successful future is the foundation that's before individuals. So, I truly believe in building the foundation and then the structure. Setting the foundation and then building upon that in various ways. It allow individuals to not only receive what's needed, but they're able to enhance and explore.

Each of the three assistant principals shared a brief philosophy of their educational expectations. Grace's beliefs are that students should have great opportunities to learn from great teachers who go the extra-mile. Jovita beliefs are that all kids are deserving of and capable of excellence in learning. Septima's beliefs are that the prerequisite to a successful future is the foundation that's before individuals.

I asked each of the assistant principal SL, "What is your motivation to work in Title I school?" Grace answered:

I think it has to do with my upbringing. Even though people see me as somebody that's Caucasian, both of my grandmothers live in a Title I neighborhood, which is

where my family is from. So, I feel more confident, more comfortable, because it's where I grew up.

Jovita voiced:

I don't think I would work anywhere but a Title I. But I have to say that I grew up in poverty, and I grew up on an IEP for speech. So, I have had my own challenges in growing up. So, I am drawn to people of color, especially attracted to and drawn to Hispanic female leaders. So, I go to Title I schools because I feel like that's where I could have the most impact, positively, because that's how I was impacted.

Septima shared:

So, one thing that motivates me to work in Title I is when structures are put in place, they're not only for safety, but for growth. I have seen where a structure has changed a student's perspective... and expectations for their student has changed their perspective on how they see themselves... and how they matriculate through a course or through learning. The same thing for a parent.

Each assistant principal shared their internal motivation of working in a Title I school.

Grace and Jovita's internal motivational influences were closely tied with their upbringing. Septima is drawn to Title I due to the structures that are put in place.

Group 3: Principals: A principal's philosophy may expand through experiences of leadership. I asked each principal, "What is your philosophy?" Charlotte stated, "We have to believe in each other and the students. We have to believe even if others don't believe it! Truly, our vision sound cheesy, but it's 'Believe it, achieve it!'"

Edward shared:

My philosophy is very purpose driven, servant leadership, and spiritually based on everything I do in the school is based on prayer, based on faith, and based on hope. I put every plan before God pray over my staff, I prayed over my kids at school, and I prayed over the families. That's how I live. So, if God is in it, I'm at it. So that's my philosophy.

Eleanor shared:

I have a deep belief in the human condition with a part of honoring the human condition and committing to seeing the whole person. If you commit to seeing the whole person, then you're committed to teasing out and celebrating differences just as much as you are committed to finding alignment and unity where it makes sense. The humans that I lead deserve to thrive where they are not hiding who they are, where they are able to speak, and what they want to do. The humans can do what they love, think what they believe, and have it be accepted and heard, and absorbed into the fabric of the school.

Fanny shared:

I believe that equity is at the center of everything that I do... just for me, it's that all kids can learn at the highest level. They are all diamond in the rough, you just have to make sure that you are searching and seeking for their brilliance. And my core values is that you need to always center students and everything that you do. And I think that the other thing is, that I feel the same way about students. I do feel the same way about teachers that I do about students.

Horace shared:

I believe deeply in equity and diversity, and I believe in kids learning academically, personally, and also as a member of a community. I really believe in building relationships of trust, and then providing opportunities for people to be who they are.

Richard expressed:

My philosophy is to ensure students educated with the upmost level of standard of care. Professional standard of care is the ethical or legal duty of an educator to exercise the level of care, diligence and skill prescribed in the code of practice of his or her profession, or as other educators in the same discipline would in the same or similar circumstances.

Each of the six principal's philosophy is holder of values and beliefs. Charlotte and Richard's philosophy are based on the standard of the students. Edward's philosophy is faith based and purpose driven. Fanny and Horace philosophies are centered on equity. Eleanor philosophy is the belief in the human condition.

I asked each principal, "What motivate you to work in a Title I school?" Charlotte expressed:

I desire to continue maintaining membership and lead this school until I retire. I see myself in the students that I serve. ...It's just me! They are some of our most challenging, yet most deserving students, and I see myself in them. So somewhere I'm having an impact because I see myself in my students, and I know how I would have loved for some teachers and administrators to have treated me. So that's why I'm here.

Edward narrated:

I want to be around children who are like me. I grew up in poverty, and I grew up poor. I grew up in an environment of black, brown, poor, white children, some middle-class children. So that's definitely where I know my skill set lies and where my passion lies. So that's why ... I desire to keep working here ...

Edward continued:

I read somewhere to never pass up an opportunity that would change your life forever. And this has changed my life forever. It started out rough and tough because I made choices and sacrifices to be here while having tearful nights. God put me here. So, with all of that, what keeps me in this school is the fact and what makes me want to work here is that these children were written off like I was ripped off. I know what it's like to go to a school where no one believes that you are capable, and that everyone thinks you're above, what people call "the ghetto school or the hood school.

Eleanor narrated:

I was brought up in an immigrant Italian Catholic family of wealth, and the biggest thing was just particularly coming from my dad who is a doctor with an immigrant mentality is education is everything. The two most important things that he wanted me to do are, bust your ---, work hard always, and "Shut up, work hard and then serve, be of service to others in whatever way that means..." And so that always ring true and deeply with me, and I like working hard, but not ... And I love feeling like I am of service to others, and that's not even just in profession in general. It makes me feel good to be in that space with my friends,

and with my family. "I studied to be a lawyer ... with how I was oriented to serve others was being a public defender...that was not my plan.... So, how I ended up in a 50-50 Latinx and Black New York classroom is a bit of a longer story. But in essence from day one, I just loved it! It really isn't a mission to go save kids. It's like, "No, this ---- is not fair!" Kids are amazing and they deserve great education!" Because of my Italian side, culturally I feel connected.

Fanny replied:

Well, I was a Title I kid who came from a very challenged and disadvantaged background. And my goal in becoming a teacher was always to give back to the kids that you resemble and have a very similar background to what I've had. So that was one reason. The other reason why I work in a Title I school is because when I worked in California, which is where I'm from, my entire career was spent in a Title I school. "So, it's just what I know. It's what I love. I feel like one of those things that I one hundred percent want everybody to understand is; just because you are a child in a Title I school doesn't mean that you can't learn at a high level. And I've always wanted to disrupt and break those barriers. That was my goal. So, I know how to do that. As a teacher, I expect that of myself, and the teachers I lead.

Horace professed:

As far as being motivated to work with in Title I schools, I think part of that comes from my experience in education. You know, I grew up very privileged. I certainly didn't attend Title I schools myself. I was in public schools like very homogeneous, very white, very wealthy schools, and I didn't love school very

much when I was a kid, and I didn't want to be a teacher for some reason. I think there's some parental influence there. But when I graduated from undergraduate, I went to work in a high poverty area of the country. Also, I believe in the importance of community and in the importance of having a strong community. And I think that pulls me back to Title I schools. I also have said several times, I would be bored if I didn't work in a Title I school. There's just this I wouldn't want to deal with the same the same kinds of people all the time. So having a variety, and different kinds of people is really important to me.

Richard remarked:

I love the kids that I get to work with each and every day. I mean, we have a phenomenal and unique culture. Earlier, you asked me to share with our student population, and it is 80 % students of color.” But you'd be surprised how many students of color have never had a black principal. And I think... When I was allowed to serve and be named the principal of this school, it only made the students and the community, we serve a lot better off because now they will go into the world after high school, not having the barrier or the gap of never having a person of color being an authority figure in their life. And I've seen spaces where white kids have never had a black teacher, a black administrator in their building, and then when they get to the workplace, and I have a black supervisor or they have a black person who is there equal? I struggle with that issue.

Three of the principals are motivated to work in a Title I school after growing up as a Title I student themselves. Two of the principals shared they grew up as a White privilege student in wealth. One of the principals thinks it is a great idea he is a principal in a Title

I school because it improves the community perception of having a Black person of authority.

Subtheme B: Cultural Influences

Culture is referenced where individuals are shaped by influences through the school community and exhibit or develop varied methods of learning. In this study, cultural influences or experiences are practices provided in a school setting to influence or welcome BT. SL of Title I schools expressed the importance of having an inclusive cultural setting (Gay, 2000).

Group 1: Instructional Coaches. In an inclusive school setting, the climate and culture are more tolerant of “race” talk. I wanted to envision what the culture was like in each of the coach’s school. So, I asked each coach, “How would you describe the overall culture in your school?” Elizabeth shared:

I would really describe it as extremely positive among the faculty. I think that our faculty is very inclusive and open minded. We have a lot of teachers that identify of different races, different sexual orientation, and our staff has been very inclusive. So overall, very positive, welcoming, and inclusive. I wouldn't say that we don't have issues, I think we are growing in stages in our cultural development where we talk about really heavy things except for when those conversations are facilitated ... and when they are facilitated, then those kind of conversations come up. But it's not something that you would have people talk about it all the time, like in the staff lounge or something like that.

Helen described:

We are one of the most relational schools you're going to get your hands on. We will love you to the ends of the earth. It doesn't matter how you present yourself, how you show up every day as a student, as a family member, as a colleague. It doesn't matter. Show up and we are going to love you because you are you and you are part of this community. From an instructional standpoint. I think that there are some structural things that we definitely need to let go of...but we have a positive culture.

Mary stated:

I think mostly it's a focus on the kid piece of it, more so than the adult piece is where I think I could do more work. I know that we can do a better job ... naming it for teachers. I think we name it for sure... for kids, and we're super aware... hyper-aware of it for students, but not enough for the adults.

Elizabeth school's culture extremely positive, inclusive, growing in cultural development.

Helen school's culture is relational. Mary school's culture focuses on the kid piece and not enough on the adult piece.

In the progression of each interview, I asked each instructional SL, "How would you begin talking about race with your staff?" Elizabeth responded:

Mm hmm. So, I think this has been something we've... you know... we've kind of been thinking about a lot. But I think the first thinking about your own identity, and really helping teachers feel comfortable in sharing their identity... whatever that might be, and really exploring how their identity influences the way they

interact with other students and families, and also influences their decisions that they make.

Helen shared:

Well, I'll tell you, race is a normal part of our conversation in our building.

Whenever we have our staff PLC/professional development, without failure, it doesn't matter what we're talking about, race becomes natural. We always open up with a compass question related to where we are entering in on the compass, a question related to what we're exploring for that day and how we might enter into on the compass with that lens. In terms of addressing whiteness, micro-aggression and other race matters, we are also a very open community of learners. We talk a lot about having courageous conversations we've shared in smaller groups about courageous conversations. We acknowledge the fact that these things aren't easy, but we also acknowledge the fact that we're not going to let them go away. It's not a one and done shot.

During Mary's interview, she explained how race is discussed mostly through Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion work. Then Mary said:

When things are brought up or when somebody notices or whatever, that we have the conversations. I think the second piece of that is helping teachers unpack biases that may influence the way they interact with students. Once they are aware of those real kind of owning it, not from a guilt perspective, just an awareness perspective... and is thinking about how they can proactively engage with themselves to reframe the way that they look at students... then think about students and interact with students.

Two of the three coaches, Helen and Mary use race talk as intentional conversations and in professional learning and development. Elizabeth says, “First think of your own identity-then help teachers understand how identify influence interactions with students. Race talk can be difficult.”

During the interview, I asked each coach, “What is your perspective on BT teaching Black students and BT teaching White students?” Elizabeth said:

Oh, I think it's very important for Black teachers to teach Black students. And I've read research on the impact of Black students seeing teachers that look like them and the impact that that has on student achievement. And what I've noticed with teachers of color teaching students of color, is that it has a very positive impact, and that students connect with them very well. They see their teachers as mentors. They appreciate their efforts... and I tell you that the students respect them.

Elizabeth continued:

Also, I think that it is a way for White students to see Black people and in positions of power and influence...And I think it reframes some of the narratives that we have in our country around what Black people do professionally, especially with Black people in leadership roles. I think that is extremely important, and I think it influences students to think differently about leadership.

Helen expressed:

I think students of color want to see themselves represented in the adults that spend the time with them, and every teacher, regardless of race. Our Black teachers bring many gifts to the table. Some of them have a wealth of gifts. Some of them might only have one or two gifts, but everybody brings something to the

table. I think it would be amazing because I think about my own experience as a student. I didn't have a black teacher until I was in college. So, I think about in today's day and age, what would it be like to be a White student, you know, learning from a black teacher. I think that you would get a whole other perspective, and not a whole other perspective jammed down your throat. But a whole other perspective of life that you didn't get to experience or you didn't get to hear about. The teachers in my building in particular, I think about them, and they share their truth and their life, and their honesty with their kids. I think that just builds deeper relationship and deeper commitment to wanting to be a learner.

Mary shared:

I think... Black teachers tend... I think maybe a lot of times black folks look out for black folks. That's my hope for them! Like I say that ... but I've seen situations where it don't happen that way. Yes, that's what we tend to like. I think we end up being a lot harder, but not in a bad way. But like making sure that our students are meeting expectations, navigating systems, and like... you know, as a college going culture, making sure that they're applying to universities that makes sense for them to apply. They can look at HBCUs. Looking at colleges that will service them best! And then, I think like same way with Black teachers, with White students, I don't think that we treat them any differently. I just think that we tend to be inclusive in our behaviors towards White children compared to White teachers toward Black children. I think that's m...y (my) perception!

Two of the coaches, Elizabeth and Helen agreed that BT should teach Black students as the adults are mentors and a representation of themselves. Mary was uncertain as she

hopes that Black folks will look out for Black folks, and she has seen it gone the other way. Elizabeth and Helen think that BT should teach White students and gain a new perspective while seeing Blacks in position of power and influence to reframe narratives. Mary did not mention her perspective of BT teaching White students.

Group 2: Assistant Principals: Even though the assistant principals agree that there are harsh realities for BT to grasp, overall, they view no major problems at their school site. I asked each assistant principal to describe their school's culture. Grace said,

It is very positive and caring and my school is built on systems. Everyone has leadership opportunities. No one person who is interested in a leadership opportunity goes without one. I think there is equity across... that fact number one, that we've diversified our leadership. ...And I think also, our principal does a really great job of making sure that in every professional development and PLCs, we don't allow teachers to make excuses about why something can't be done for kids. My principal focuses on equity across the board all the time. It's just a philosophy we live by. So, our core values at our school also reflect how we promote an inclusive positive climate.

Jovita shared:

I have a biracial teacher who is mixed with Black and White, a Black teacher, a teacher that's from Puerto Rico, and also, I have a teacher that's from Mexico. So, we have teachers from different places. They speak different languages, and we do the same things with them that we do for Black teachers. I think our racial climate ... we're so geared towards student achievement, student achievement, and more student achievement!

Septima shared:

Culture? We have room for growth. One of the biggest things that I think is very important for our teachers of color is the understanding of the different backgrounds that they are approaching, or they had in their classrooms and how to address those back backgrounds. So, from a cultural look, or from our development as black teachers, people are always setting their boundaries in their understanding of pieces. One of the biggest things that I liked for them to understand is the variety of values, standards. And then aligning those pieces so that it's not foreign to them when they hear or see something else that's outside of their value or their structure block.

All three assistant principals spoke about their school's culture from three different angles. Grace school's culture is positive and caring, built on systems, and everyone has leadership opportunities. Jovita's school culture includes teachers from different places and is geared towards student achievement. Septima's school's culture has room for growth, and more so for BT to understand the variety of values and standards.

Also, each assistant principal was asked, "How do you begin talking about race with your staff? Grace made this statement, "In all honesty, we don't really do that. We don't have these problems going on at my school." Jovita shared, "We haven't talked about that. I don't know that it's been an issue in our building. We had something come down from the superintendent, that said, 'Make sure you're being mindful'". Jovita continued:

But now that you say that I guess I've never asked if we need to come together and kind of have that conversation. I've had some White teachers tell me, "This

certain word might be offensive, or that word might be offensive." I went straight to, "Wait a minute! Is this a "you" issue, or is this a kid issue? Because I'm dealing with kid issues right now! And I feel like this is a "you" issue." So, I guess I didn't, but I should probably ask my teachers about that specific word.

Septima shared:

And so, one piece that has been really intricate in our district is we've been utilizing diversity as one piece of training that has been given to talk about biases, to talk about levels of understanding when it comes to Whiteness or Blackness. Ruby Payne has been another go-to piece that has been utilized to talk about the different levels, not only just from a race, but from classes from an understanding of it may not even be... Culture. Culture is not White nor Black. And I think that sometimes that starts the conversation easier than opposed to just coming with White does this, Black do this, or in your Whiteness or in this. "So, I always like to start from that piece and then begin to talk about how does that affect race? How is that affecting? If this piece is what we're talking about... is not something that's going to affect our goals of learning.

Race talk can become a catalyst for cultural awareness of others. Each assistant principal's approach to discussing race was different. Grace perceived that her school does not have these problems going on. Jovita's school has not talked about race and she don't know that it's been an issue in our building. Septima referenced using "Ruby Payne" resources and she starts from a talk about how the impacts of race.

During each interview, I asked, "What is your perspective on BT teaching Black students and BT teaching White students?" Grace stated, "I have no issue of Black

teachers teaching any students. I would prefer that our students saw themselves in the teachers that teach them, because I think they need to have great role models of color.”

Jovita said, “We have three Black teachers and two Hispanic teachers. Our families and students love these teachers, and they ask can their children get into Ms. ---, class. It has been good for the children.” Jovita then shared:

My perception in just having watched what I hear, is that my teachers don't see race. They don't see color unless, like I said, I have to hook them up with a mentor and say, "I think that they really need a positive Black role model because they may not have a mom in the house right now." They may be being raised by a grandmother or something like that. And they might need that nurturing kind of motherly figure. And so, I would typically try to connect a Black teacher with a Black student or Hispanic with a Hispanic. But other than that, I think my teachers hold a very high expectation for learning for their students. And they go out of their way to help kids of all color.

Septima shared:

So, I would definitely want it to be diverse. And when I say diverse, I do mean in race in another pieces in content knowledge, in levels of knowledge. And that comes from all different races a backgrounds. And we've all learned from different schools, different ideologies, different professional settings that allow us to bring in a diverse background of learning experiences. So, I want it to be a mix, a melting pot. One of the realities of Colorado is, we are in a predominantly white population. And sometimes that population is reflected in our buildings. When I even just looking at the AppliTrack system or reflect over interviews which are

virtual interviews ... on purpose and not phone interviews ...so that I can see if the person will be relatable to our students, and not just from black or white, but even from tone, even from mannerisms.

Two of the three assistant principals, Grace and Jovita see BT teaching Black students as a positive. Septima did not provide a clear answer but wants her school to be a mix and a melting pot. However, BT are hard to come by. Often, the topic BT teaching Black students and BT teaching White students responses vary.

Group 3: Principals. Within inclusive positive settings, race matching is a common practice. I asked each of the six principals, “Please describe the culture of your school?” Charlotte shared:

I think our culture is pretty good. Our district gives a climate and culture survey all teachers to gain their input about our school. According to our results, percentages were extremely high, but interesting. Our admin team did an action plan for improvement, and we discussed three areas with our staff. That's important! So, we use our survey, and I took that question to value how others may feel. Also, to help remedy some of our problems, I have a weekly informational email...this is what I call it. Every week, it goes out sometime between Friday evening and Saturday morning. It is intended to be a form of communication, and all staff receives it.

Edward shared:

So, the culture is warm where everybody matters to everyone! We promote that by making sure we quote and we see the vision every morning. We say the vision every morning, and the vision is posted. But more importantly, the vision is

articulated and modeled in the classrooms.” Edward explained, “We do that through what’s called constructiveness. Coming back for restored [justice] conversations where all of our classrooms on any given day have children in a circle, and then actually having to start a conversation about a book they study, or about a problem they had in the school.

Edward concluded:

So, we created a climate of feedback where children can go to any teacher or come to the principal or any administrator and give us feedback. Staff can give us feedback and we act on that feedback because everybody matters.

Eleanor responded:

Our school’s culture is positive and everyone here is like a family. Ours consists of systems and structures that allow you to be your authentic self. Even though we have what I call are safe spaces, there are boundaries that allow you to protect yourself. You may be who you are regardless of being an adult or a student.

Fanny said:

I would say the culture of our school is better. I think it's improving and I think it's definitely it's more cohesive this year than it was before. Our theme and our motto for this year is: We Got This! We based that off of Cornelius Meiners book. I just feel like everything that we do when we're talking about diversity, equity and inclusion for Black teachers ... I know that I am primarily looking at teachers of color and making sure that it's a safe environment for them. But I think when I do that, and I have my attention and my focus that way, it is a safe, inclusive environment for all teachers. That's what I believe.

Horace shared:

The culture of our school is positive, and very socially and emotionally driven. We talk a lot about children building and growing personally. Growing academically and then growing up civically. So as members of the community, I think that's not just about kids, that's about the whole community. This comes from our board, all the way down to our leaders, and all the way down to those individual classrooms. We talk about those three things and we figure out how we're meeting or not meeting the needs of those three areas. So, I think that's an important part of our culture at our school. And then our goal as a school, in our mission, states we exist to foster a diverse and equitable community.

Richard shared:

My school's culture is phenomenal and unique culture. It is a very kind of family like...close knit kind of staff culture ... but we're big, we're not so small. You know, kind of... like ... Everybody knows your name and your business. But People definitely look out for each other. I think our school is unique, fun, and it has 80% population of students of color.

All six principals view their school setting as positive. Charlotte uses surveys to gather feedback, and Edwards believes everyone matters. Eleanor and Richard's schools are like a family. Fanny school's culture is getting better, and Horace's school is positive and fosters diversity.

Race can be a sensitive topic of discussion. Some groups are able to discuss race as a whole group, and some prefer to discuss race in small groups. During the interview, I asked the six principals, "How do you talk about race with your staff?" Charlotte said:

I address issues as to how they come. If any events occur like they did on January 6th, the district will tell the principals how to address those matters. “You know, it's just saying it's actually equity as long as it's equal. I don't want them gravitating one way or the other. And it goes back to the earlier questions when I alluded to where parents want their kids, and these are White parents. Spanish parents, you know, just want to see equal support like tutoring. I'm looking at student data, and I see some other than Black, I want to make sure all races are there. So, I'm just looking for equity. Equity as it relates to students' needs because everyone doesn't need the same thing.

Edward voiced:

We start from the version of professional development that is culturally responsive. So, we're talking about micro-aggressions. We're talking about biases; we're talking about privilege. We're talking about power. We talk about LGBTQ rights and immigration rights. It's just what we talk about. And it also goes back to me being the leader and saying this is what we're going to talk about and be talking about it. If I don't talk about it, no one else will.

Eleanor expressed:

I share my own self-awareness, talking about race, and making it okay to talk about race will matter to black teachers. Making it okay to be yourself, providing a place that is diverse where people see others that share the same racial identity matters. It makes it comfortable there are other Black teachers that have come and stayed and made a home. I think that's critical.

Fanny shared:

That is that is a really tough question, but I think that how you address it is with consistency and with from a position of strength. And understanding and awareness that it will be dealt with, because I don't you know, I don't sit back and just say like, oh, it's just fine, let me ignore that. And it is really difficult to address every single thing that happens. But I think that if you are addressing the important things and the vast majority of what's happening and the micro-aggression that are happening in your building, then you are making progress. I try to do that on a regular basis for teachers. However, my goal is not to. You know, kind of remove their dignity. I'm not trying to do that. A lot of times I will do one- on- one check-ins with teachers if they have a very difficult time, and if they're engaging and consistent. I do have some that engage in consistent micro-aggressions in the building. I will check- in with them one- on-one. But I will bring the courageous conversation to their door. They have not love that, but it is what's happening.

Horace shared:

But I think the one encouraging piece is that we continue to return those conversations, and it allows teachers time to step away from that conflict and to continue processing on their own. I do think, there have been times when Black teachers have come and talked to either their coach or talk to me directly about issues that have come up where race has played a role. Where they have been marginalized or minoritized that another teacher is acting or working on a problem or working through a situation. However, I do think that the fact they are

able to express that. We have outlets for them to express when that's happening and it shows some level of development of a strong racial climate in the school.

Richard shared:

We solidify our norms. On the front end, we let everybody know that everything you hear won't make you comfortable, but know, we're not here to attack you. It's OK to disagree, it's OK to not reach closure by the end, and listen to understand and assume positive intent. After that, we create a safe space.

Richard continued:

And some staff meetings where some staff members would say, "I need help with this, like, can you tell me, like we've even had we've had discussions amongst staff, but we've also had a student panel come to a staff meeting where we will have students of color come in and answer questions. Some staff, asked some questions like: How do I address the N-word, right? Like, I hate it, but I hear kids say it all the time. Like what do you think I should do to either address it or how can I make it stop in my class. Because it makes me uncomfortable hearing it and then to address it and hold kids accountable for saying the word is a whole other battle in itself.

Richard concluded:

The conversations were rich...because the kids we're saying it's OK to not know. It's OK to be uncomfortable. We're uncomfortable too. You know, but what we struggle with is when you're uncomfortable. There's usually this power dynamic that happens, so that you make yourself comfortable again, instead of being willing to be vulnerable in that space, and share in discourse with students about

how you're feeling, you know, you have to be willing to relinquish that power and say...“Hey, guys, let's process this right, like I don't like what I just heard why is that? OK, because I don't think it's OK and I don't like hearing it in my classroom, so let's talk about what was just said or what just happened. Hopefully by the end of it, we will agree that it won't be allowed and it won't happen again and move forward.

All six principal viewpoints on race are differentiated. Charlotte discusses race as the situation comes, and believes equity is equal. Edward race talks start with professional development and goes back to him being the leader. When Eleanor talks about race, she shares her own self-awareness. Fanny uses strength and consistency to talk about race while implementing courageous conversations. Horace solidify his norms talks about race through conversations with teachers. Richard discusses race during his faculty meeting and will include student participation.

Research has been done on SOC having a BT in their teaching career can be positive. I asked each principal, “What is your perception of black teachers teaching black students and black teachers teaching white students?” Charlotte replied,

You know, it's just saying it's actually equity as long as it's equal. I don't want them gravitating one way or the other. Spanish parents, you know, just want to see equal support like tutoring and interventions. I'm looking at student data, and I see some other than Black students, they are all given the same opportunity. I want to make sure all races are supported. So, I'm just looking for equity. Equity as it relates to student needs because everyone doesn't need the same thing.

Edward voiced:

I don't necessarily buy into the color matching. A Black teacher isn't necessarily the best picture for Black students, especially when a Black teacher does not have the content knowledge. As I said, they have to be a master of their knowledge, and they have to be willing to be culturally responsive and relevant.

Edward continued:

That's the same for Black teachers teaching a white student. I expect a Black teacher to go into the classroom. And if there is a White student in there struggling, that teacher need to get to know that White student on a cultural level. Because believe it or not, White kids in black and brown schools have the same issues that children have in that neighborhood. They may not be dealing with the racial discrimination, but they're dealing with some form of racism as the only White boy in the neighborhood trust and believe that.

Eleanor stated:

Yes! I am emphatic to both. And in fact, it matters to me to also have a really diverse Black staff. That our Black staff is not all one person. They don't represent all Black people in the world. And it's important for our kids to see that there is diversity within each racial group as well that needs to be honored and teased out. And so, yes on both fronts! Strongly, yes! I don't think you can do without mentors. However, when you define your identity most strongly, you will a mentorship or deserves one. And then cross-identity mentorship just allow for a richness and understanding and a different perspective on the world.

Fanny remarked:

What I know about research, if you were to look at what is the increase of academic achievement for a student that has a Black teacher, I know that the percentage add for students is about 39%. If they have a Black teacher in their educational career, if they have more than one Black teacher, then that achievement level then goes through the roof. All students benefit from having a black teacher in front of them. I think it shows multiple perspectives. Also, I do believe that our White students benefit from having a Black teacher because they need to see and be socialized by someone who can allow them to develop the anti-racist side of themselves.

Horace shared:

I think it's really important for Black teachers to teach Black students. I think it's very easy for Black students to go through their school career and not see teachers who have shared experiences with them. Often there are times when Black teachers, struggle more with Black students than with White students. There's so much emotion that's there for them, or they see someone that is part of their family in those students. Particularly when Black students are struggling in school. You hear from teachers like ... he's just like my nephew. He's just like this kid or he's just like someone I know. So, I think that can be a challenge. But I think it's equally important because that becomes an emotional attachment. And I think that kids thrive the most when they feel safe, they feel loved, and they feel seen in their classrooms.

Horace continued:

Then Black teachers can really communicate to Black students in a way that White teachers can't. I think Black teachers teaching White students is equally important because our White students need to also know what it means to exist in a multicultural world and just value people who are different from them. The world at large is not necessarily going to ever give them examples of strong Black people that they can look up to or Black people who can shape their lives and influence them.

Horace continued:

So, here's an opportunity right there. So, for a White kid to see a Black person and just think of them as someone who they admire and look up to and taught me a lot rather than having to think about this person differently because they're Black. Then having to adjust to my kind of my way of responding because they're different from me. That is an opportunity for them to know a Black person and to have that kind of outlook. So, I think it's important that Black teachers are in front of Black students ...and White students are taught by Black teachers is very important.

Richard shared:

I am not sure what the research says exactly, but I believe this research says that Black teachers who teach Black students, those Black students are more successful not only in that course, but in their academic careers because they have more confidence compared to Black students who have not been exposed to Black teachers. They see themselves in the institution as belonging. They see themselves

in a career as a career option because they can see themselves in it. They're pushed to be more creative thinkers, as well as creative producers within the learning environment because of what Black teachers require of Black students.

Richard continued:

And the research also reflects that of White students, that they are forced to think more critically and be more creative with the work that they produce when they have a Black teacher. And there is more respect that they have for people of color within the system, because they are required to sustain that dynamic of having a black authority figure that have to interact and navigate in order to meet their expectations for Graduation that's required for them to graduate. Not all my White students do a great job of that. I've seen some go and get a schedule change, and you know undermine every decision that the Black teacher makes and every grade that the Black teacher gives. The parent says, "I'm calling... or I am emailing the principal to get the grade change, and things like that.

According to the six principals, teacher race matching may or may not work well.

Charlotte is neutral and supports equity, and Edward supports teacher race matching if the teacher is a master of content and culturally responsiveness. Eleanor is emphatic to both and it matters to her that she has a diverse staff to support this initiative. Fanny, Horace and Richard support both and believe there is a benefit for Black students and White students.

Subtheme C: Relational Influences

In this study, relationships is interchangeable with relational. In the teaching profession, the need of positive relationships and connections among SL and BT give a

strong sense of identity to prevent feeling isolated and disconnected within the school environment (Kohli, 2018). The SL expressed their viewpoints of how relationships can be influences to retain BT at their school sites.

Group 1: Instructional Coaches: In the hallways of a school, commonly coaches are given opportunities to advise a Black college graduate within a student teaching situation, or coach a BT using a cyclic approach. I asked each coach, “What has been your experience in developing a BT in their journey towards success?” Elizabeth said,

It has been positive for the most part. I think it is it is involved a lot of really honest conversations about what the teacher needs, and how we can support the teacher to feel fully developed and supported. It has been hard work, but for the most part it has been fruitful, and it has led to conversations that are just productive conversations about what we should do next to help the teacher.

Helen said:

This teacher is an amazing educator. She taught several grades, and I could tell she was ready for something different. So, her and I explored different avenues in terms of coaching or “star” mentorship, or just some of the other leadership things that are available outside of our school. She was already a member of our guiding coalition, and a member of our equity team. So, she and I had a lot of conversations about preparation of wanting to do coaching? So, we talked about coursework, finding a mentor, and a thought partner she knew is trusting and will push and ask questions. Then we talked about personal goals she had set for herself. And then she made the decision that she wanted to try a different content area. Yeah, and she did!

Mary shared:

I think if I go back... Three, since I've been doing this thing for 15 years, I think that I'm glad that I've developed and learned over the course of time. I think about me in my earlier time period. I didn't have any perspective around cultural responsiveness as like a grown-up to grown-up level. Like, I just don't think that was... A revelation.

Developing BT in their journey toward success is critical for BT retention. Elizabeth has encountered positive experiences in developing BT through hard work and productive conversations. Helen has encountered an amazing BT making positive career choices. Mary shared how she has been developed as a Black educator which has been a revelation.

Conversations can occur among educational colleagues in the school setting. Then can provide an impact depending on whether the individual is a Black college graduate. To gain a perspective of what might a coach tell a Black college graduate wanting to pursue teaching I told each coach to use an imaginary wand to advise a Black college student who wants to become a teacher. Then I asked each coach, "What advice would you give to a Black college graduate wanting to be a teacher in a White profession?"

Elizabeth shared:

I would say to make sure that they get placed in a very strong school that has a very strong coaching system. And to make sure that when they do that, they have an apprentice teaching opportunity that is going to be that, where that will place them with a very strong mentor-teacher, and they will get fully developed and exposed to what it will really be like to be a teacher, and really learn how to

lesson plan. Last, I would say ... like, the mentorship situation needs to be very strong, so that the teacher feels really ready when they are leading their own class.

Helen expressed:

Well, I'd be honest and forthright in telling them what they're entering into a system that doesn't necessarily make things easy for them. That doesn't necessarily value their voice in their opinion, and they're going to step into buildings where they're going to feel alienated and isolated. So, what I would encourage them to do is to keep looking for a building, a climate and a culture where they are valued. Where they are heard and appreciated for what they bring. In the meantime, I'd be like, OK, if you're stuck in a school, that's not the case. Find a teacher, a colleague, a mentor, or find another building to work in that you can trust. ...And then I'd also say, you're going to have to grow a thick skin, but don't lose the voice that lives inside you.

During Mary's interview, she expressed the difficulties on working while being Black in the teaching force. Mary expressed:

Try go where there's more of us because it's hard to be one of the few. When it's just you and one other person or whatever, it's just a struggle! So really, find pockets of where there's more of us, and where the leader will interview Black people...Then while interviewing, you should ask questions around what are they doing in regard to their cultural responsiveness of students? Because they don't have a plan for kids, they surely...surely don't have one for you! ... So, I think that my advice is to find a decent critical mass, and to ask people questions to make sure that they're considerate of culture and race.

All three coaches expressed their viewpoint about advising Black college graduates who want to become a teacher in a white profession. Elizabeth would advise to work in a school that has a strong coaching system and gain a mentorship. Helen shared the hardiness will involve alienation and isolation, so get a mentor and grow thick skin. Mary's advice would be to work in place where there are pockets of BT and they are considerate of culture.

Group 2: Assistant Principals: Assistant principals relational influences may be to advise a black college graduate or lead a group of BT. To explore more on how SL develop BT, I asked each participant, "What has been your experience developing a Black teacher in their journey towards success? Grace shared, "I don't think I have been successful in developing the one Black male teacher I supervised. He was hungry for leadership, but my new principal would not allow the opportunity for his growth".

Jovita shared an experience of helping a young Black student teacher learn the ropes of acquiring teaching practices. She explained the willing attitude of the Black student teacher wanting to get ahead of the game. Jovita shared:

Well, my young teacher started out as our student teacher, and she did not need a formal observation. Since she assisted on getting an observation, so I received approval from her program. ...The Black student teacher said, to treat her the same as regular teachers. She wanted the same feedback. The next day I gave her the feedback, and she used it for her advantage. She was very ambitious and always excepted feedback. She wanted have knowledge, if she did get a job here, wherever, she would already have that feedback in place. So, she could already start changing those things and making positive changes to those so she would be

ahead of the game. A few months later, we hired her, and that was two years ago, and now she still has the same attitude and a growth mindset. That's just the way she is. So, it was very positive experience.

Septima shared:

Hmmm, I recall very vividly one of the teachers understanding... So, we talk about the “well-to-do” teacher, but the growing from the impoverished mindset to the enlightened knowledgeable mindset. So sometimes in an impoverished mindset, it's that everything that I have, I have to give and I have to support to show my support. But I may actually drain myself doing that. So, with that understanding of how you don't have to drain yourself, then you are no good for everyone else. And you can't provide the support that you need. That also comes from rendering knowledge and building up themselves. So, from not necessarily negative or positive, it's more of a journey in the way of how do I move from weariness. I had to exhaust every single piece of me and every piece of support, every piece of knowledge in order to be successful for my students or for myself... and this should not at all be the case for the “well-to-do” teacher.

Jovita and Septima both shared positive experiences in developing a BT at their school site. Whereas Grace's experiences were not fulfilled with the one Black male teacher supervises as she lacked her principal's support. Jovita provided a Black student teacher feedback and opportunity to engage in curriculum, and Septima developed a teacher during a coaching session.

Each of the three assistant principals was asked to advise a Black college graduate wanting to become a teacher in the white profession. I asked each assistant principal, “What advice would you share with the Black college graduate?” Grace shared:

It would be a continuation of the conversation about how they can help support other teachers, even Caucasian teachers. The Black college graduate can grow into a leader and have some type of understanding of best practices when working with all different types of students of color. I think it would look like more cultural competency training across the district. Cause it doesn't really exist like it used to. With these thoughts, I would tell this Black college student to apply for jobs where there are Black leaders so you may become developed into a leader.

Jovita said:

I would say that you should “amp” up your game by earning higher degrees. So that can't be an issue when you want to get a promotion. If there's an opportunity out there, which, there's plenty out there, go get it! Because you're going to need your master's degree. It's very competitive. And if it comes down to all out ... If it comes down to, here's a Black person, Hispanic, White person, and you're all up for the same job, do something to get yourself ahead of that game. If it's education, do your education. If it's PH.D., get the PH.D. Just eliminate anything you can that might be able to be used against you, or not in your advantage.

Septima expressed:

Don't just go in with a bubbly, "I'm a teacher and just graduated, this is what I'm going to do, but you need to know how you're going to do that! Why...it's important... so do your research on the area that you are going into for the

teaching workforce... and understand your purpose ... and the expectations that are before you. Do not focus on the Whiteness of the teaching force but focus on the purpose of it. What is your purpose in going into the teaching force? You're going to have a hard time! Is your purpose to go in and change students' lives? Then that's what you need to figure out. You need to figure out as you're embracing this world that is filled with people who do not look like you.

All three assistant principals would advise a Black college graduate wanting to become a teacher in a White profession. Grace would advise a Black college student to apply for jobs where there are Black leaders. Jovita would tell the graduate to do something to get yourself ahead of the game like earn higher degrees, because it is competitive out here. Septima would tell the Black graduate to do research and understand your purpose while not focusing on the Whiteness of the profession ... focus on the kids; embracing this world that is filled with people who do not look like you.

Group 3: Principals. When principals elevate professional growth for BT, their main priority may be to influence trusting relational experiences. I asked each principal, “What has been your experience developing a Black teacher in their journey towards success?” Charlotte expressed:

But I tell you, Karen, I take a special notice to grow those teachers of color... our black teachers, because I don't see where they are. ...we have very few Black applicants ... But I think I stand beside my Black teachers a little more until I really see they can stand solid on their own. ...I'll give them personal guidance and also profession guidance.

Edward shared:

A negative experience is developing someone, mentoring them, and watching them make the same poor decisions, “not mistakes”, the poor decisions that I coached them on. Try to keep it real. When they need to be, I'm just going to keep it professional. But that's only happened maybe twice. I must say out of 10 times that only happened twice, the other eight have all been promoted. So, every single one of them is either an assistant principal, a principal, or a central office administrator.

Eleanor expressed:

I have never had a Black teacher leave our school unless they moved out of the state. The only other Black staff member who left during my time as a director, is a leader on one of our other campuses. I supported her to go do that because she was ready for it and she was hungry for it. I think a lot of it, it's just like, it's about lending my power to them to do what they want. They're the ones succeeding.”

“Most of the time, I just need to know what it is so I can make sure that they have what they need. I see myself as a catalyst, and I want for every one of my folks that I feel deeply about particularly my Black teachers and Latinx teachers. I want them to feel like this is an incredibly ripe and special opportunity where they get to be and do whatever they want to be.

Fanny shared:

There's a second grade teacher in our building from Jamaica is phenomenal. She's somebody who present herself in a way that was unlike anybody else, and she didn't have a lot of background knowledge or experience. The very first year was

really hard because she had to adapt and acclimate herself to the way we teach here at our school in the US. I had to do a one to one check in with her. I said, you know ... We hired you because of that brilliancy, and I need you to show up with it. I didn't see that in the observations and she was at the point where she did not finish the scope and sequence from the start to finish during the time while I was in there. So, I asked her to redo it and try that again. And I would come back ... please do some work with your star mentor or do some work with the Instructional Coach. I'm going to come back ... I know you can do it. She was not happy with that response.

Fanny continued:

Later, I went back to see her and it was literally one of the best lessons I have ever seen. Now, she is by far one of my strongest teachers in the building. If you look at her data, her data reflects what she believes and thinks about kids. She has acclimated. She understands how to teach here like she gets it. She has integrated her own personal flair and style into teaching. She is brilliant!

Horace shared:

I hired an older Black teacher who had been out of the physical classroom space for quite a while and had been teaching in an online school setting. At first, she really struggled with the differences between online and in-person schooling. ...there's just a lot more to manage, and there's a lot more that comes into play when you're caring for the students throughout the full day. My experience working with her was that she has developed into one of our most successful teachers, and she's consistently has the highest number of students reading on

grade level across the whole school. She also has developed into a leader in terms of presenting professional development.

Richard narrated:

One was a woman who was a SPED teacher who was extremely quiet. I learned through overhearing someone that she was finishing her doctorate degree, so I told her as well as other members of the team that we need to elevate her ... put her out in front of staff because she was really smart, but she didn't have a voice...she was a very quiet kind as to where you had to be really quiet to hear what she was saying...we really pushed her to have to speak up. You have to have a voice, like when people need to hear what you can what you're saying in the back. We also recruited her to be on the instructional leadership team as a department chair, lead her department, which she had not been doing up to that point. So, since that initial step, I observed her lead professional development sessions for the school and things like that... really start to speak up more and become more confident in her in her voice.

How to develop BT towards their journey of success varies among the six principals. Charlotte grows her BT through personal and professional guidance. Edward “keeps it real” with his BT and coaches them on their poorly made choices. Eleanor makes sure that they have what they need to succeed. Fanny, Horace, and Richard all helped a middle-aged women BT adapt and acclimate into their school’s climate while improving their instructional practices.

Providing potential BT positives and realities of how the remain a longstanding lifelong teacher is important. During the interview, I asked each principal, “If you could

advise a black college graduate pursuing teaching in the white profession, what would you share?" Charlotte said:

Keep the main thing, the main thing...the kids. So, if you know that's your priority, make sure you are articulating the right way...carry yourself the right way. You must know your craft and know the content. It's just like back in the day, something, educate yourself on all those platforms, educate yourself with the demographics. Know what they're about, and then know your content and your craft, and you're going to be fine. Once people get to know the good through you, it doesn't matter about their color. Sometimes, you know, others outside your race are better to you than how your own race treats. Just know people, your craft, and your content, and you're going to be an outstanding teacher.

Edward expressed:

No matter where the Black college graduate pursues to teach, it does not matter where they go? It's going to be White. They need to know that the majority of people you work with are going to be White. Do not allow them to use you as a disciplinarian. Know your value! Your value is to continue to educate yourself and get better. Once you determine that they are not going to develop and groom you for growth. Get your exit strategy and move on. Make it clear early what your plans are in the school. Make that clear, make that known and everything you do is geared towards that. Be good at your job! Show up on time and dressed well! Stop hanging out because you are a professional! So, there you go, so focus on you!

Edward continued:

Get a mentor, and get someone who looks like you, or who has a vested interest in your success to mentor you. While they are mentoring you, you mentor somebody back at your university, or one of your students, or somebody in the neighborhood. Because while you're learning from them, in order for you to be better, you have to be a teacher. And then you move up, you bring people with you ... And I must say, don't get into that ghetto mess complaining about kids and messing around with these little women or guys. Because it will ruin your career, and you will be miserable. Two or three years, start looking for your opportunity. Even if it means leaving the old people behind. Look for your opportunities, but you've got to see it. You've got to go for it. You've got to be on purpose, not by accident.

Eleanor explained:

Oh, that's a good one. It's a good thing I'm not mentoring college students. I mean, sadly, I'd probably say, you might want to seek out your earlier years a school that has other Black teachers, so that you have a sense of community. Also, you may seek out a Black leader that you believe will support you because it would be shameful to lose a great educator because you went unseen and unheard and undeveloped in your early years. And then from there, the world's your oyster, go choose. But I think I'd just say, no, that if you choose a school where you are in a primarily White workforce, it'll be deeply important that you maintain mentorships outside that school, and that that will support you and talk you through.

Eleanor continued:

I'd say be ready for a lot of frustratingly well-meaning people who won't know what they don't know and think they know a whole lot and are not in it for life. You got to go in and be ready to love and care for yourself, and to not let any school or a system or set of people make you believe you aren't good at what you're doing. You decide what you're good at, what you're not good at, and be willing to look at your own ---- and deal with it and grow and make mistakes. But just because you don't fit a mold, never let that be the reason you think you can't do this job, because it's a hard job, but it's the best job! So, it might be that I don't know. That's an uncooked thought, but that's the first thought I had.

Fanny said:

I would just love to sit down and talk with all incoming educators and just let them know how hard this is going to be. This is hard! It wears you down! But at the end of the day, when you think about why is it that you're willing to go through this really hard, you know that challenging work emotionally that wears you down, why would you do it? And when you think about our kids in front of us, and the fact that we are able to affect the trajectory of where they go to in their lives, that it's worth it. But you have to arm yourself with so many things. And I would say, first of all, know your Black history, because that history quite often has been erased and removed. So, you need to really know historically how our people have been successful and have contributed to the educational process.

Fanny continued:

I think the second thing is, is that you need to read as much as you can on people that are writing about what it's like to develop and create and cultivate anti-racist environments in schools. Because once you have that language and you have that experience, then you can develop that and you can be that.” Fanny completed her thought. “And then I would say the last thing is you need to know your purpose in your why. Why are you here? Because if you are here to represent and make a difference and help you pull along the next generation of kids that look like you ... then you're here for the right reasons. If you're just here to collect the paycheck and you're not passionate about what you're doing, then you shouldn't be doing it.

Horace shared:

So ... them to bring their authentic self to school every day and being their true selves, they should look for a place that's going to allow them to do that. Even if it's not the traditional ideal of education. There is something in them that has allowed them to overcome the fact that our public school system does not treat black students equitably. So, they then have an opportunity to continue to overcome inequities. And I think that's really important that they find a place where they feel like they can they make that impact in children lives.

Richard shared:

Have fun! I think the teaching field is great! Um... But also, be professional, but know you will need a support group. Whether it's other groups of black professionals or a teacher in the building that's a person of color or not a person of color. Gain the respect of your colleagues. Know people watch you, and you don't

know they're watching you, but they watch you! So I think my advice would be... be professional and do your job. Once people see that you're able to do that, they respect you! And then after respect is established in relationships; trust, friendship, and all of those things are able to be built. After the fact, you're not going to go in day one, year one, and start making friends. It's not how it works! You have to go in and show that you can do your job, because if you can't do your job, you're only going to create more work for them. And, I think people can respect other professionals who make their job either easier or don't make their job harder. And it has to be this way!

Each of the six principals may have opportunities to advise Black college graduates pursuing teaching in the White profession takes on the role of mentorship. Charlotte and Edward would encourage the graduate to continue to grow and educate yourself Edward and Fanny would share the realities that majority of people you work with are going to be White and prepare for an emotionally hard job. Eleanor and Richard advise the graduate to get a support group or mentor. Horace says bring your authentic self to work.

Theme 3: Supporting the Retention of Black Teachers

When teachers sign a contract or an agreement to continue to return to work from May to August, this is called “retention.” In the teaching profession, federal and state research focuses on how factors of school characteristics and teacher demographics affect whether teachers stay in their schools, move to different schools, or leave the profession before retirement (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2019). In this reporting, each group of participants shared several commonalities of the importance to retain BT through their school’s hiring practices, and their school’s aligned practices.

Subtheme A: School Site Hiring Practices

In the teaching profession hiring practices are referenced to finding, evaluating, and establishing a working relationship with future teacher candidates. In the process of hiring teachers or BT, practices can be conducted through a conversation, formal or informal interview, or a wide range of educational activities, or a programmatic approach to gain an understanding of the teacher candidate's attitude or academic behavior (Ingersoll, et al., 2019).

Group 1: Instructional Coaches. Coaches have a non-responsibility of directly hiring teachers. During the interview, I asked each coach, "When your school hires a BT, what are you specifically looking for in a teacher?" Elizabeth stated, "In my network, the district sends people over to our school, and my director does the hiring. I am just responsible for the coaching."

Helen shared:

What we look for as I've sat on the hiring committee for the last four years in my building, ... Because our mission and vision speak to building relationships with students, families, and colleagues, and our mission and vision talks about equity, rigorous education, and partnership with families and school and community; Our questions lead us to our candidates really letting us know if they fit the bill for us... I'll be honest with you. We are always excited when a teacher of color applies to our Title I school. We know and we've seen and we've witnessed the value that students find in having someone who looks like them and understand the way that they may experience life. I just think that is so that is so valuable.

Mary shared:

As a network, we are increasing our efforts to find candidates of color. Then we are able to pull them into our network, and then potentially at our school. We don't really have control of who we hire, because our Human Resources get us the people. Then once they come to us, I think our conversations are pretty general around or the same when it comes to; what are your practices as a teacher? How are you ensuring that you have an equitable mindset, regardless of who you are? So, we I think we're looking for a person who understands that you need to be responsive in our school, whether you're Black or White or Latinx. But we value and appreciate when we do get a Black teacher.

All three coaches are only responsible for coaching teachers, and the network and the principal do the hiring. Helen sits on the interviewing committee and looks for someone who can carry out their mission which is to build relationships with their kids. Elizabeth and Mary have no direct contact of the hiring of their school.

Group 2: Assistant Principals: Principals may train the assistant principal to look for key candidate characteristic to work in their school setting. In each interview I asked, “What in particular are you searching for when you hire a BT wanting to work in your Title I school?” Grace said:

The ability to connect with our students, and that they have similar experiences in a Title I school. They need to know the content about their content and practice. Do they have the ability to share their experiences with teachers? Do they have they will or interest in professional development? I am looking for someone that's going to grow into a leader with our staff.

Jovita shared:

Well, of course we have questions that are normally geared to team practices, their background knowledge, and their instructional strategies that are provided from the district. So, the basic questions stay the same, but we have a rating system that rate people based on do they speak another language because that's always a plus if they could speak another language. I want to know are they fair, do they have an open attitude, and those kinds of things.

Septima stated:

Whether they're Black, White, Hispanic, or whatever the race or the cultural background stands for, I'm looking for an effective teacher. I'm looking for a teacher that knows how to articulate themselves, understands diversity in the classroom learning environment, and not just locked into their way of thinking. I'm looking for a specific skill set of pedagogy and has the capacity to expand upon knowledge and skills for students, so that they are not just resting in the average setting. So, I'm looking for a well-rounded individual, who if they don't have the know-how that they're willing to gain the know-how. So, I'm looking for a team player for the students and for the building.

All three assistant principals search for particulars when they hire a BT wanting to work in their Title I school. Grace looks for candidate to have the ability to connect with students, know their content, share their experiences with teachers, and having the mindset to grow into a leader. Jovita prefers someone who speaks more than one language, and able to communicate, is fair and have an open attitude. Septima searches

for a candidate who is articulate, understands diversity, knows pedagogy, and who is a well-rounded team player.

Group 3: Principals: Culturally responsive principal leaders adjust their hiring practices to become equitable and friendly. I asked each principal, “When you hire a Black teacher, what are you particularly searching for and what determines whether they are qualified to teach at your school site?” Charlotte shared:

Well, initially, when I am looking at the applications, I don't really know their race. You can look at some things, but you don't really know at first. So, the two Black teachers I hired, were initially math fellows at my building, and I appreciated their level of professionalism and the kids enjoyed working with them. The gentleman Black teacher, I didn't know from his name or any of that, if he was Black until I actually spoke to him on the phone. I was intentional in hiring him because of his race. However, I really looked to see if he was caring, because my school is in a hard neighborhood that is a challenge for many teachers, so I wanted that male! I could tell that he had a great personality, and I thought that I could teach him to teach, but I wanted to listen to his heart....And you know, just those qualities in him that spoke to caring about students....I knew I could lead him and mold him. So, each of them had something to bring to the table that I needed for my kids.

Edward shared:

So, number one, the candidate has to be culturally responsive and relevant. Number two, they have to be masters of their content. Number three, they have to know my school, so don't come here for a job and not knowing anything about my

school”. “Make sure you know my school. Make sure you know my demographic. Make sure you know something about my data, because it's all public knowledge on CDE website and the school website, and make sure you know the community.

Eleanor shared:

I'm explicitly looking to racially diversify my staff. So obviously, at a teaching level and for the sake of our kids, the desire is for them to have a basic grasp of the classroom and classroom management. But I also think, even that can be taught. I want to know, does the candidate have the right mindsets around kids? Do you have the right mindset about other adults? Are you willing to dig in, love hard on people, and work through stuff? Are you a learner, and do you love learning where you learn publicly with us, and with kids?” Do you have a burgeoning at least understanding of your impact on others, and what it's like to be across the table from yourself? And then some of it's just, fit... a very casual ... very lovey-dovey school who likes to have a lot of fun ...we laugh a lot. And so, you don't need to be extroverted, but you need to have, I think, a spark of joy. I think beyond that, it's a fundamental and shared look across any human. This makes for the opportunity to let a Black candidate become that whole person and thrive. This leaves room for people to look different and show up differently and still be successful.

Fanny said:

No matter who I hire, I'm looking for someone who has really strong instructional practices, but I'm also looking for somebody who has very strong equity tenets and principles that they live by, and that they are planning to teach by. So, when I

hire a Black teacher or any teacher of color, I'm looking for somebody who can be proud of who they are and who identifies as who they are. So, a Black teacher coming in the door, I would anticipate or expect that they would identify as a Black teacher. They would be able to support in developing the identity of the students that are in front of them, and then honor the identities of students of other races as well. Also, I hire teachers that are not afraid to challenge and change their practices, so that they can meet the needs of their students and have their students learn at a high level.

Horace explained:

I particularly search for someone who is a kind of person that has openness to thinking about education and schooling as more than just being about the curriculum, but more being about the kids and their growth. If a Black teacher is a brand new “baby” teacher right out of college, and they have a license, and they never taught before, it's not going to stop me from hiring them if they are able to talk about how they want to teach children ... and also have a social emotional and culturally responsive ideal in their practice of who they are. So, with Black teachers, it's particularly important because we don't have enough Black teachers at our school. And we want to ensure with a fairly large population of Black students that we are seeking out Black teachers.

Richard commented:

Fit and will is a strong factor in hiring a Black teacher at my school.” I found myself in situations where I'm like, do we have any candidates of color when we look at all these resumes? It's usually no, but in the event that we do have one, it

is really exciting to see! ... How that person shows up in an interview process compared to their peers... and I always say we have a candidate of color that is qualified, shows up well in the interview process, and they usually win the process, like I rarely have a candidate of color and a White candidate that I just can't decide between the two, right! ...It's rarely like this... identical kind of existence ... will you have a qualified African-American candidate or candidate who is White; the candidate of color usually is more dynamic. They usually are more compelling in their why? I've observed that they are more of an affinity for kids, and for the work that we do. So usually by the time they make it to me and my interview process, they've already won.

All six principals have more control of hiring BT compared to instructional coaches and assistant principals. Charlotte, Edward, Fanny, and Horace look for BT who are culturally responsive and equity minded. Eleanor and Richard look for a friendly and fun BT who have the right mindset of students and adults and has a basic grasp of the classroom.

Subtheme B: School Aligned Practices

In the teaching profession, implementing evidenced-based supports such as professional learning communities, curriculum resources, leadership opportunities, and affinity groups are ideal supports used to foster BT retention (Khalifa, 2018). Each SL explained the practices that are aligned through their school that would help support and retain BT.

Group 1: Instructional Coaches: In an ideal support system coaching and mentoring are mandates for new teachers, and more so BT. While interviewing each coach, I asked, “What kind of mentoring, onboarding, induction programs or affinity

groups are provided for BT once they are hired at your school site?" Elizabeth said, "We do have an affinity group that meets like once a month. Our teacher can receive coaching when they think they need it, and during the summer, they attend a training from our network." Helen explained, "Currently mentorship, onboarding, induction programs are all done by me. We don't have any current affinity groups in our building, nor do we don't have 'star' mentors this year." Mary shared, "Yes, we have affinity groups outside our school, and people can feel like they have a group to talk to and problem solve or whatever it is."

After asking about what kind of mentoring, onboarding, induction programs or affinity groups are provided for BT once they are hired at your school site, Elizabeth's school has an affinity group that meets once a month along with coaching when needed, and the new teachers attend a network summer training. Helen's district did not provide mentors, but she is responsible for mentoring, onboarding, and the induction process once BT are hired at her school.

During each interview, I asked each to "Describe an ideal support system that would entail at their Title I school for BT if they were given a magic wand". Elizabeth responded, "I think we try to make sure that we have PD that is connected to equity, and then all of our teachers get support based on their particular need. ... We try to individualize the support that they get." Helen said:

I think freedom and latitude are needed to get the standards mastered in multiple ways. I think about the system of public education, and how it's really tailored to Whites, in particular White female teachers and White students. But knowing that

it's created in different ways, because that they know their students at such a deep level.

Mary said:

It would entail... coaches and school leaders who have receive supports on being culturally responsive in their practices with adults are leaders. Not only just semi-aware that the world looks different for teachers of color, but like are actively seeking out feedback from teachers of color for how the space can be more inclusive for them. By default, is inclusive for White teachers, so to have leadership that knows that you're good.

All coaches described an ideal support system needed for BT at their Title I school.

Elizabeth would want her support system to have a professional connected to equity and support to meet BT individual needs. Helen knows the system is tailored to White women, so the ideal support system should include freedom and latitude. Mary's ideal system would include SL and coaches who have receive supports on being culturally responsive.

Group 2: Assistant Principal: Black educational leaders are needed to assist with incoming aligned practices that support BT. I asked each assistant principal, "What kind of mentorship, onboarding, induction programs, and affinity groups do you have for Black teachers once they're at your school?" Grace made this statement: "It's only induction through PD or through a mentor that's provided by our school to that teacher. That's it. There's nothing specifically for people of color." Jovita shared:

The district assigns their mentor through PD. Once they're hired on our school site, we will do anything we can to support them. If they need to go to

professional development, we'll give them the time off to attend. If they supplemental support from another school, we'll make time and the arrangements for them to go to that school.

Septima shared:

When I'm hiring Black teachers, the expectation is always going to be that we're going to provide you with someone who has the knowledge to support you in this new learning environment. But we're also going to make sure that there's an understanding of what the expectations are, and how the expectations can or cannot be affected according to your personal goals and standards and professionalism. Our district's induction programs will follow so their structures can be effective, because of what they may have experienced in their own lives.

Grace, Jovita, and Septima all shared that, once teachers are hired at their school site, there are no formal hiring or induction practices provided to new teacher or BT. They only formal training or professional development is done by the district during the summer before the start of the new school year. Jovita stated that her school will allow their new teachers to attend professional development when it is available.

Also, I asked each assistant principal, "Here is a magic wand! So, imagine creating an ideal support system for Black teachers, what would it entail?" Grace said, "Well, we would have more leaders of color in our school district to support our teachers of color. Also, it would include cultural competency training for all teachers, even Caucasian teachers." Jovita explained:

There would be more professional development to support their interests. We would find more ways to honor our Black teachers. And we would want to honor

them by sharing some of their ideas or getting the things that they might need in the classroom.

Septima said:

Entailing leadership, teachers, superintendents, coaches, as supporters of seeing a picture of themselves. Include support and the resources not just from a financial standpoint, but from an emotional standpoint. Have comraderies in collaboration. So Black Teachers can learn from the openness of everyone's experiences and backgrounds.

All three assistant principals' imaginary created ideal support system for BT focused on school improvement. Grace and Septima's ideal support system includes more Black leaders of color to support our teachers of color, and culturally competency training, and emotional supports for all teachers regardless of their race. Jovita's ideal support system includes professional development to support BT's interests, more ways to honor our BT, and supplying needed classroom resources.

Group 3: Principals: Principal SL commonly prefer mentors to be involved in the emotional support and development of BT. During the interviews, I asked, "What kind of mentorship, onboarding, induction programs, or affinity groups are provided for BT once they are hired at your school site?" Charlotte said:

I'll give all hires the same supports regardless of their race. They're going to get the same mentorship, but my Black teachers and teachers of color be on my radar. I know I will have some teachers struggle in culturally responsive practices. So, I'm always following up a little bit more with teachers of color. I stay on top of getting informed and following-up on what's happening in my school. Also,

teachers are helped to navigate through challenging district and school policies and procedures through an onboarding process. We go over the handbook, and again with their mentor or buddy. We have an open door policy, which is why we meet with them immediately. So, if they have any questions or concerns, they can ask questions, we listen, and we unpack their questions with them. If the Black teacher or any teacher struggles, we do our best to make adjustments with the intent to keep our teachers of color.

Edward shared:

First, I email all of our new teachers an invitation to meet with me for a one to one in-person meet and greet. I introduce myself, introduce my leads, and provide a welcome package that includes school spirit swag. Then, once all of the new staff is hired, I have a welcoming onboarding lunch and share my expectations and assign their electronic devices. Then they attend a district level new staff onboarding training that occurs three weeks before the new school year, and they are given an opportunity to meet their team members, mentor or buddy, and then together tour our building.

Eleanor shared:

The onboarding and induction stuff is all about self-awareness. Sharing my own self-awareness, talking about race, and making it okay to talk about race will matter to Black teachers. Making it okay to be yourself, providing a place that is diverse where people see others that share the same racial identity matters. It makes it comfortable there are other Black teachers who have come and stayed and made a home. I think that's critical. There have been times I've tried to partner

a mentorship with other Black leaders where I know that a racial connection would be really important. And to make sure that I don't assume that we will have everything everyone needs in the mentorship space inside our own school walls. And so really utilizing the network for that has been important.

Fanny shared:

We have affinity groups, a mentor program, and if you're brand new to the school, we have a Partners in Education Program where we partner our new teachers with a teacher that's been in the building for a long time. And ideally, of course, if it's a teacher of color, we tried to pair them with another teacher of color. Also, we have provided many opportunities where teachers have been able to attend an equity conference through Teacher's College. Those conferences that we've had throughout this year have been really powerful and have been, a game changer. Then we also have our continuous racial consciousness training through an equity consulting company.

Horace said:

Yeah, I would say the mentorship, onboarding and induction is not necessarily a strong suit of our school. This is an area that we are working on improving. I think supporting Black teachers of the critical professional development comes back to kind of that idea of providing the campus that relationship piece first, and then also finding out what their own needs are. We do professional development that's very focused on academic by the book. And then we do a lot of culturally responsive professional development as well.

Richard shared:

So, we require of all, a two year induction that we offer ourselves as separate from the district, that we designed and execute ourselves. The first year and second year of the new teachers ... you're either new to the profession regardless of the years of experience, or new to the building, your attendance is mandated. We provide a mentorship or a buddy, and onboarding. During this induction, there's an affinity space built into this practice. As far as professional development outside of induction, we do facilitate our own professional development as well. So, we're making sure we're continuing to build capacity to retain our staff. Once they're hired.

All six principals provide mentorship, onboarding, induction programs, and affinity/equity groups to all support BT outcomes. Charlotte, Edward, Fanny, and Eleanor all provide a buddy or mentor and district onboarding, and all four principals pay a little bit more attention to new BT to ensure equities are met. Edward invites all new hires to meet one-to-one to discuss expectations, provide them with a gift of school spirit swag. Horace mentioned his onboarding practices is an area of improvement. Richard's school offers a two year induction for all teachers which includes an affinity space.

During each interview, I asked each principal to imagine creating the ideal support system for black teachers. Each shared what it would entail. Charlotte said,

As Black people, we have to be chameleons, and we have to switch that flip that sometimes when we're around ourselves, some things we say are truly appreciated and are understood. But we have to know when we're in these types of environments, we can't say those things out loud ... people will hear you ... and

know that the system is not changing. New Black teachers need to have a specific training to teach how to survive their audience like chameleons. So, I would create the ideal support system that includes culturally responsive training, a mentor, content professional development, and an emotional support system.

Edward shared:

Support for Black teachers would include: An investment in their ability to deliver high quality and rigorous instruction; ensuring their ability to access and utilize their skills and experiences; investing in them to have the ability to advocate for themselves; and to be a champion for themselves and their own children as well as that for others. Also, have a specific way and trajectory for them to grow and improve in their craft, even if that means just becoming a master teacher or moving into lead teacher role. That's what that would look like.

Eleanor said:

I think with a magic wand, I would love to have more Black leaders alongside me to step in and stand alongside my development of my Black teachers. Again, in the mentor space, I think a part of being a good leader and a good White leader of Black teachers is to understand where my limits will lie.

Fanny expressed:

It would entail a more diverse teaching body; have more black teachers that are in that culture and environment so that they're not alone; and it would entail having affinity spaces for teachers of color. It would also include a lot of professional development, and an emotional support system that focuses on healing.

Horace shared:

It would include a relationship piece ... a support system that allows them to be feel comfortable and be incorporated in the school community as who they are, not as who they think they're supposed to be based on traditional school communities. Then it would include a system that really has a strong mix of supports that allow Black teachers to challenge the things that are going on around them that they see as wrong or as needing to change. The Black teachers would have a voice to create change and be straight forward about academic support and emotional personal support. There would be mutual respect and ability to speak openly and freely to talk about their opinions around the school.

Richard responded:

It would include more time! A required mentorship structure starting at year one...That doesn't end until year five. In return, mentor someone the same way they received it. Then it would include opportunities to connect the network with other like educators across not only the building, but in the system. There would also be a safe space to create, but also decompress.

Each of the six principals created an ideal support system. Charlotte, Edward, Eleanor, and Fanny's system would include culturally responsive training, a mentor, content professional development, and an emotional support system. Horace would include a relational piece for comfort in allowing BT to be who they are, provide the space would allow BT challenge wrongs, and a space to allow BT to create change with emotional support. Richard would include more time, a mentorship, opportunities to extend their network, and allow a space to create and decompress.

Subtheme C: Equitable Opportunities

In this study, equitable refers to being fair and impartial towards marginalized individuals. In retaining BT in Title I schools, equitable opportunities or circumstances make it possible for BT to be retained by gaining leadership experiences (Gay, 2000). SL in this study shared their perspective on what level of engagement of a BT influences their decision to provide them with leadership opportunities.

Group 1: Instructional Coaches: Coaches can provide leadership through mentoring to support BT. I asked each coach, “What kinds of supports are provided to BT to ensure that are not facing inequalities or inequities? Elizabeth said, “I provide every teacher the same amount of coaching time, so that I can make myself available for more teachers.” Helen shared:

I know how important it is to have BT in our school...our students are dependent on having them as role models and parent figures, so I tell them what I know about our district’s monthly affinity group. During my coaching sessions, I am as clear as I can be ...open...and honest. I know teaching is a hard job, so I sometimes do ask other veteran Black teachers who have been working in my school for decades to take them under their wings.”

Each of the three coaches’ supports are needed to help BT not facing inequalities or inequities. Elizabeth provides teachers with an equal amount of coaching time. Helen provides open and transparent coaching session and ask other BT to be a support. Helen tells them about her network’s monthly working equity groups.

While interviewing, I wanted to know what determines how BT gain leadership opportunities such as becoming team leads, department chairs, or club sponsors. So, I

asked each coach, “What level of teacher engagement of a BT influences your decision to provide them with leadership opportunities?” Elizabeth shared:

So, we look for teacher demonstrated competencies in the curriculum and development of instruction to see if a teacher would be interested in coaching apprentice teachers. Then we also have teachers who aware that they can come to us if they're interested in leadership. We also asked teachers during our midyear evaluation conversations would they like to do...? Also, we asked teachers what are their career goals are like in three to five years. If that is something they mention that they're interested in leadership at our school, then we include that in further conversations with that teacher.

Helen shared:

My principal consistently encourage all teachers to step up into leadership roles. Whether that be through our equity team, our PBIS team, our MTA team, our guiding coalition, which is kind of like a large forum leadership team. We have representatives from every grade level and every content. So, it's kind of that large group forum that comes together and makes decisions that affect all students and all staff in a building.

Mary stated:

Personally advocate... Is it personal, and I can't say there's been situations that are like... I have encouraged teachers to seek out positions that they felt like would benefit them ... regardless of if it is in our network or not.

All three coaches understand that teacher engagement may determine leadership opportunities for BT. Elizabeth and Helen acknowledged how BT can gain leadership

opportunities at their schools. Elizabeth's school look for BT with competency in the curriculum and the development of instruction, and they must have an interest in coaching apprentice teachers. Helen's principal now consistently encourages all teachers to step up into school leadership roles. Mary does not advocate for BT to take on leadership because she feels that would be a personal matter.

Group 2: Assistant Principal. When assistant principal chair campus level onboarding or induction they provide supports to eliminate inequalities or inequities for BT. I also explored, "What kinds of supports are provided to BT to ensure that they are not facing inequities or inequities?" Grace shared:

When new teachers are hired in the Southlands district, they attend a summer induction program three weeks before school starts called, "PD." The new teachers are receiving professional development on instructional practices and district expectations. There isn't a whole lot of teaching about culture or equity, but they receive resource and listen to a keynote speaker give a motivational presentation.

Jovita stated: "We really don't have that problem because we make sure the playing field is equal for everyone." Septima responded:

One of the biggest things that I think is very important for our teachers of color is the understanding of the different backgrounds that they are approaching, So, from a cultural look, or from our development as black teachers; people are always setting their boundaries. I would like for them to understand is the variety of values and standards of others ...So instead of keeping them just in the black

culture language or the black tone, or what we feel would be a cultural aspect that lends to that teacher's response in actions, giving them a broad understanding. Each of the three assistant principal supports varied to BT to ensure they are not facing inequities or inequalities. Grace's BT attend a three week summer non-equity or culturally responsive professional development session before the start of the school year. Jovita's BT are not facing inequalities or inequities issues. Septima wants her teachers of color to understand the different backgrounds that they are approaching, and she wants her BT to step out of the Black culture and gain a broad understanding.

I asked each assistant principal, "What level of teacher engagement of a BT influences your decision to provide them with leadership opportunities?" Grace shared:

I think it has a little bit to do with their ability to be organized, use engagement strategies, and stand out when it comes to everything from PLCs or professional development. Do they have some coachability and do they help and support other staff around the building? Do they have an interest in leading professional development, and are seeking out their own professional development, and do they desire to coach other?

Jovita shared:

My other Black teacher, she gets involved in anything she can. That's just the way she is. She wants to be a part of everything. Because she's in it for the kids, she's in it for the right reason. So, she wants to be involved in everything...But the only time I would say that race will determine the outcome of a project or task that I assign to either of those Black teachers to help in our mentoring program. My Black female teacher usually work well with a Black female student.

Septima shared:

A black teacher or otherwise, I'm looking for their talent and their passion.

Because I know from that point, they're going to be able to dig into it and give us the 110%. Then that influence will not only just be set with them, but they'll be able to share with others and build upon it. Then on the opposite side of that, if there's something that I see in a Black teacher that needs to be developed, or can be developed, or there's potential there, that's something that influences my decision.

The three assistant principal's decision to provide BT with leadership opportunities varied. Grace willingness to provide BT leadership opportunities is determined from their professional traits and work habits. Jovita's BT is in education for the kids, and she include her BT in their school's mentoring program. Septima allowed BT leadership opportunities when they have talent and passion to dig into it and give us a 110%.

Group 3 Principals: I asked each principal, "What kinds of support do you provide to BT to ensure they are not facing inequalities or inequities?" Charlotte stated:

Because of the very low social economics of our students, we're very fortunate at my school to be in a very diverse and equally distributed demographic school...almost equally diverse school. But because I want to also be a good leader, I work a lot on my soft skills. And what I mean is that is... I deal with people. It is not that the workplace is not professional, but it's making sure that we know our audience. So, if we're having a challenge with a parent of a different race, sometimes I do have to ensure that my Black teachers know their audience.

Edward said:

It starts in the interview process. Sometimes Black candidates do not come in with the same or similar experiences as White candidates ... because there's a skills gap there. It isn't because the staff of color don't have the ability. It's a skills gap because there are some experiences that Black people do not have that White people may have. So, one of the things we started to unpack from the interview process itself is how we ask questions.

If we know we want to have a Black teacher and there is a gap, we make sure that we were capable of filling that gap.

Edward continued:

So, what we do is ask this person are they're strong in management, but they're going to struggle a little bit in instruction, in delivering content, and we would agree. As a team, we will hire this person because we need their presence. But as soon as they get hired, we need to have a conversation about some of the gaps we saw. So, I will take it upon myself once we hire that person is to have a one-on-one conversation, and immediately tell them why they were hired and give them feedback specifically on the area of concern for us, so they may work with their mentor, their department chair, their administrator, or the counselor of their grade level.”

Eleanor shared:

But what I also know, I can do right every day, is offer a place that is willing to speak when inequities happen. And at best, not a place where those experiences have to be the same way they are outside of our walls. Our school is a special

place that you can come and be loved ... And it doesn't mean you're not going to experience micro-aggressions from others. It doesn't mean you're not still going to have to work through systematic inequities and discord that still exists as a person of color. I'm a White leader, so I'm still leading on those standards without a doubt. But at our core, I would hope that the conditions feel like belonging... like Black teachers belong.

Fanny shared:

I think that one of the things that you have to constantly do is ... you have to open yourself up to being there for them and checking in with your Black teachers. I think that we can't just assume people make a lot of assumptions about how people are doing. But I think when you do a one-on-one check-in to make sure that they're OK. Also, that you're constantly being willing to run interference when they're in situations where things are hard for them, or they're being marginalized. As a leader, you must shut down things for different reasons. You have to be the person that is able to confront the other person, or you have to also be the person that comes in the door and is willing to run interference and protect them.

Horace commented:

Yeah, I think that the coaching process is really important to build relationships. To me, having strong relationships with all of the teachers, but specifically with teachers of color, it's important to build a relationship, and to have kind of open and comfortable arenas for them to provide feedback and to talk about things that are that are coming to them; where there they are seeing in inequality or inequity

and where it's impacting them. So, you know, I think that it's been aside from the conversation with their coach, these things come up first, and then the coach and I talk more regularly about what's going on in with specific teachers, and more so Black teachers.

Richard responded:

Um... Space, time and opportunity to be heard if needed. I also... Share.

Umm... I think my understanding and knowing what it's like to walk in their shoes is a resource and has power and storytelling. I often find myself telling stories from when I was a teacher. You know, I try to make connections to the things that they are currently experiencing or encountering to provide some sort of relief, reassurance, and as well as positive reinforcement.

All six principals' perception of supports differ to ensure BT are not facing inequalities or inequities. Charlotte works on her soft skills in order to become a support herself to ensure BT know their audience. Edward recognizes proactive supports are needed for BT during hiring to support their skills gap. Eleanor would offer a place for BT to speak their truth when inequities happen. Fanny offers her support through check-ins with her BT regarding their wellness. Horace would offer a coaching process to build relationships through feedback and have meaningful conversations. Richard support would allow BT voices to be heard through the power of storytelling.

During the interviews, I asked each principal, "What level of teacher engagement of a black teacher influences your decision to provide them with leadership opportunities?" Charlotte responded:

So, leadership ranges from mentoring a student teacher from one of the universities to playing out a great ideal like starting an after school club, wanting to present professional development, mentor a struggling student, a committee member, or a team. So, with all of my teachers, I look at a lot of personal factors as well as their levels of knowledge within the school to see are they prepared for additional duties or leadership duties. As for my black teachers, I make sure their classroom instruction and management is solid before taking on any additional tasks. This way, if and when they leave my building, they will be able to teach anywhere.

Edward shared:

Any leadership opportunity that they can take on... that is great for themselves. If those departments are already filled, you can take on a new student club, coach a sport, develop a parent community event, become a tech support, or join a committee. You have the opportunity to create anything you want to showcase yourself as a leader. And that includes asking to shadow an administrator to learn how to be a leader. So, for me, all one has to do is say is, Hey, I would like some leadership opportunities.

Eleanor said:

Well, as our staff diversifies, our leadership diversifies. The gentleman who is Black, is my dean, and was initially hired as our student support specialist. The woman who is one of our teacher coaches, director of curriculum and instruction, began at our school as the front office assistant. Our seventh grade social studies teacher is the department chair for humanities. And to me really, it is about

ensuring and consciously thinking about all the time, when I have an opportunity, who am I offering it to and how am I talking to them about it. And am I spending time eliciting what those opportunities are that our teachers want. Hey, we don't have a lot of leaders of color in the instructional space, and definitely a lot of Black men get shoveled into the dean's space. It's a beautiful space, and it is wonderful to have Black men and women leading in that space. I've worked with my two main teacher coaches this year on how adults hold a vision for themselves beyond what they originally imagined.

Fanny said:

Well, when I think about leadership opportunities within the school ... I'm looking at leadership opportunities for all teachers across the building. I'm really paying attention to what those opportunities look like for my Black teachers and teachers of color, because that's going to be unique. When determining the outcome of a project assigned to a Black teacher, one of the things that I know about Black teachers is that Black teachers are warm demanders. And I think allowing people to understand what it means and what the characteristics are of a warm demander is something that allows a Black teacher to gain a status or prominence in an environment where sometimes they're marginalized and not seen or heard because White teachers are going to change the rules of engagement when you're thinking about what it's like to live in an educational environment. And you have to always be mindful of that and make sure you're breaking down those barriers so that Black teachers can come to the table with their brilliance and their excellence at all times.

Horace shared:

Our school is working on providing more leadership opportunities for all of our teachers. We are trying to figure out what that looks like and what that means. I know as we do, we will be inclusive of the different racial and ethnic backgrounds of our teachers. To me, part of leadership opportunities is a level of comfort with the general task of teaching. I wouldn't want someone who's really struggling with their classroom practice every day to have more on their plate, and to have them take on additional leadership responsibilities as well. So sometimes it also looks like us thinking about who do we want to fill into this role, and how do we encourage them. To give an example, my leadership team and I are looking for a summer school program leader. We need a strong teacher who has good relationships in the community and is someone who a lot of teachers look up to. While thinking through this, I know it would be wonderful to have a leader of color in that spot. And specifically, our fifth grade Black teacher came into my mind to lead our summer program. We offered, and she said yes.

Richard shared:

So, in my school, you are required to participate in at least one committee outside of the school day. In addition, you are required to engage in PLCs, and you are required to engage in prospective student events. So, the opportunities for leadership are there if a Black teacher wants to step into those opportunities. Otherwise, I think participation is the bare minimum that we expect BT to be engaged in year. You're always invited to school events, basketball games,

football games, and school dances. Also, I do have a Black gentleman leading a PLC.

Three principals, Charlotte, Edward, and Richard's leadership opportunities are mentoring others, managing an after school club or coaching a sport, present professional development, and become a team or committee member. Eleanor leadership opportunities can become roles such as a dean, director of curriculum and instruction, department chair. Fanny provides leadership opportunities for all teachers across the board by joining a committee. Horace is developing ways to provide leadership opportunities for his staff.

Focus Group

The focus group consisted of 4 participants, each from different Colorado school districts. There were 3 principals and 1 assistant principal, and two were female, and two were male. All participants' age ranged from 31 – 45. One principal has a doctorate degree, whereas the other three have master's degree. The least amount of experience working in a Title I school is 8 years. The least amount of years of being a SL is 5 years. The focus group occurred after each individual interview was analyzed. The participants were invited to attend the focus group discussion based on a ranking score from their responses of their individual interviews. Once each participant in each group's data was completely analyzed, each participant received a ranking score ranging from 3 being the highest and 1 being the lowest. In this study, each participant received a 3 ranking score or a 2.5 ranking score.

The focus group protocol initially consisted of 5 questions. After analyzing the data from the individual interviews, it was discovered the data collection was rich and thick with practices and strategies that SL use to support BT. Therefore, the focus group

discussion was facilitated with only 3 of 5 initial interview questions. The focus group discussion consisted of 3 questions that support the central question: How SL in Title I schools develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site?

Once the focus group participants accepted the invitation, each participant was sent an information letter and the Bill of Rights. The focus group was recorded via Zoom and lasted for 72 minutes. Before starting the actual interview, the information letter and the Bill of the Rights was read to the four participants. An opportunity for each participant to introduce themselves was provided, if preferred, and the camera being on or off was also optional. None of the participants formally introduced themselves, and only one participant's camera was on the entire time. One of the participant's camera was off the entire time. The other two participants turned their cameras on and off at their discretion, but for the most part of the interview, their cameras were on.

Before asking the first question, how the facilitation of the discussion would work was modeled. The interview was informal and was a semi-discussion among the four participants. For instance, a few details like were explained: Using the Zoom tool, please place your preferred name you would want to be called by the other participants. The 10 second pause strategy was explained, which is a wait time practice to think before you speak. Both strategies provided a structured or sequence of conducting a quality interview to ensure the interview was conducted with creditability and with integrity.

The focus group participant and role, the length of the focus group and transcript report, and the focus group major themes and questions are displayed in Tables 7-9. The results are reported in 3 themes: How Leadership Develop BT; Influences for Success; How SL use Retention Supports. Next, one question is placed with each theme. Then the

viewpoints, thoughts, experiences, and quotes of each participant is shared. After the sharing of each participant, the discussion and the summary are presented for the focus group.

Table 7

Focus Group Participant and Role

Participant	Role
Eleanor	Middle School Director
Horace	PreK-8 Director
Richard	High School Principal
Septima	Middle School Assistant Principal

Note: All focus group participants are employed in different Colorado school districts.

Table 8

Length of the Focus Group and Transcript

Duration (minutes)	Single-line spaced Transcript pages
72.57	14

Table 9

Focus Group Major Themes and Questions

Major Themes	Questions
Theme 1: Impacting Black Teacher Development	What practices and strategies do you incorporate to educate and develop your staff about marginalized people?
Theme 2: Influencing Black Teachers To Success	What role, if any, do you think race plays in the influence or impact in building relationships with Black teachers?
Theme 3: Supporting the Retention of Black Teachers	Regarding Black teachers' retention, when do you provide Black teachers opportunities to become visible and heard while sharing their experiences, perceptions or realities with the school community?

Theme 1: The Impact of Black Teachers

Leadership develop BT through as instructional practices, culturally responsive practices, and leadership practices. Leadership development helps BT gain a skills of teaching strategies, gain a self-awareness and awareness of others, and opportunities to grow and mature into an effective team player or a team lead. I asked, “What practices and strategies do you incorporate to educate and develop your staff about marginalized people?” Eleanor shared:

I know I need to also remain in the learner seat myself, because there's a space I always mean to and want to get better at especially acknowledging that I am not Black, and so my desire to lead a strong Black staff and to retain my incredible Black community members is of utmost importance to me.

Model and for our team to use is to talk about race, to honor it and celebrate it, and not pretend that not only race, but particularly for our Black staff members, doesn't play a role in shaping what our staff members are coming to school with every day as they've particularly in the last year and a half.

Moving our campus equity working group to be led by one of our team member and to take myself out of it, no matter how close I am with my team, the power dynamic that I bring in the door just by virtue of my title is going to impact conversation. And giving that team the space and license to run with the way that we engage in our equity conversations and race conversations has probably been the best thing I've done.

Our equity working group and therefore our equity work is led by a person of color, but the equity working group is made up of a blend of the races that make up our staff. And it has been my primary focus in hiring to find diversity and add it to our team. And the focus of that being racial diversity, our student body is incredibly diverse.

We work to ensure that we are truly diverse and there is no singular majority racially in our staff makeup, it's critical that those people who would be most likely to be marginalized on our team are leading the charge.

Horace shared:

We talk about gender identity starting at third grade with our students, and we talk about self-expression starting very young with kids and work too.

We do trainings with our staff on how to work with gender identity questions, because issues do start to come up for kids as young as kindergarten, where we have kids who present as a boy and ask to be treated as a girl or they say, "I am a girl."

When we are speaking about equity that we do consider the needs of kids and developmentally we're working with as they grow into their identity whether that's a racial identity, a sexual identity, gender identity, or any other aspect of their identity. Also, their cultural identity, language identity, all of those pieces, we create space for those conversations to happen among kids in a way that's

developmentally appropriate or that's responsive to what their questions and needs are.

Allowing our staff to be comfortable to talk about their own identities, so that kids can see themselves in staff members. Regardless of who the kids are, that there is someone in the building that they can see themselves in.

Richard shared:

I chose to be a learner alongside my staff when we discussed and engaged in our equity work.

I allow any staff member in the building who's passionate about the work to lead the work. There's no racial requirement or preference. So, I do have White staff members who have volunteered to be a part of the equity work, and I do have staff members of color who have volunteered to be a part of equity work.

We've pulled students into the equity conversation at our school and we've also facilitated a student panel where staff members will literally sit and share their issues with the students and students engaged in that conversation so we felt that bringing students into the conversation was very powerful. And we pulled in students of color, Black, Brown, all to be a part of the conversation with their teachers, with staff, to just share what they've experienced in that.

But myself as a leader of color, I would not hire a white person to facilitate that work. I wouldn't bring an outside consultant in who was not a person of color, but I think the professionalism and the camaraderie amongst staff is strong enough that if we have a White staff member who is passionate about the work and would like to be a part of the work, we absolutely welcome them to be a part of work. And if it results in them being out in front of staff members, facilitating and engaging, that's very much so welcome because, again, they're not a stranger, they are part of our family. And we do encourage all voices and say, "Speak up." I think it would be in poor taste to limit which staff members are able to lead the equity work in any space.

Septima shared:

The thought process is that Black teachers are treated in a manner that allows them to express their expectations or beliefs, but in a professional manner.

So, knowing that teachers have a vast majority of beliefs, standards, we'd like to align ourselves back to our goals of learning and our expectations. So, making sure as we make decisions, we talk through equities and opportunities and always lead back to our goals of learning and our expectations for our students and families.

There is a very sound structure or foundation in place that reiterates our focus and goal so that there is not a line that is crossed that may be inappropriate or condescending or defensive towards others.

Eleanor, Horace, and Richard all choose to be in the learner's seat through modeling the use of race talks, honoring race, and celebrating race; and consider the identity needs and self-expression through safe conversation spaces. Eleanor and Horace allow staff to comfortably talk about their own identities, so they can become an identifier to the kid in the school who relates to them. Richard pulls in students to engage into the equity conversations to share how they experience race, and Richard will not hire a white person to facilitate equity work and he uses the knowledge of the staff to facilitate and engage in equity work. Septima incorporates the act of using the thought process that BT are allowed to express their expectations or beliefs professionally while aligning the staff back to learning goals and expectations.

Theme 2: Influences That Lead Black Teachers Succeed

Influences that help BT succeed can be internal motivational influences from school leaders, cultural influences from the inner school community, and relational influences that are catalyst of driving success. Internal motivational influences from school leaders can help drive BT inner confidence to reach a desired outcome. Relational influences are internal feelings derived from lived experience and outwardly shared to help others avoid the enactment of a negative experience. Following are perceptions of the focus group SL of how race influence or impact in building relationships with BT.

Eleanor responded:

It's been important in building trust to be humble and honest about what role I will never play and to be okay with that decision. Part of building a diverse open team and diverse teaching team is so that my team members can connect with Black

mentors no matter of their race. So, I make it a point that my two black administrators know I play a different role in the life of my Black teachers.

The acknowledgement, the clarity, the humility, and the acceptance of what you do and don't play speaks truth; and then I can still be a role model...and still have wonderful talks with my Black staff members. We signed licenses of love and humanity, and I feel that there is no barrier there, but it is an acknowledgement that's critical in order for trust to be present.

Horace responded:

I think race absolutely can impact building relationships with Black teachers. I'm a person who's benefited from racist systems in my whole life and have been able to get to the place that I am partially because of benefiting from those systems. And so, I think that that means that I can't take for granted that my race does impact the way that I interact with others or the way that they may perceive me.

I think in building relationships with Black teachers, that there's an absolute need to build trust and to create space for conversations about race, but also that needs to not be the only dimension of our relationship. I understand that a Black teacher is a whole person and as a professional, I need to show some vulnerability and to not shy away from approaching subjects that focus on race.

I also need to ensure that that's not the entirety of our relationship or the entirety of our conversations or our work together, is not all surround by only race.

Richard responded:

I'm a black leader, and I don't view myself as being in a position which I have to do extraordinary things to retain Black teachers. Now, what I have implemented across my entire system is that we do have "stay" conversations with all staff members at the mid-year point. And those conversations have the ability for some authenticity to take place? So, showing appreciation for the work that you've observed of teachers and other staff members is just a normal part of the experience as a professional at my school. We started "stay" conversations maybe a year ago, and our retention has been the best retention in a district once we started "stay" conversations, however, "stay" conversations are not only attended for Black staff but for all staff. Then the only reason people left is because they were either relocating out of state or they were changing careers.

I do have listening sessions that I host monthly for staff. At least, when we were in-person, I would buy lunch once a month for staff, and they would RSVP come and talk about whatever it is they wanted to talk about.

I do an anonymous survey mid-year to collect data about myself. It's not required. Then after I do my evaluation, I actually create action steps to say, "Based on your feedback, these are the things that I'm going to do." And I try to make those things explicit. Like you will see me do X, Y, Z based on A, B, C." This gives an opportunity to show my staff members that I'm listening to them.

As a leader of color, I don't host "race" events. I'm very careful not to do things like host lunches only for the educators of color and establish it as a color to building, because I think people will be waiting to call me out on a behavior: Like, "Oh, we knew this was going to happen. Why is this lunch or this meeting only for the Black teachers?" Because at the end of the day, everyone wants to feel like they belong. Everyone wants to feel welcome and everyone wants to be seen. So, I'm really careful not to specifically target certain demographic groups.

When I do things, everyone is welcome and entitled to it, but I do try to informally make sure that I'm visible everywhere in the building. And then when I do stop by the room of a Black teacher, I do check- in to just see how things are going, which I do with all staff. When I interact with a Black teacher, it's a different interaction even from me. My guard goes down, and I'm a little more relaxed when I'm interacting with a Black teacher. I just think that's cultural because I know that I'm not in danger in that interaction. There's no perception that someone will have... no one's going to run back to the water cooler after that conversation and have negative things to say about that interaction. I think, it is the nature of the job... It's just a familiar interaction. So that's the best way I can describe it.

At the end of the day, I'm a leader, but I'm aware of my blackness, and I have to also be aware of that in my leadership moves. I'm very careful with how I show up to things. The way that I show up and how I look, because of my race, removes

a lot of barriers and walls for an educator of color or a Black educator that they normally have to navigate the school district system or building, or community.

I'm very careful with how I interact in my community. I interact with White students the same way I interact with Black students, with Brown students, with Asian students. Anyone can come up to me, "Hey, Mr. Richard, "Good Morning." And I, "Hey, good morning. How are you? How was your night? How was the game yesterday? Did you watch the game?" I mean, every kid greets me the same way in my building. There's some kids who are just like, "Oh, Mr. Richard, you're just the best." And they want to come give me a hug. Every kid doesn't hug me. That's okay. Every kid knows that I am consistently available across the board for all kids, no matter what your race is, your background, or any kind of identity.

I want to always be consistent, and I treat everybody as a human being, and not really change myself because of their race or what I perceive of their identity. For example, I've once had a kid tell me that they've been in school where the vernacular of the leadership would change based on the kid they were interacting with. They said a leader had a Black voice to interact with Black kids and a White voice to interact with White kids, and a voice that he only used with military kids, where he would stand at attention and stop. And I'm just like ... that's just really inappropriate!

Be who you are and I'll be who I am, but who you are is not going to dictate how I interact with you. I'm going to treat you like a human being and respect your dignity no matter who you are. So, I mean, that's just what I'm conscious of... And what's interesting is everyone else seems to be conscious of it as well, because I've gotten positive feedback from teachers.

I accept honest and direct feedback which is usually positive. Not to say that it isn't bias feedback, but they'll just say, "You know what? I've always wanted to just let you know that I really appreciate that you say X or D and Y. Or I really am having a great experience here and just want to let you know that." Which is good for me to hear as well because at the end of the day, we want to know that people feel supported and they feel welcome and are happy in their job as a teacher in your building.

Septima responded:

I think race can influence or impact building relationship with Black teachers only because sometimes we think about this with our students in regards of seeing examples of ourselves within specific roles or within specific positions. And I think that for some of our teachers to see a person of color or even a female person of color in a role that is beyond just the classroom, it does provide an influence of there are opportunities and there is a chance of what can happen through work and opportunities that may present themselves to other Black educators.

Septima concluded:

Race plays a factor and it is always talked about because it is something that is at the forefront of mindsets while hiring and interacting with BT.

Eleanor perceives race is important to build trust among herself and BT, so she must continue to build an open and diverse team and allow her campus Black leaders play out their roles. Eleanor accepts that she can be a role model and speak her truth to BT as she and each staff member have signed licenses of love and humanity. Horace perceives race as an absolute to impact the building of relationships with BT, because he has personally benefited from a racist system his entire life, so he should not take his whiteness for granted. He also thinks spaces are needed for conversations about race, so there is no need to shy away from those focuses, while ensuring the entity of the relationship is not only surrounded by race.

Richard does not view himself as doing extraordinary things to retain BT; however, every year he incorporates intentional strategies to retain any teacher of any color to sustain the highest retention rate in his district. However, the BT in his benefit from those specific strategies. Also, Richard knows to be aware of how he shows up can lead to a specific perception of how other may view him, he does his best to have consistent interactions with all of the kids and staff regardless of their identity, and he respect everyone like human beings and be acceptable of each other regardless of your identity. Septima perceives that when a Black person holds a specific role, it gives BT a desire or hope that there is an opportunity for them to advance as well. Also, Septima also feels race is always talked about because it is at the forefront of mindsets when hiring and interacting with BT.

Theme 3: Supporting the Retention of Black Teachers

Retention supports to retain BT are hiring practices, aligned practices, and equitable practices. Retention hiring practices may be having an intentional plan to specifically hire BT. Aligned practices may be induction, onboarding, mentoring, and SL created aligned practices. Retention Equitable practices include supports or strategies which create opportunities for BT to gain leadership experiences. Following are practices and strategies implemented of the focus group SL of when and how they provide BT opportunities to become visible and heard while sharing their experiences, perceptions, or realities within the school community.

Eleanor responded:

I love making sure I populate some feedback, anonymous meeting and of your surveys just about me and my leadership, and then also surveys that I'm grateful that our network provides that ask specifically questions around belonging and respect for identity markers. I'd say those are always incredibly important dipsticks, but it's also more just setting up a culture where anyone can come and talk to me, and that they know I'm going to be open and willing to hear about myself or about our school and what's needed.

It is just so important to me to ask teachers like, "What's three to five years look like? I know we've talked about it a couple of months ago, but where are you at now? What do you want? How do you want to develop? Where do you want to be a leader?"

Race is definitely particular for our Black teachers and should not be stemmed toward what is a more traditionally and probably not in many cases based on either conscious or simple minorities as amongst White leaders, but sort of curved into the like, "Oh, you should probably be in the culture space. You should probably help with discipline." So, making sure that opportunities are honest and open offers strengths that are truly connected to what fulfills and honors who that person is. So really just allowing people to speak for themselves and not making assumptions about what they need or want and where they want to be in where they want to go just for the comfort of themselves as being White leaders.

Horace responded:

I mean, I know being heard or having a voice is important to BT. I'm a person who's benefited from racist systems in my whole life and have been able to get to the place that I am partially because of benefiting from those systems.

I think that that means that I can't take for granted that my race does impact the way that I interact with Black teachers or the way that they may perceive me."

And I think in building relationships with Black teachers, that there's an absolute need to build trust and to create space for conversations about race, but also that that needs to not be the only dimension of our relationship. I need to understand that teacher as a whole person and as a professional, and I need to show some vulnerability, and to not shy away from approaching subjects that are around race. I need to ensure that the entirety of our relationship or the entirety of our

conversations or our work together, is not surround by race, but it definitely needs to be acknowledged.

Richard responded:

I don't see that view myself as a parent-like figure to any teachers, but I think there's a level of comfort and safety in those interactions. And anyone who's taught in Colorado for a long time knows that's a rare experience for an educator of color, let alone a Black teacher to have a principal that looks like them.

There's a sense of safety that says, "Okay, I'm safe here or I feel welcomed here." And that's just the initial. Now, whether or not I'm a warm and fuzzy, supportive, easygoing guy to get along with, that's a bonus. Again, I think just the way that I show up and how I look, because of my race, removes a lot of barriers and walls for an educator of color or a Black educator that they normally have to navigate the school district school system or building or community.

I realize that a lot of Black teachers or any teacher will give me honest and direct feedback which is usually positive. Not to say that that's a bias, but they'll just say, "You know what? I've always wanted to just let you know that I really appreciate that you say X or D and Y. Or I really am having a great experience here, and just want to let you know that." Which is good for me to hear as well because at the end of the day, we want to know that people feel supported and they feel welcome and are happy in their job as a teacher in your building.

Septima responded:

Whether they'd be teachers or Black teachers, the expectations and standards are the same across the board. When a teacher of color is hired, there is this sense of what is the best support system, whether that'd be in a way of mentorship or allowing them to expand their talents in a way of hearing their voice. How that look for a Black teacher and not necessarily just because of the color of their skin, but more so because of what is going to help them grow and help them become the most effective teacher they can be. So, I tend to look at teachers of color as what can we do, what can I do, or what is the best protocol to follow in order to support them at their professional need.

Practices of when and how SL provide BT opportunities to become visible and heard while sharing their experiences, perceptions, or realities within the school community is essential in retaining BT. Eleanor and Richard populate anonymous feedback from all teachers and accepts the feedback to see what are their areas of improvement. Eleanor disapproves of White Leaders curving BT to enter into specific role that are centered around discipline; and Horace acknowledges he is being a White male, he has benefited from a racist system his whole life. But he knows he should not take for granted the way he interacts with BT, or how they perceive him. Richard and Septima mindsets are that all teachers have the same expectations across the board. Last, different perspectives of when and how SL provide BT opportunities also varied. For instances, Septima believes the teacher's race or color does not influence her decisions, and she does what is best based on her support system. Richard has voiced that does not see himself as a parent-like figure to any teacher and he feels a sense of comfort working in the environment. Horace

stressed that he should show some vulnerability regarding race while not making race the entirety of the working relationship.

Discussion

Participants of this current research study demonstrated that practices and strategies are necessary to implement to develop, influence, and retain BT at their current Title I school site. Their expressions, thoughts, perceptions, and viewpoints have provided an intentional focus on the importance of increasing the P-12 pipeline with BT and TOC. More so, the findings from this qualitative study demonstrate SL are contributors to develop, influence, and retain BT in Title I schools or high poverty schools. The findings for this research serve as the stepping-stone to build a pathway for school organizations to improve the current practices of employing and sustaining higher rates of BT.

The impact of leadership on developing BT instructional practices, culturally responsive practices, and leadership practices all provide a lead way for BT to receive growth through coaching, feedback, professional learning, and through observations. BT may also develop their growth in becoming a self-directed learner, enhancing their individuality and authenticity, and meeting their desired goals. In chapter 2, (Carver-Thomas, 2018 & Kohli, 2018) confirm that when BT entering into the profession, specific knowledge, skills, and behaviors must be fostered by effective SL to succeed.

The influences that lead to BT success are internal motivational influences, cultural influential supports, and relational influences. Often, new BT entering the profession may be influenced to remain at their Title I school through social supports that target their experiences, background, commitment, and their philosophy of becoming a

teacher, and more a BT in a school of poverty. In a White-dominated teaching force, Whiteness is a privilege and may be used a benefiting factor to produce power, supremacy, entitlement, and systematic racism (Diangelo, 2010; Pizarro & Kohli, 2018). When BT are exposed to positive climate and culture that includes race talk, known realities, coaching systems, assigned mentor, and elevated professional development, then BT are more likely to remain in their Title I school.

Supporting the retention of BT hiring practices, align practices, and equitable supports all can occur once a BT makes a connection with the hiring manager or school principal. As BT are recruited to the teaching profession, more are first generation college graduates and travel an alternative pathway of teaching versus the traditional method of being a student teacher (Carver-Thomas, 2018; Farinde-Wu et al., 2019). Therefore, to retain BT for the long haul, elevated practices such as academic professional development, onboarding, mentorship, critical professional development, and induction practices and strategies must be aggressively incorporated into district and school onboarding planning so that BT will more than likely remain in the profession (Carver-Thomas, 2018; Griffen & Griffen, 2019; Kohli, 2018).

This study includes strengths and limitations. The strength of this study lies in the fact that there were 12 participants from five different school districts of a varied profile willing to share their practices and strategies that are incorporated in their current school site. Also, four of the 12 participants took an extra step of discussing more in-depth practices and shared insight of developing, influencing, and retaining BT. One limitation of this study is that it was only conducted in the state of Colorado and not across the country. Another limitation is that the sample size of SL is relatively small compared to

the number of SL who are employed in the state of Colorado. The findings may be helpful in determining what practices and strategies are employable in an affluent school or nontraditional school setting. Due to the limitations of this study, plausible alternatives should be further researched.

Summary

This chapter presented the purpose statement, the research question, and an overview of the organization of the presentation of the results. A profile of the participants, participant demographics, and a key of abbreviations of the demographics were shared. The individual interviews and transcripts report, the data analysis of the individual interviews, the combined aligned themes and subthemes of the individual interviews and findings of the individual interviews were also shared. Next, the focus group profile, procedures, and results were shared. The length of focus group and transcript that report, themes and questions, and the data analysis of the focus group were reported. This study includes 12 participants, 12 individual interviews, and a focus group of four participants. The participants are all SL such as instructional coaches, assistant principals, and principals who work in Colorado Title I schools. In the following chapter 5, there is a presentation of the proposed solutions and evidence that challenges the solution. The implementation of the proposed solution and the factors related to the implementation of the solution are also shared. Then the evaluation outcome of the solution and the implications are also reported.

CHAPTER FIVE: PROPOSED SOLUTION AND IMPLICATIONS

The purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to explore the practices of SL in Title I schools in developing, influencing, and retaining Black teachers at their current school site. The research question for this study was *How do school leaders of Title I schools develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at their current school site?* This chapter provides proposed solutions, evidence that supports the solution, and evidence that challenges the solution. In addition, an implementation of the proposed solution, factors and stakeholders related to the implementation, a timeline for implementation of the solution and evaluating the outcome of implementing the solution are in this chapter. Finally, the implications, recommendations for future study, and the summary complete this study.

Aim Statement

Troubling trends in education are not made known to many educators. The number of BT is shrinking and the percentage of BT has not kept pace with the increasing number of the SOC population. Researchers have provided evidence that BT have higher expectations for SOC compared to their White colleagues (Kohli, 2016; Pizarro & Kohli, 2018). There is an advantage for SOC being taught by the same race teacher because SOC will more likely be successful in graduating from high school (Colorado Department of Education, 2017; Duncan, 2019; Kohli, 2016). Therefore, the data around BT educating SOC should create a renewed focus on increasing the racial/ethnic diversity of the educational system. Retaining BT should be a national focus and a mandate to implement plans to develop potential candidates who are Black to become teachers in Title I schools.

Therefore, the aim of this study was to determine how school leaders in Title I develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site. Effective practices and strategies to develop, influence, and retain BT need to be explored, discussed, and implemented with SL for all school districts across the United States (Kohli, 2016). Due to the increase of the SOC population, retaining BT is crucial for student achievement. SL can acquire knowledge to implement practices and strategies which help in retaining BT in Title I schools. Teachers who aspire to become SL and are earning graduate degrees in education can also gain awareness to retain BT. Human resource departments, recruiting teams, and professional developers can learn new practices and strategies to recruit, hire, develop, influence, and retain BT.

In this qualitative case study, Title I SL, such as principals, assistant principals, directors, instructional coaches, and directors of instruction were recruited as participants to better understand their leadership practices and strategies on how they develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site. The term SL is used interchangeably with administrators, principals, and directors (National Association of Elementary School Principals, 2020). In this exploratory pursuit, contextual dynamics were also considered such as practices and strategies, leadership behaviors and relationships, and leadership influence and motivation (Cherng & Davis, 2017; Leithwood et al., 2019; Olsen & Huang, 2019).

Proposed Solution(s)

The findings of this study support the need of having a solution to satisfy the needs of all twelve SL whether being a coach, assistant principal, or principal. The commonality is all SL are willing to take on the culturally responsive mindset to ensure

their BT and TOC are inclusive with their White staff. The outcome of being inclusive is to increase SOC achievement and foster a positive inclusive school environment. The ideal would be that these twelve SL participate in a project called “The Inclusive School House Project,” which is similar to the Grow Your Own teacher preparation program.

Similarities and Differences

Like the Grow Your Own teacher preparation model that is established in Boston, Massachusetts, which would be found in hard-to-staff communities, so would The Inclusive School House Project be found in hard-to-staff communities. The Grow Your Own program gets its teachers by recruiting high school students, paraprofessionals, before and after school program staff, or other school community members into teaching. The Inclusive School House Project gets its teachers by recruiting college level students who are entering their junior, senior years of college and those who are within their first year after graduation. From an urban focused teacher education program in the Denver Metro area – this would include Hispanic, Multicultural and Native Serving Institutions. Historically Black College and Universities (HBCUs) graduates will also be considered due to the low percentage of students of color in the Denver Metro area. Each of these individuals will take on an apprentice position for one to two years, depending on their graduate status and their demonstrated abilities to take on their own classroom. The school is where the apprentice work will become their future home during the Inclusive School House Project.

Like the Grow Your Own program, the Inclusive School House Project will assist the newly college graduate obtain a teaching license. The Inclusive School House Project will work with their current university in the Denver Metro area or HBCU. The ideal is to

increase the number of BT and TOC, therefore the apprentices will have to identify as a TOC. However, this project does not move the college graduate into a master's program like the Grow Your Own Program.

Both programs will leave a long-lasting solution of retaining BT and TOC in hard-to-staff schools for a period of time. The Inclusive School House Project will offer some compensation, but the compensation depends on the role and the intent of the participant. For instance, already licensed and experienced educators may receive compensation for professional learning materials, compensation for mentoring others, or compensation for providing professional development to other educators within their literal inclusive school house where they are already employed.

Like the Grow Your Own Model, the recruitment to retention stages are extensive and timely for newly non-licensed teachers due to its rigorous pace while attending an alternate teacher program, or still enrolled as a junior or senior level college student. In exchange for earning an adjusted salary, the work of being an apprentice becomes the salary of the college student or new graduate, and the participants commit to teaching in the literal inclusive school house for five years after the apprenticeship (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017).

The Inclusive School House Project

The purpose of the Inclusive School House Project is to increase the number of teachers of color, and more so BT, to match the demographics of a specific school in the Denver Metro area. The criteria for the project include:

- The specific school must be designated by the state of Colorado as a Title I school or a high poverty school.

- The desired school must be situated in the Denver Metro area.
- During the time of applying, the school may only have three or less TOC. The participants must be TOC or more specifically BT.
- The principal must commit to establishing a school team coalition to participate in this project. The school team should include: principal, one assistant principal, one instructional coach or behavior coach, and four lead teachers. The school team should include a culturally diverse group of individuals in reference age, gender, race, years of teaching experiences, and are involved in different grade levels, different contents, and different assignments.
- The school team must be willing to commit to ensure personal and professional goals are being met by including the plan in their strategic planning. The Inclusive School House Project is a grant-based project with a working span to establish an inclusive school environment for three years. All participants will receive some sort of compensation (credit hours or small pay incentives) for their effort, progress, and participation.
- The school team must be willing to name and develop an *Inclusive School House Coordinator* who will work with outside educational consults, district level leaders, and other school teams from two other Denver Metro districts.
- All participants of the Inclusive School House Project must commit to occasional work outside of the school workday, and possibly one 8 hour Saturday every other month for over a three year span.

The Projected Plan

The project plan will be implemented using the Kotter's Change Management Model (2012) to implement various stages of *The Inclusive School House Project*. This model is an eight step intentional, urgent process to ensure positive measurable results. The Kotter's model will be explained during the first induction training. The Kotter's model includes three stages, and one stage will occur each year.

Year 1/Stage 1: Establish, Form, and Create while Preparing for Inclusion

School Team/Participant Outcomes:

Each School Team will ...

1. Learn the history of the American school and how it applies to today's Title I schools.
2. Apply culturally responsive teaching strategies to use in a diverse setting.
3. Learn to tackle "Whiteness" while working in a White profession.
4. Join the affinity working group as a safe space to converse and de-stress.
5. Promote their human wellbeing and honor their identity.

Year 2/Stage 2: Communicate, Enable, and Ensure while Implementing the Inclusive Changes

School Team/Participant Outcomes:

Each School Team will ...

6. Analyze and evaluate current trends and how they affect marginalized people.
7. Identify students' assets and honor their identity and their home culture.
8. Develop culturally responsive leadership traits to apply to the work situation.
9. Join the affinity working group as a safe space to converse and de-stress.
10. Continue to promote their human wellbeing and honor their identity.

Year 3/Stage 3: Improve and Anchor to Sustain Inclusion

School Team/Participant Outcomes:

Each School team will:

11. Establish an inclusive learning environment for children and adults.
12. Learn new technological software to include in the school environment.
13. Apply new ways to use culturally sound cognitive conversations.
14. Join the affinity working group as a safe space to converse and de-stress.
15. Continue to promote their human wellbeing and honor their identity.

Additional Notes:

The Inclusive School House Project will also accept participants undergoing alternative teaching licensure with BOCES (Colorado BOCES Association, 2021).

Therefore, the alternate teaching licensure participant will have additional accountabilities.

Evidence that Supports the Solution

Practices and strategies were shared by instructional coaches, assistant principals, and principals of Title I schools. Based on the findings of this study, CRT, cultural responsiveness, recruitment, hiring, retaining BT, working conditions, roles of school leaders, and transformational leadership were frequent occurrences.

Critical Race Theory

This study's theoretical framework was Critical Race Theory (CRT) to explore the school leaders' practices in developing, influencing, and retaining BT in Title I schools. More specifically CRT provided a framework that would identify, unpack, and address

inequalities or inequities present in those practices due to race. Even though CRT has six tenets, only two tenets were patterned throughout this study.

Tenet one: racism is an ordinary and normal occurrence in everyday society.

Racism is a structure or system of discrimination or antagonism against a person or people based on their race, ethnicity, nationality, or religion. Racial bias is entrenched in all sectors of society (Diangelo, 2018; Kendi, 2016). Horace supports Diangelo and Kendi's stance:

I think absolutely race can impact building relationships with Black teachers. I'm a person who's benefited from racist systems in my whole life and have been able to get to the place that I am partially because of benefitting from those systems.

Eleanor's example of race being an ordinary and normal occurrence is expressed when talking about the pigeonholing of TOC to certain roles:

Race is definitely particular for Black teachers and should not be stemmed toward what is a more traditionally and probably not in many cases based on either conscious or simple minorities as amongst White leaders, but sort of curved into the like "Oh, you should probably be in the culture space. You should probably help with discipline". So, making sure that opportunities are honest and open...that are truly connected to what fulfills and honors who that person is.

The results of tenet one in this study focused on involving race talk, equity practices, preventive measures of inequalities and inequities, and leadership opportunities for BT.

Tenet four: counter narratives, and counter storytelling. In this study,

Eurocentric ideologies were explored and via storytelling and counter-story-telling. The dichotomy-storytelling and counter-storytelling-is predicated upon the belief that schools

are neutral spaces that treat everyone fairly (Gay, 2010; Ladson-Billings, 1994, 2009). However, school curriculum and instruction continue to be structured around White culture and middle-class values and standards. When strictly educating SOC using European standards and methods, SOC become more marginalized through insensitive and inequitable curriculum and testing (Gay, 2010; Hackman & Rauscher, 2004; Ladson-Billings, 2005, 2009). The findings in this study that evolved around tenet four include allowing BT to have a voice without punitive consequences, providing safe spaces to talk about race, and allowing BT to have leadership opportunities.

Culturally Responsiveness

In the American school system, more inclusive educational approaches need to be adopted to ensure that all students have access to a solid education (Hackman & Rauscher, 2004). This study stressed the importance of hiring BT. BT are particularly suited to teaching SOC because they demonstrate an inherent understanding of the backgrounds and experiences of their learners. After all, BT understand their SOC backgrounds and experiences (Villegas et al., 2012). BT often have teaching styles or strategies SOC can relate culturally or responsively to which then results in higher student engagement. Students can learn about themselves through speaking, acting, and movement of context in a non-White-Framed setting (Gay, 2010; Khalifa, 2018; Ladson-Billing, 2006).

Findings from this study show SL demonstrating instructional practices through curriculum that allow students to learn about themselves. The coaches and the assistant principals are included through lesson planning and providing feedback. The assistant

principals supervise and lead diversity groups or content teams to support student learning activities. Mary expressed:

I think more so through the coaching conversations about, “Where are the students represented in your content? Then, where are other cultures represented in the continent?” “How are you exposing them to other cultures, so they can develop an appreciation for different kinds of diverse groups?” So just making sure that we are super aware of all of those pieces, not just thinking about culture from a Black, White, Latinx standpoint, but across the board, and ...what it means around my work, and around cultural responsiveness in the classroom.

The six principals manage the curriculum and instructional system, the evaluation system, and the climate and culture system to ensure the students are sufficiently prepared to become college and career ready. Also, leadership practices are culturally responsive by staff inclusivity. Fanny, shared the similar thoughts on cultural responsiveness but with staff:

Enhancing culturally responsive practices is what I do in every single aspect of what we do as a school community. We enhance our culturally responsive mindsets through a partnership with an equity consulting firm. This allows us to do racial consciousness training with the entire staff and not just small pockets of teachers.

Both the assistant principal and principal groups indicate the cultural responsiveness is front of mine in how the coach, provide feedback and develop staff and students. This produces an atmosphere where BT natural tendency to be culturally responsive in their approaches will flourish.

Recruiting, Hiring, and Retaining

Many Black teacher applicants are first or second generation college graduates, and frequently these graduates travel the alternative pathway of becoming a classroom teacher. The preparation that teachers receive prior to teaching can determine the outcome of their success (Farinde-Wu et al., 2019). Most BT enter the profession through alternative certification pathways and have little coursework which a traditional teaching program offers. When BT arrive at a school site for an interview, several things could take place for a Black applicant depending on whether the principal is a culturally responsive leader. Edward expressed:

It starts in the interview process. Sometimes Black candidates do not come in with the same or similar experiences as White candidates...because there's a skills gap there. It isn't because the staff of color don't have the ability, it's a skills gap because there are some experiences that Black people do not have that White people may have. So, one of the things we started to unpack from the interview process itself is how we ask questions. If we know we want to have a Black teacher and there is a gap, we make sure that we were capable of filling that gap.

Further, findings in this study show principals have the final decision on who gets hired at their school site. Fanny shared, "So, when I hire a Black teacher or any teacher of color, I'm looking for somebody who can be proud of who they are and who identifies as who they are." Principals who use culturally responsive practices allow the interview to become a space of cultural responsiveness. Four out of the six principals support culturally responsive practices to ensure that BT are hired to support the SOC at their current school site.

Working Conditions

BT are often hired in schools that have poor working conditions and low salaries. Often times the BT hired in these schools are late hires. Late hired BT often miss opportunities for professional development and additional preparation for classroom work time (Papay & Kraft, 2016). When BT work in high-poverty urban or rural communities, these poor working conditions added to the history of racial trauma speaks to looming challenges they face. Therefore, it is necessary for BT have powerful and influential role models in leadership who have an interest in their success to thrive (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2018, 2019). Charlotte shared,

The gentleman Black teacher, I didn't know from his name or any of that, if he was Black until I actually spoke to him on the phone. I was intentional in hiring him because of his race. However, I really looked to see if he was caring, because my school is in a hard neighborhood that is a challenge for many teachers, so I wanted that male! I could tell that he had a great personality, and I thought that I could teach him to teach, but I wanted to listen to his heart...And you know, just those qualities in him that spoke to caring about students.

Findings indicate that each of the six principals all support either an onboarding and induction programs, professional development, and a mentorship or a buddy. Horace admitted that his one-site school needs to improve their onboarding and induction program: “Yeah, I would say the mentorship, onboarding and induction is not necessarily a strong suit of our school. This is an area that we are working on improving.” Due to scattered onboarding and induction programs, not all of the principals mandate that BT or

any new teacher take on additional roles outside of the classrooms because teaching is their first priority.

Roles of School Leaders

Five out of the six principals mentioned that it is crucial to address race matters at their school sites, to support not having a poor working conditions, but a positive climate and culture. Fanny stated: “We have affinity groups...and we have provided opportunities for where teachers have been able to attend an equity conference through Teacher’s College...we also have our continuous racial consciousness training through an equity consulting company”. Proactively addressing racial tensions by developing staff for unpredictable and difficult conversations is paramount role of a SL in Title I wanted to retain BT.

The experienced SL of a Title I school can use best practices from prior experiences for school improvement. “Leadership is a process whereby an individual influences a group of people to achieve a common goal” (p. 5). Leadership approaches include intelligence, insight, persistence, self-confidence, tolerance, and integrity can determine the outcome of a school and shape the school’s culture (Lowney, 2003; Northouse, 2019). Once BT are hired and assigned a teaching position, the principal has the most impact on the development, influence, and retention of BT.

This study indicates that, regardless of the SL’s role, whether being an instructional coach, assistant principal, or principal, their authority for the development, influence, and retention of BT changes. The instructional coach’s primary responsibility is to support all teachers in all grade level at their school site feedback, individual coaching, and instructional support on content and engagement practices. The role of the

assistant principal is to serve others with the intent in their mind that it is all about the students. The role of the principal is to ensure all major components and systems are conducive for positive measures. Regardless of the SL's role, there needs to be a culturally responsive mindset.

Transformational Leadership

Transformational leadership is a modern style of leadership which gives attention to the charismatic and effective elements of leadership. In addition, teachers gain influence, autonomy, development, and satisfaction. Helen shared,

We are one of the most relational schools you're going to get your hands on. We will love you to the ends of the earth. It doesn't matter how you present yourself, how you show up every day as a student, as a family member, as a colleague. It doesn't matter. Show up and we are going to love you because you are you and you are part of this community. From an instructional standpoint. I think that there are some structural things that we definitely need to let go of...but we have a positive culture.

Edward believes that one should take one's opportunities how they come:

Well, the success must be consistent with the success of everyone else. We all are going to start at the same place, but also success means that I as the leader have to recognize that my person has a unique skill set because they're going to bring something that everyone else does not have.

Fanny believes to play a fair game by allowing every teacher to join a committee, particularly BT:

I'm looking at leadership opportunities for all teachers across the building. I'm really paying attention to what those opportunities look like for my Black teachers and teachers of color, because that's going to be unique. When determining the outcome of a project assigned to a Black teacher, one of the things that I know about Black teachers is that Black teachers are warm demanders. And I think allowing people to understand what it means and what the characteristics are of a warm demander is something that allows a Black teacher to gain a status or prominence in an environment where sometimes they're marginalized and not seen or heard ... And you have to always be mindful of that and make sure you're breaking down those barriers, so that Black teachers can come to the table with their brilliance and their excellence at all times.

When SL can provide a sense of teacher satisfaction, teacher commitment, and teacher retention is more likely to occur (Boyce & Bowers, 2018; Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017, 2018).

An Alternative Teaching Pathway

The educational residency model helps new teachers develop relationships through university cohorts and provide ongoing mentoring and support once residents become teachers. For instance, in the state of Massachusetts, the Boston Teacher Residency is comprised of 50% TOC, and 71% of the Boston Teacher Residency graduates continued teaching in the district through year six (Carver-Thomas, 2018). The potential teacher trains in a high-needs school for an entire school year under the guidance and supervision of a master teacher while earning a master's degree from a partnering university. In exchange for earning an adjusted salary, master's degree, and a

stipend for tuition and living expenses, the resident commits to teaching in the district for five years after the residency year (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017).

Evidence that Challenges the Solution

In the American school system, school districts are coping with TOC shortages and even more so BT. In the United States, at least 40% of schools lack TOC (Partelow et al., 2017). BT disproportionately teach in high-minority and low-income schools, and those schools have higher turnover rates of BT than White teachers of 19% versus 15% (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2017). Whether a school is classified as Title I, high-poverty, or hard-to-staff school, the consequences of their location or economic status offer lower salaries and lack amenities that attract qualified teachers. Typically, teacher turnover rates are 50% higher for teachers in Title I schools compared to affluent schools. This problem will become extremely magnified because the SOC enrollment and the increase of schools becoming Title I or high poverty is expected to highly increase (Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond, 2019; Colorado Department of Education, 2020; McFarland et al., 2019).

This study explored 12 SL experiences, viewpoints, perspectives, and thoughts to gain insight of the practices and strategies they use to develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site in five different school districts and 12 different schools in the state of Colorado. As the number of SOC increase in Colorado schools, the increase of TOC will also need to increase. The state of Colorado has given this problem a glance, but an extreme action will need to occur to increase the amount of TOC and more so BT in the American Teacher pipeline.

Viewing the perspective of various educational stakeholders, some may or may not agree that narratives and storytelling expose and challenge Eurocentric ideologies nor if race and or racism play a role in the experiences and retention of BT. Two of the 12 participants in the study - one principal and one assistant principal - provided a surprising stance on their role as Black leaders in developing, influencing and retaining BT. Richard stated, “I am a Black leader and I don’t view myself as being in a position which I have to do extraordinary things to retain Black teachers.” Similarly, Septima explained, “Whether they’d be teachers or Black teachers, the expectations and standards are the same across the board.”

However, when pushed further on the impact of race, Septima shared that “race can influence or impact building relationships with Black teachers only because sometimes we think about this with our students in regards to seeing examples of ourselves within specific roles or within specific positions”. Richard doubles down by adding, “I don’t see myself as a parent-like figure to any teachers”. Richard’s statement is counter to the “other mothering” Black female teachers and “other fathering” Black male teachers develop with SOC, particularly Black students, resulting in SOC having more favorable perceptions of BT versus White teachers (Cherg & Halpin, 2016). Richard and Septima’s stances represent in some way a color blind approach that emphasizes an objective and neutral reality despite the mitigating and historic factors that impact BT ways of being and lived experiences.

Implementation of the Proposed Solution(s)

The implementation of the proposed solution will be called *The Inclusive School House Project*. This project is a collaborative initiative that is strategically planned to

achieve a particular aim. The aim is to recruit, hire, develop, influence, and retain the BT pipeline. The Inclusive School House Project is a time sensitive initiative that will need an implementation with urgency. When urgency is required, the actions must be strategically planned and implemented with fidelity. Due to the time sensitivity of is project, the forethought is to incorporate the Kotter Model throughout the process of reaching the expected goals. Kotter's model is an 8-step process to create, build, form, enlist, enable, generate, sustain, and institute change to reach a major goal. The John Kotter's Change Management Model, introduced in 2012, is not the only method considered for this project, but this model's assertive urgency will accelerate the process of acquiring an increase of BT in the teacher pipeline.

Factors and Stakeholders Related to the Implementation of the Solution

The project is intended to run in three schools bounded in one school district, while having the participation of three different school districts. Each school district would pilot the project in one elementary school, one middle school, and one high school. The intent is to implement *The Inclusive School House Project* in three different urban school districts across one metropolitan city. The intent to implement the project in three different schools in three different school districts in a metro city is to provide cross school and district collaboration among districts, schools of the same grade level, and in different geographical areas of a metropolitan city.

Stakeholders

The major stakeholders in The Inclusive School House Project would include an outside educational consult, the school and state governance, an educational urban institution, human resources district level leaders, district level coordinators, school-

based leaders, campus lead teachers and coaches, and new BT teachers. Additional potential stakeholders may include local business and teacher school unions.

Potential barriers and obstacles

Success of the Inclusive School House Project requires the participation of the stakeholders listed above. This project is not designed to be an individual program where only the BT participate. This project demands inclusive collaborative efforts and actions from a cohort of educators in one district to unite with two other cohorts of educators from two other districts. Therefore, one of the biggest potential obstacles is recruiting a cohort of stakeholders who will buy-in to the philosophies and idealization of increasing the American school BT pipeline. Both Richard and Septima expressed a somewhat color blind objective and neutral approach while also acknowledging the value of hiring BT. Further, the focus on not wanting to be seen as the Black leader for concern over potential pushback on equity initiatives creates common barrier when the focus is specifically for Black people and other groups of color.

Other barriers and obstacles might include a coalition of educators to buy-in, financial budget concerns, guidance for the process, collaborative communication, emotional stress, culture, and continued development. Therefore, it is conducive to proactively plan to break down the potential opposition of the Inclusive School House Project even from within the previously mentioned stakeholder group. Additional potential opposition may include local business and teacher school unions.

Buy-In

All potential Inclusive School House Project participants must buy-in to the philosophy and principles to reach the desired goal. Buy-in is acceptance and willingness

to actively support and participate the desired goal. Therefore, buy-in starts immediately with the start-up of the project, and the buy-in must be continuous.

Financial/Budget Concerns

The cost of the proposed Inclusive School House Project will depend on the level of intensity of the project. If decisions would be made to move forward on the Inclusive School House Project, the project would need to obtain technology funding. Technology will be used for recruiting and hiring practices, communication, and professional learning. If the Inclusive School House Project is held outside of the school, the district, or traditional working hours, budget provisions will need to be made for paying for their development or receive professional development credit hours.

The provisions of hiring an outside educational consultant(s) would also deem essential for pay. Outside consultant would be need for their expertise to provide professional learning of our targeted areas. Services such as snacks/food for the project participants, clerical and bookkeeping support, and the possibility of room rental if held off site, and other incidental and regular cost will necessitate establishing a basic budget. The project may be able to obtain funding from state or federal funding. Additionally, it may be possible to minimize program-related expenses through the cultivation of community and business partners, sponsors, and the use of Zoom technology versus always meeting in-person.

Guidance for the Process

The model is clearly top-down, it gives no room for co-creation or other forms of true participation. It includes five phases: attending, exploring, understanding and goal setting, intervention, and finalization. The intent for this type of process is to ensure real

time and continual assistance to stakeholder decision making related to aspects of student education. During the process, assistance in planning, implementing, and carrying tasks forward successfully are all crucial to meet the stakeholders' desired goal.

Collaborative Communication

This action establishes a setting for behavior norming. Collaborative communication will vary based on an individual stakeholder's philosophy, openness, mindset, background, experiences, and learning style. Effective collaborative communication excludes silos, builds trust, aligns body language, promotes diversity, sharpens soft skills, and creates a safe psychological space. (Swanson & Holton, 2001)

Emotional Stress

During second order change, emotional stress is inevitable. Emotional stress involves the experience of emotional negativity such as anxiety, fear, anxiousness, anger, and sadness. Emotional stress can surface emotionally, mentally, psychologically, and physiologically when change runs counter to individual and workplace values and culture.

Culture

In this project, culture references the manifestation of human intellectual achievement, regarded collectively. The Inclusive School House Project will fit well into a culture of a semi-classical hierarchy. (Kotter, 2008) The semi-classical hierarchy provides all stakeholder accountability, authority, and reasoning to perform different tasks.

Continued Development

In this project, continued development refers to the process of training of knowledge and skills through independency, participation, and interactive learning within

a cohort or an assigned partnership. Continued development can be positive or negative. A positive can allow a participant to elevate their learning and achieve their goal sooner or on the desired date. There are two negatives to continued development. One, a participant could become frustrated if the implementation process of the Inclusive School House Project is too aggressive for their cognitive ability. Further, the continued development gives a negative effect if an individual's needs are not taken into consideration – including the lack of planning and follow through on knowledge and skill development to achieve the proposed outcomes. This can create resistance.

Timeline for Implementation of the Solution

It is beyond the scope of this study to detail a specific implementation plan with a projected timetable. The following represents an outline of a possible plan for initiating and implementing The Inclusive School House Project (with plans for subsequent expansion). Kotter's (2012) eight-step model of change provides the framework for an educational leader-led plan implementation. The change/implementation plan focuses on motivating and mobilizing educational leaders who will participate in The Inclusive School House Project.

Step 1: Establishing a sense of urgency. To resolve the problem of preventing SOC to not have BT, one must act immediately and not eventually. Procrastinating is complacency, and the real solution to having a comfort with complacency is having a true sense of urgency (Kotter, 2018). Failure to act due to discomfort is the epitome of privilege (Brown, 2018).

Step 2: Form a guiding coalition. Kotter (2012) argued that successful change projects require a strong guiding coalition. No one leader, no matter how magnetic, is

sufficient to direct a change effort. Kotter (2012) stated that four components are essential to the effective guiding coalition: position power, expertise, credibility, and leadership (p. 59).

Step 3: Create a vision and a strategy. The goal of creating a vision comes from having a shared goal. Determining an overall value of the coalition and then create a strategy that is logical with the fewest steps as possible. (Kotter, 2012)

Step 4: Communicating the change vision. The task of communicating the vision is to ensure that all stakeholders in the process, understand the vision and the objectives of the project. Kotter (2012) stated that the biggest mistake made in attempting to communicate the vision is getting bogged down in jargon. In contrast, essential elements in the effective communication of vision are simplicity, use of metaphor and example, communicating through multiple forums, repetition, leadership by example, explanation of inconsistencies whether real or perceived, and the use of two-way communication (p. 92).

Step 5: Enable action. According to Kotter (2012), the purpose of step 5 is to “empower a broad base of people to take action by removing as many barriers to the implementation of the change vision as possible” (p. 106). Key potential barriers to empowerment include an absence of needed skills, lack of top leadership support, a restrictive personnel system, and formal structures that make it difficult for people to act on the vision. A recommended resource at this stage is to have the teams read or revisit Switch. Heath & Heath (2010)

Step 6: Ensure short-term wins. Even prior to fully implementing The Inclusive School House Project, it is important to highlight and celebrate some of the short-term

immediate successes. This might include putting a spotlight on some of the cohort pilot projects, individual's process, or recognition of a cohort accomplishment when successful.

Step 7: Improve and expand more change. Kotter (2012) explained that as the organization proceeds through the change process, more and more resistance will be encountered, and it is important to keep consolidating the gains to maintain momentum. Celebrate the small wins along the way to show that the process is working.

Step 8: Anchoring the change in the culture. The eighth and final step in Kotter's (2012) change model involves incorporating the new behaviors, activities, and attitudes into the organizational culture, so they are reflected throughout the actions of the organization. In other words, the stakeholders would adopt a "slogan" that values the stakeholder's engagement, and involvement. Continued growth actively encourages and nurtures the idea that the project is gearing towards success.

Evaluating the Outcome of Implementing the Solution

The Inclusive School House Project will last a span of 3 years. Therefore, several benchmarks will occur to assess the progress of the projects throughout each year. Then after each year, the comparative data will be used to set targets and goal for the incoming year. The various benchmarks include:

1. Individual surveys will be given to each participant to assess their individual goals. The Inclusive School House Project lead team would want to know how they are view by each participant, and what change or implementations are needed for individual satisfactory of the program. This survey will be provided at the end of each trimester.

2. A survey will be provided to the principal of each school team. The school team will help the Inclusive School House Project lead team determine whether they are on target towards meeting the five outcomes assigned for each school year. This will provide the lead team an opportunity to accelerate standards and expectations so they may deliver on their promises. This survey will be provided at the end of each trimester.
3. A survey will be provided to the principal of each school team to distribute to students and families. Parent and student feedback will help the principal and the school teams to determine whether they are on target towards meeting the five outcomes assigned for each school year. This promotes transparency and accountability with the community and will provide the lead team an opportunity to accelerate standards and expectations so the school may deliver on its BT promises. This survey will be provided at the end of each trimester.

As the surveys are given, the metrics will be examined to check for progress. The result of the progress will provide a climate check and we continue to monitor the culture of the project. The Inclusive School House Project values the opinion of others.

Implications

Practical Implications

The practical implications of this study concern the need to embark on deliberate actions to increase the BT retention in Title I or high poverty schools. The role of the SL varied in geographical location, type of school, hierarch, background, experiences, race, and age. These diverse experiences and backgrounds provided different viewpoints and

perceptions on whether or not to take measures and efforts to specifically incorporate practices and strategies to retain BT.

Implications for Future Research

Colorado is one of the many states across the United States experiencing extreme shortages of TOC and particularly BT. As the trend is expected to continue, more extensive research studies are needed to examine the causes of BT leaving the profession and examine the causes of Black college students not wanting to enter into the profession. Therefore, this study explored how SL in Title I schools develop, influence, and retain BT in their current school site. Although exit surveys and research clarify reasons why teachers leave their positions, what remains unknown are the specific practices school leaders implement to develop, influence, and retain BT. The aim of this study was to determine how SL in Title I develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site.

The review of literature in this study highlighted (a) Critical Race Theory (CRT) as the theoretical lens for the study; (b) several historical events that influenced the shortage of BT in the American teaching force; (c) key ideas supporting the importance to why BT matter in the American teaching force; (d) strategies used to promote BT talent and acquisition; (e) reasons explaining BT's flight from the teaching profession; and conclude with (f) a review of SL's leadership influence on BT's development and retention. Future researchers may want to consider utilizing actionable research efforts to the following:

1. Combining methods to collect data through surveys, interviews, observations, and focus groups to yield a larger, more precise array of data. Such methods could

include qualitative research, quantitative research, or mixed-methods research to allow multiple perspective from various kinds of schools and various levels of SL.

2. Expand the study to other states and other regions throughout the American school system. Recruiting different participants from different states or regions will also broaden the perspective of the lack of BT in the American school pipeline. This will enable researchers to determine if they cite similar obstacles, catalyst, diversity issues, and policy recommendations that impact the recruitment and the retention of BT.
3. Extend this study to more than just Title I schools or high poverty schools. Affluent schools, faith-based schools, and private schools can also benefit from learning about this complex problem and help resolve the lack of BT in the American school pipeline. The researcher would discover a diverse perspective of experiences and actions among SL and BT in affluent or private schools.
4. Extend the study to include comparative groups of TOC such as Latinx, Asian, Arabic, and Two-Race teachers. This approach would allow the researcher to undertake research associated with each of the themes and subthemes in this study to determine whether the race of the TOC have any precise link to hire, develop, influence, and retain TOC and more so BT.
5. Consider exploring whether SL's race, background, and professional experience have any effect on their decisions to hire, develop, influence, and retain TOC and more so BT. This would explore the links associated with hiring TOC and more so BT.

These five future research recommendations are important as they may serve to clarify the perspectives, opinions, and experiences of each group of school leaders. Thus, the convergence or collection of data from different groups will provide policymakers with a more accurate understanding of why TOC and more so BT choose the profession, discover the issues that impede or help them along the journey, and how race and culture factor into the equation.

Implications for Leadership Theory and Practice

The implications of this study for leadership theory and practice are that educational consultants, the school and state governance, an educational urban institution, human resources district level leaders, district level coordinators, school based leaders, campus lead teachers and coaches, and new BT teachers, and possible potential local business and teacher school unions are empowered and motivated to actively implement and incorporate systems that enforce and enhance practices and strategies to increase the BT pipeline. The leaders who are best able to achieve this goal will likely be transformational leaders due to their ability to undergo processes that change people for the good of all people. In this study, transformational leaders are referenced to servant leaders, shared leaders, and culturally responsive leaders. Transformational leaders emphasize intrinsic motivation and provide their follower development which, in turn, inspire, influence, and empower individuals to succeed by reaching their goals (Creighton University Mission and Identity, 2009; Northouse, 2019).

Summary of the Dissertation in Practice

The research shows that all students benefit from having BT or TOC regardless of race and ethnicity (Easton-Brooks et al., 2018; Kohli, 2018; Stohr et al., 2018). BT

improve school climate for all students and reduce teacher turnover in Title I schools (Hughes et al., 2015). What remained unknown were specific practices SL implement to develop, influence, and retain BT (Gist, 2018; Goings et al., 2018; Jackson & Kohli, 2016). Effective practices and strategies to develop, influence, and retain BT needed to be explored, discussed, and implemented with SL for all school districts across the United States (Kohli, 2016). Therefore, the aim of this study was to determine how school leaders in Title I develop, influence, and retain BT at their current school site.

This qualitative multiple case study explored and described practices and strategies that will help develop, influence, and retain BT who work in Title I or high poverty schools. This study revealed the principal SL has a more significant role in retaining BT compared to their assistant principal or instructional coach (Goings et al., 2018; Partelow et al., 2017; Sutcher et al., 2017). Once BT are hired and assigned a teaching position, the principal of the school site has the most impact on the development, influence, and retention of BT. This study revealed that the principal's primary five functions of their school site are to manage the curriculum and instruction, manage the evaluation system, establish an inclusive climate and culture, develop aligned practices and supports, and make the final decision of hiring teachers.

Therefore, the principal of a Title I school or high poverty school must develop, influence, and retain BT. The principal is also accountable for developing the assistant principal, the instructional coach, and other members of their school community. The principal has the authority to use their internal motivation, experiences, skills, and will impact and influence their entire staff. The SL of a Title I school or high poverty school must take on a culturally responsive mindset to create an inclusive school environment.

The practices and strategies implemented must support coaching and feedback, observations and supervisions of content and systems, and culturally responsive teaching and learning strategies for teachers and students among the three leadership groups – Instructional Coaches, Assistant Principals, and Principals. A SL in Title I must demonstrate competency in incorporating supports that centers equity, diversity, and inclusion. The results of incorporating equity, diversity and inclusion supports manifests in the culturally responsive setting, through survey feedback, and teacher engagement and leadership.

Therefore, the Title I SL know-how must focus on implementing a professional development and learning system of support. However, they must know this task or project cannot be done alone. To reach the goal of establishing an inclusive school environment, the SL in Title I will need an accord to recruit a coalition of school-based leadership of instructional coaches, lead teachers, new Black teachers, and assistant principal(s). The SL in Title I will partner with additional stakeholders such as outside educational consultants, the school and state governance, an educational urban institution, human resources district level leaders, and district level coordinators. Additional potential stakeholders may include local business and teacher school unions.

State policy makers, superintendents, and human resources district level leaders must share in the responsibility of increasing the number of TOC in the Colorado school system. A SL Title I school or high poverty school must adopt a plan like The Inclusive School House Project. State policy makers, whether an educational lobbyist, legislator and/or school district superintendent, must acknowledge and anticipate how systemic and

structural inequities play a role if whether increasing the number of TOC or BT is even an option in the United States teacher pipeline.

Colorado Department of Education recognizes the racial disparity between the TOC population and the SOC population. For instance, Boards of Cooperative Educational Services (BOCES) are an important and vital part of the public educational system in the state of Colorado. BOCES provide districts and students services across Colorado such as: curriculum development, federally funded “No Child Left Behind” specialized program, Grant Management, and Alternative Licensure Program (Colorado BOCES Association, 2021). However, considerable work remains to be done. As Colorado continues to search for ways to recruit and retain qualified BT into the profession, it is important to seek the perspectives, viewpoints, and opinions of TOC who are already in the profession and those who desire to come.

It is apparent that Colorado is experiencing a critical shortage of TOC and more so BT. The recruitment and retention of BT for Colorado’s increasing diverse student population depends on the policy makers and educational leaders valuing the cultural benefits that BT and TOC bring to the teaching and learning environment. Transformational leadership and culturally responsive leadership are leadership traits, characteristics and/or styles that can increase the number of teachers of color to match the demographics of schools. The proposed solution in this study - The Inclusive School House Project - addresses this need for school leaders to embark on deliberate actions to increase BT retention in Title I or high poverty schools.

References

- Aguilar, E. (2020). *Coaching for equity: Conversation that change practice*. Jossey-Bass.
- Alexander, K., & Alexander, M. D. (2019). *American public school law* (9th ed.). West Academic Publishing.
- American Federation of School Administrators. (2020, November 19). In Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/American_Federation_of_School_Administrators
- American Psychological Association. (2020). *Publication manual of the American Psychological Association* (7th ed.). <https://doi.org/10.1037/0000165-000>
- Andrews, W. L. (1996). *Booker T. Washington Up from slavery: A Norton critical edition*. Norton & Company, Inc.
- Baptise, M. (2019). No teacher left behind: The impact of principal leadership styles on teacher job satisfaction and student success. *Journal of International Education and Leadership*, 9(1), 1 -11.
- Beauboeuf-Lafontant, T. (2002). A womanist experience of caring: Understanding the pedagogy of exemplary Black women teachers. *The Urban Review*, 34(1), 71-86.
- Bell, D. (2005). The unintended lessons in Brown v. Board of Education. *New York Law School*. 49(4), 1053 – 1067.
- Bell, D. (1992). *Faces at the bottom of the well: The permanence of racism*. Basic Books.
- Bernard, W. T., Issari, S., Moriah, J., Njiwaji, M., Oboan, P., & Tollover, A. (2012). Othermothering in the academy: Using maternal advocacy for institutional change. *Journal of the Motherhood Initiative*, 3(1), 103 - 120.
- Bolser, U. (2014). Teacher diversity revisited. A new state-by-state analysis. *Center for American Progress*.

- Boyce, J., & Bowers, A. J. (2018). Towards an evolving conceptualization of instructional leadership as leadership for learning: A meta-narrative review of 109 quantitative studies across 25 years. *Journal of Educational Administration, 56*(2), 161-182. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JEA-06-2016-0064>
- Boykin, A. W. (1983). The academic performance of Afro-American children. In J. Spence (Ed.), *Achievement and achievement motives* (pp. 323-271). W. H. Freeman.
- Brown, B. (2018). *Dare to lead*. Random House.
- Bryant, M. T. (2004). *The portable dissertation advisor*. Corwin Press.
- Buras, K. L. (2011). Race, charter schools, and conscious capitalism: On the spatial politics of Whiteness as property (and the unconscionable assault on Black New Orleans). *Harvard Educational Review, 81*(2), 296 – 330.
- Burciaga, R., & Kohli, R. (2018). Disrupting white stream measures of quality teaching: The community cultural wealth of teachers of color. *Multicultural Perspectives, 20*(1), 5-12. <https://doi:10.1080/1521096.2017.1400915>
- Burkhauser, S., Gates, S. M., Hamilton, L. S., & Schuyler-Ikemoto, G. (2012). *First-year principals in urban school districts: How actions and working conditions relate to outcomes*. Rand Education.
- Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color. *Learning Policy Institute*.
- Carver-Thomas, D., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2019). *The trouble with teacher turnover: How teacher attrition affects students and schools*. Learning Policy Institute.

- Carver-Thomas, D., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2017). *Teacher turnover: Why it matters and what we can do about it*. Learning Policy Institute.
- Carver-Thomas, D., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2017). Why black women teachers leave and what can be done about it. *Black Female Teachers: Diversifying the United States' Teacher Workforce Advances in Race and Ethnicity in Education*, 6(1), 159-184.
- Cherng, H. S., & Haplin, P. F. (2016). The importance of minority teachers: Student perceptions of minority versus white teachers. *Educational Researcher*, 45(7), 407 – 420.
- Cherng, H. S., & Davis, L. A. (2017). Multicultural matters: An investigation of key assumptions of multicultural education reform in teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education*. <https://doi:10.1177/0022487117742884>
- Colorado BOCES Association. (2021). <https://www.cbocesinnovative.org/alternative-teacher-licensure-program-atlp.html>
- Colorado Department of Education. (2020). Colorado Department of Education. [www.Colorado Department of Education.state.co.us](http://www.ColoradoDepartmentofEducation.state.co.us).
- Colorado Department of Education. (2017). Teacher shortages across the nation and Colorado: Similar Issues, varying magnitudes. Colorado Department of Education. www.cde.state.co.us.
- Creighton University Mission and Identity. (2009). Creighton University website: <https://www.creighton.edu/cte/preparing-teach/mission-and-identity>.
- Cremin, L. A. (1957). *The republic and the school: Horace Mann on the education of free men*. Teachers College Press.

Crenshaw, K. (2002). The first decade: Critical reflections, or a foot in the closing door.

In F. Valdes, J. M. Culp, & A. P. Harris (Eds.), *Crossroads, directions, and a new critical race theory* (pp. 9-31). Temple University Press.

Crenshaw, K., Gotanda, N., Peller, G., & Thomas, K. (1995). *Critical race theory*. The New Press.

Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (5th ed.). Sage.

Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry & research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). SAGE.

Department of Education. (2020). *Characteristics of public and private elementary and secondary school teachers in the United States: Results from the 2017-18 national teacher and principal survey*. A Publication of the National Center for Education Statistics.

Department of Education of the United States. (2016). The state of racial diversity in the educator workforce. *Policy and Programs Studies Service Office of Planning. Evaluating and Policy Development*.

Delgado, R. (1991). Affirmative action as a majoritarian device: Or do you really want to be a role model? *Michigan Law Review*, 89(5), 1222 -1231.

Delgado, R., & Stefancic, J. (2001). *Critical race theory: An introduction*. New York University Press.

Delgado, R., & Stefancic, J. (2000). *Critical race theory: The cutting edge* (2nd ed.). Temple University Press.

- DiAngelo, R. (2018). *White fragility: Why it's so hard for white people to talk about racism*. Beacon Press.
- Easton-Brooks, D., Robinson, D., & Williams, S. M. (2018). Schools in transition: Creating a diverse school community. *Teachers College Record: The Voice of Scholarship in Education*.
- Engel, M., Cannata, M., & Curran, F.C. (2018). Principal Influence in teacher hiring: Documenting decentralization over time. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 56(3), 277 – 290.
- Evans, B. R., & Leonard, J. (2013). Recruiting and retaining Black teachers to work in urban schools. *Sage Open: July-September* 1-12.
- Farinde, A. A., Allen, A., & Lewis, C. W. (2016). Retaining black teachers: An examination of Black female teachers' intentions to remain in K-12 classrooms. *Equity Excellence in Education*, 49(1), 115 -127.
- Farinde-Wu, A. & Fitchett, P. G. (2016). Searching for satisfaction Black female teachers' workplace climate and job satisfaction. *Urban Education*, 53(1), 86 - 112.
- Farinde-Wu, A., & Griffen, A. J. (2019). Black female teachers on teacher preparation and retention. *PennGSE Perspectives on Urban Education*, 16(1), 1 -17.
<https://urbanedjournal.gse.upenn.edu/archive/volume-16-issue-1-spring-2019/black-female-teachers-teacher-preparation-and-retention>.
- Franklin, A. J., & Boyd-Franklin, N. (2000). Invisibility syndrome: A clinical model of the effects of racism on African American males. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatric Association*, 70(1), 33-41.

- Franklin, A. J. (1999). Invisibility syndrome and racial identity development in psychotherapy and counseling African American men. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 27(6), 761-793. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000099276002>
- Fuchsman, D., Sass, T., & Zamarro, G. (2020). Testing, teacher turnover and the distribution of teachers across grades and schools. (Ed Working Paper 20-200). *Annenberg Institute at Brown University*. <https://doi.org/10.26300/ow44-d242>
- Gay, G. (2000). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice* (2nd ed.). Teachers College Press.
- Gershenson, S., Hart, C. M. D., Lindsay, C. A., & Papageorge, N. W. (2017). The long-run impacts of same-race teachers. Discussion Paper Series. *IZA Institute of Labor Economics*.
- Gist, C. D. (2018). Human resource development for racial ethnic diversity: Do school systems value teachers of color? *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, 20(3), 345-358.
- Glaser, B. G., & Strauss, A. L. (1967). *The discovery of grounded theory: Strategies for qualitative research*. Aldine.
- Goings, R. B., Walker, L. J., & Cotingola-Pickins, H. (2018). School and district leaders' roles in diversifying the teacher workforce. *Educational Planning*, 25(3), 7-17.

- Griffen, A. J., & Robinson, D. (2020). Reverse interest convergence, Kaepernick, and Nike: An educational lobbyist playbook for equitable funding and investment in urban public education. In M. C. Hopson & M. Petin (Eds.), *Reimagining Black masculinities and public space: Essays on race, gender and social activism* (pp. 39-47). Rowan and Littlefield.
- Griffen, K. D., & Griffen, A. J. (2019). Sustaining our diminishing teachers of color in urban and suburban schools: A crisis of an othered identity. In P. H. Hoffman-Miller, M. James, & D. Hermond (Eds.), *African American suburbanization and the consequential loss of identity* (pp. 86-115). IGI Global.
- Griffen, A. J. (2017). Advantages to being invisible: African American educational lobbyists enact reverse interest convergence. *The National Journal of Urban Education and Practice*, 11(2), 52-68.
- Griffen, A. J., & Carrier, I. C. (2017). The disestablishment of African American male compliant ambiguity: A prison pipeline essay. *Intersections: Critical Issues in Education*, 1(1), 17 -30.
- Griffen, A. J. (2015). *Hearing the voices of African American educational lobbyists and their role in lobbying for education*. [Doctoral dissertation] Texas A&M University. OAKtrust.
- Gurley, K., Peters, G.B., Collins, L., & Fifolt, M. (2014). Mission, vision, values, and goals: An exploration of key organizational statements and daily practice in schools. *Journal Education Change*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10833-014-9229-x>

- Hackman, H. W., & Rauscher, L. (2004). A pathway to access for all: Exploring the connections between universal instructional design and social justice education. *Equity & Excellence in Education, 37*(1), 114 -123.
- Hammond, Z. (2015). *Culturally responsive teaching in the brain: Promoting authentic engagement and rigor among culturally and linguistically diverse students*. Corwin.
- Hanushek, E. A., Rivkin, S. G., & Schiman, J. C. (2016). Dynamic effects of teacher turnover on the quality of instruction. *Nation Center for Analysis of Longitudinal Data in Education Research*. Calder, American Institutes for Research.
- Harrell, S. (2000). A multidimensional conceptualization of racism – related stress: Implications for the well-being of people of color. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry, 70*(1), 42 -57.
- Heath, C., & Heath, D. (2010). *Switch: How to change things when change is hard*. Broadway Books.
- Himmelstein, M. S., Young, D. M., Sanchez, D. T., & Jackson, J. (2015). Vigilance in the discrimination-stress model for black Americans. *Psychological Health, 30*(3), 253-267.
- Horsford, S. (2010). Mixed feelings about mixed Schools: Superintendents on the complex legacy of school desegregation. *Educational Administration Quarterly, 46* (3), 287-321. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0013161X10365825>.
- Hughes, A. L., Matt, J. J., & O'Reilly, F. L. (2015). Principal support is imperative to the retention of teachers in hard-to-staff schools. *Journal of Education and Training Studies, 3*(1), 129–134.

- Imberman, S. A., & Lovenheim, M. F. (2012). Incentive strength and teacher productivity: Evidence from a group-based teacher incentive pay system. *National Bureau of Economic Research*. Working Paper 18439.
- Ingersoll, R., May, H., & Collins, G. (2019). Recruitment, employment, retention, and the minority teacher shortage. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 27(37), 1-42.
- Ingersoll, R., & May, H. (2011). The minority teacher shortage: Fact or fable? *Phi Delta Kappan*, 23(1), 62–65.
- Jackson, T. O., & Kohli, R. (2016). Guest editors' introduction: The state of teachers of color. *Equity & Excellence in Education*, 49(1), 1-8.
- Jayakumar, U. M., & Adamian, A. S. (2017). The fifth frame of colorblind ideology: Maintaining the comforts of colorblindness in the context of white fragility. *Sociological Perspectives*, 1-25.
- Kane, B. D., & Rosenquist, B. (2019). Relationship between instructional coaches' time use and district and school-level policies and expectations. *American Educational Research*, 56(5), 1718–1768.
- Kendi, I. X. (2019). *How to be an antiracist*. One World.
- Kendi, I. X. (2016). *Stamped from the beginning: The definitive history of racist ideas in America*. Bold Type Books.
- Khalifa, M. (2018). *Culturally responsive school leadership*. Harvard Education Press.
- Klar, H. W., Huggins, K. S., Hammonds, H. L., & Buskey, F. C. (2016). Fostering the capacity for distributed leadership: a post-heroic approach to leading school improvement. *International Journal in Education*, 19(2), 111–137.

- Kohli, R. (2018). Lessons for teacher education: The role of critical professional development in teacher of color retention. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 1-12. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487118767645>
- Kohli, R. (2016). Behind school doors: The impact of hostile racial climates on urban teachers of color. *Urban Education*, 1-27. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1088868307301033>
- Kohli, R. (2009). Critical race reflections: Valuing the experiences of teachers of color in education. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 12(2), 235–251.
- Kolb, S. M. (2012). Grounded theory and the constant comparative method: Valid research strategies for educators. *Journal of Emerging Trends in Educational Research and Policy Studies*, 3(1), 83-86.
- Kozol, J. (1991). *Savage in inequalities*. Harper- Perennial.
- Kotter, J. (2012). *Leading change*. Harvard Business Press.
- Kotter, J. (2008). *A sense of urgency*. Harvard Business Press.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (2006). From the achievement gap to education debt: Understanding achievement in U.S. Schools. *Educational Researcher*, 35(7), 3 -12.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (2005). The evolving role of critical race theory in educational scholarship. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 8(1), 115 -119.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (1998). Just what is critical race theory and what's it doing in a nice field like education? *International Studies of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 11(1), 7-24. <https://doi.org/10.1080/095183998236863>
- Ladson-Billings, G. (1995). “But that’s just good teaching: Case for critical relevant pedagogy”. *Theory into Practice*, 34(3), 159 – 165.

- Ladson-Billings, G. (2009). *The dream-keepers: Successful teachers of African American children*. Jossey-Bass.
- Ladson-Billings, G., & Tate, W. (1995). Toward a critical race theory of education. *Teachers College Record*, 97(1), 47-68.
- Leithwood, K., Harris, A., & Hopkins, D. (2019). Seven strong claims about successful school leadership revisited. *School Leadership & Management*.
[https://doi: 10.1080/13632434.2019.15960771-18](https://doi.org/10.1080/13632434.2019.15960771-18)
- Lewis, J. A., & Neville, H. (2015). Construction and initial validation of the gendered racial micro-aggressions scale for black women. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 62(2), 289 - 302.
- Lincove, J. A., Barrett, N., & Strunk, K. O. (2017). Did the teachers dismissed after hurricane Katrina return to public education? *Educational Research Alliance*, 1(1), 1 -7.
- Lindsay, C. A., & Hart, C. M. D. (2017). Exposure to same-race teachers and student disciplinary outcomes for black students in North Carolina. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 39(3), 485 - 510.
- Link, W. A. (1992). *Jackson Davis and the lost world of Jim Crow education*. University of North Carolina Press.
- Lipman-Blumen, J. (2005). *The allure of toxic leaders: Why we follow destructive bosses and corrupt politicians – and how we can survive them*. Oxford University Press.
- Lowney, C. (2003). *Heroic leadership: Best practices from a 450-old company that changed the world*. Loyola Press, A Jesuit Ministry.

- McCluskey, A. (2014). *A forgotten sisterhood: Pioneering Black women educators and activist in the Jim Crow South*. Roman and Littlefield.
- McFarland, J., Hussar, B., Zhang, J., Wang, X., Wang, K., Hein, S., Diliberti, Forrest Cataldi, E., Bullock-Mann, F., & Barmer, A. (2019). *The condition of Education 2019 (NCES 2019-144)*. U.S. Department of Education. Washington, D.C: National Center for Education Statistics.
<https://nces.ed.gov/pubsearch/pubsinfo.asp?pubid=2019144>
- Merriam, S. B. (1988). *Case study research in education: A qualitative approach*. Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2015). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation* (4th ed.). John Wiley & Sons.
- Muhammad, A. (2018). *Transforming school culture: How to overcome staff division* (2nd ed.). Solution Tree Press.
- Muhammad, G. (2020). *Cultivating genius: An equity framework for culturally and historically responsive literacy*. Scholastic.
- National Association of Elementary School Principals – NAEP (2020). Definition of a school leader. <https://www.naesp.org/sites/default/files/docs/Principal%20Wins%20in%20ECA.NSIf>
- Nicholas, L., & West-Burnham. (2016). *Understanding leadership: Challenges and reflections*. Crown House Publishing Limited.
- Northouse, P. G. (2019). *Leadership theory and practice* (8th ed.). Sage Publications, Inc.

- Olsen, A. A., & Huang, F. L. (2019). Teacher job satisfaction by principal support teacher cooperation: results from schools and staffing survey. *Educational Policy Analysis Archives*, 27(11), 1-31.
- Papay, J. P., & Kraft, M. A. (2016). The productivity costs of inefficient hiring practices: Evidence from late teacher hiring. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 35(4), 791 - 827. <http://doi:10.1002/pam.21930>
- Partee, G. L. (2014). *Retaining teachers of color in our public schools: A critical need for action*. Center for American Press.
- Partelow, L., Spong, A., Brown, C., & Johnson, S. (2017). *America needs more teachers of color and a more selective teaching profession*. Center for American Progress.
- Petchaur, E., Bowe, A. G., & Wilson, J. (2018). Winter is coming: Forecasting the impact of edTPA on Black teachers and teachers of color. *Urban Review*.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11256-018-0453-1>
- Pizarro, M., & Kohli, R. (2018). "I stopped sleeping": Teachers of color and the impact of racial battle fatigue. *Urban Education*, 1 - 25.
- Plachowski, T. J. (2019). Reflections of preservice teachers of color: Implications for the teacher demographic diversity gap. *Education Sciences*, 9(144), 1 -19.
- Roberts, C. M. (2010). *The dissertation journey: A practical and comprehensive guide to planning, writing, and defending your dissertation* (2nd ed.). Corwin.
- Saldana, J. (2013). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers* (2nd ed.). Sage.
- Siddie-Walker, V. (1996). *Their Highest Potential: An African American school community in the segregated south*. The University of North Carolina Press.

- Shifrer, D., Turley, R. L., & Heard, H. (2017). Do teacher financial awards improve teacher retention and student achievement in an urban disadvantaged school district? *American Educational Research Journal*, 54(6), 1117 - 1153.
- Stohr, A., Fontana, J., & Lapp, D. (2018). *Patching the leaky pipeline: Recruiting and retaining teachers of color in Pennsylvania*. Research for Action.
- Stake, R. E. (2006). *Multiple case study analysis*. The Guilford Press.
- Swanson R. A., & Holton, E.F. (2001). *Foundations of human resource development* (2nd ed.). Berrett-Koehler Publishers.
- Sutcher, L., Podolky, A., & Espinoza, D. (2017). Supporting principals' learning: Key features of effective programs. *Learning Policy Institute*.
- Tai, M. K., & Kareem, O. A. (2018). The relationship between emotional intelligence of school principals in managing change and teacher attitudes towards change. *International Journal of Leadership in Education*.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/13603124.2018.1481535>
- Tatum, A. (2005). *Teaching reading to Black adolescent males*. Stenhouse Publishers.
- Taylor, E., Gillborn, D., & Ladson-Billings, G. (2009). *Foundations of critical race theory in education*. Routledge.
- Thomas, E. E., & Warren, C. A. (2015). Making it relevant: How a Black male teacher sustained professional relationships through culturally responsive discourse. *Race Ethnicity and Education*. <https://doi:10.1080/13613324.2015.1121217>
- Thompson, O. (2019). School desegregation and Black teacher employment. National Bureau of Economic Research. Working Paper 25990

Tingle, E., Corrales, A., & Peters, M., L. (2017). Leadership development programs:

Investing in school principals. *Educational Studies*.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/03055698.2017.1382332>

Villegas, A. M., Strom, K., & Lucas, T. (2012). Closing the racial/ethnic gap between

students of color and their teachers: An elusive goal. *Equity and Excellence in*

Education, 45(2), 283-301.

Wahlstrom, K. L., & Louis, K. S. (2008). How teachers experience principal leadership:

The roles of professional community, trust, efficacy, and shared responsibility.

Educational Administration Quarterly, 44(4), 458-495.

Warren, C. A. (2020). Meeting myself: Race-gender oppression and a genre study of

Black men teachers' interactions with Black boys. *Race Ethnicity and Education*,

23(3), 367-391.

Witherspoon, N., & Mitchell (2009). Critical race theory as ordinary theology of African

American principals. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*,

22(6), 655 – 670.

Yan, R. (2019). The influence of working conditions on principal turnover in k-12 public

schools. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 1-34.

Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case study research and applications: Design and methods* (6th ed.).

Sage.

Zoom Video Communication. (2020). Zoom video communication: Software company.

<https://www.zoom.us>.

*Appendix A**Recruitment Flyer***RESEARCH STUDY ON SCHOOL LEADERS OF TITLE I****SCHOOLS****Participants Needed!**

School Leaders in Title I schools (or high poverty schools) such as *principals, assistant principals, directors, assistant directors, coordinators, instructional coaches, and coordinators.*

**About the Study**

A qualitative study exploring the practices of School Leaders in Title I schools in developing, influencing, and retaining Black teachers at their current school site.

Participation Activity

Participants will engage in a virtual interview outside of the workday. Also, there is a possibility to participate in a virtual focus group interview.

Criteria to Become a Participant of this Study

- Willing to respond to questions around your leadership philosophy, beliefs, and values on how to develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at your current school site
- Have at least 3 years of school leadership experience
- Currently employed at a Colorado school site for 2 years or more
- Have at least 1 teacher who identifies as a descent of African American or Black at your school site

What You Should Know About this Study

All interviews are confidential and pseudonyms will be used (your name, school site, and school district will not be disclosed).

Get to know the Researcher

Doctoral Candidate Karen “K” Griffen attends Creighton University and is majoring in Educational Leadership in Interdisciplinary Studies. She is highly passionate about making changes in human resources development in the areas of diversity, equity, and inclusion within the Colorado educational system.

Contact information

If the above participation criteria seem to describe you, please contact K. Griffen at 720-378-8771 or email KDG49401@creighton.edu. Thank you!

Appendix B

*Phone Screener Checklist***Introduction**

Hello, I am Karen “K” Griffen, and I am a doctoral student conducting a research study for my dissertation: How School Leaders of Title I Schools Develop, Influence, and Retain Black Teachers. I would like to ask a few questions before you actually become a participant for my study. Do you have a few minutes to answers several questions?

1. What is your School Leadership role? _____
2. Is your school a Title I school or high poverty school in the state of Colorado?

3. How many years have you been a School Leader? _____
4. How many years have you worked at your current worksite? _____
5. Are you willing to respond to questions around your leadership philosophy, beliefs, and values on how to develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at your current school site?
6. Do you have at least one teacher who identifies as a descendant of African American or Black? _____

Closing Statement

_____, I appreciate you taking the time to answer the questions to participate in my dissertation research study. I would like you to become a participant (Pending meeting the criteria). Would you be interested in becoming a participant? Here are a few dates available to interview with me about how you develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at your school: _____ or _____. Will

either of these dates work for you outside of your working hours? _____.

Great, I will send you a reminder along with an information letter via email two days

before our date to interview. What email would you prefer me to use

_____? What is the best way to contact you? _____.

_____, I appreciate your willingness to participate and I will reach out to

you soon. Thank you!

*Appendix C**Information Letter for Individual Interview***Creighton University Institutional Review Board**

2500 California Plaza, Omaha, NE 68178 • Phone: 402-280-2126
Email: irb@creighton.edu

Information Letter

January 19, 2021

Dear Participant,

The purpose of this study is to explore “How School Leaders in Title I Schools Develop, Influence, and Retain Black Teachers.” School Leaders such as principals, assistant principals, directors, assistant directors, coordinators, instructional coaches, and coordinators are needed to share practices and strategies used at your school site.

This study is voluntary, and you can withdraw at any time.

There is no risk in participating in this study. If mild emotional risks occurs in the process of participation, you may indicate your concern to me. In addition, you can withdraw from the process, and contact a doctor.

All data will remain confidential and secured. Interviews will be conducted virtually via Zoom outside of the workday within a secured location of your choice. Pseudonyms will be used for your name, school site, and district. Also, there is a possibility for you to participate in a virtual focus group interview.

In addition to participating in this study, your leadership philosophy, beliefs, and values on how to develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at your current school site will be a contribution to other professional educators, educational institutions, Black college students who aspire to become teachers, and teachers who aspire to become School Leaders. There are no financial gains or compensation for your participation of this study. There is the possibility that this study will be published and shared as articles, journals, and as a book.

If there are questions about this study, you may contact me at 720-378-8771, or my chair member, Dr. Paul Moon at pmoon@creighton.edu. If you have questions about research participants' rights, you may contact the Creighton University's Institutional Review Board at 402-280-2126. Thank you for participating in this study.

Sincerely,

Karen Griffen, M.Ed.
Ed. D (c) Candidate
Educational Leadership Interdisciplinary Studies
Creighton University

Bill of Rights for Research Participants

[Bill of Rights Link](#)

As a participant in a research study, you have the right:

1. To have enough time to decide whether or not to be in the research study, and to make that decision without any pressure from the people who are conducting the research.
2. To refuse to be in the study at all, or to stop participating at any time after you begin the study.
3. To be told what the study is trying to find out, what will happen to you, and what you will be asked to do if you are in the study.
4. To be told about the reasonably foreseeable risks of being in the study.
5. To be told about the possible benefits of being in the study.
6. To be told whether there are any costs associated with being in the study and whether you will be compensated for participating in the study.
7. To be told who will have access to information collected about you and how your confidentiality will be protected.
8. To be told whom to contact with questions about the research, about research-related injury, and about your rights as a research participant.
9. If the study involves treatment or therapy:
 - a. To be told about the other non-research treatment choices you have.
 - b. To be told where treatment is available should you have a research-related injury, and who will pay for research-related treatment.

*Appendix D**Individual Interview Protocol*

Interviewer: _____

Interviewee Coded Identity _____

Date of Interview _____

Time of Interview _____

Location of Interview _____

Do you give your consent to participate in this interview? _____

Do you give your consent for this interview to be audio recorded? _____

Do you give your consent for this interview to be video recorded? _____

Interview Questions

What is your race or ethnicity? _____

What is your gender? _____

What is your age group? (19-25, 26-30, 31-45, 46-60, 60+) _____

How many years have you been in education? _____

How many years in leadership? _____

What is your highest level of education? _____

What state certifications or licenses do you hold? _____

How many years have you worked in a Title I school as a School Leader?

What is your role as a school leader? _____

What is the grade level of your school? _____

What is the student demographic population? _____

Is your school district considered rural, urban, or suburban? _____

Does your school service students of special populations? _____

How many professional Black teachers work at your current worksite? _____

How many students attend your school? _____

How many members are a part of your admin team? _____

What is the approximate number of staff you lead? _____

How do you develop Black teachers at your school?

- What is your primary focus and level of involvement in managing curriculum and instructional programs?
- What ways do you provide feedback to teachers, and more so Black teachers, to ensure they are improving and their teaching practices are effective?
- In your experience working with teachers of color or Black teachers, what kinds of support do you provide for them to ensure they are not facing inequalities or inequities?
- In your perception, what does success look like for a Black teacher working in a predominately White workforce?
- How do you enhance practices of culturally responsive teaching?
- When you hire a Black teacher, what are you particularly searching for, and what determines whether or not they are qualified to teach at your school site?
- What level of teacher engagement of a Black teacher influences your decision to provide opportunities for them to teach advanced coursework such as A.P., Gifted, Honor, and/or concurrent enrollment?
- What level of teacher engagement of a Black teacher influences your decision to provide them with leadership opportunities?
- What types of leadership opportunities are available to BT in your school?
- How do you develop or support Black teachers with professional development in teaching and learning?

- How has the virtual environment impacted the work experience for Black teachers?
- What specific practices or strategies do you use to ensure Black teachers are included in the decision-making of policy for student discipline, course selection, and extra-curricular activities?
- How do you determine which specific projects or tasks are assigned to a Black teacher?
- In what ways does race determine the outcome of a project or tasks assigned to a Black teacher?
- What has been your experience developing a Black teacher in their journey towards success? (What has been a negative experience?)

How does your leadership style influence Black Teachers at your school site?

- What motivates you to work in a Title I school? What elements of this school influence your desire to continue to maintain membership with this school? Also, if provided the opportunity again, would you be willing to work for this school? Why or why not?
- What is your leadership philosophy, core values, and beliefs that are promoted in this school?
- Describe your leadership style and the ways your leadership style promotes the mission and vision of this school.
- How did you gain or develop your leadership style?
- How have you gained commitment from Black teachers?
- How do you think Black teachers perceive your leadership?
- How does your leadership style influence working conditions for Black teachers in your school?
- How would you describe the culture at your school? How do you promote an inclusive positive climate?
- How has COVID-19 affected the culture at your school, and more so with Black teachers?
- In what ways does the school's goals promote diversity, equity, and inclusion for Black teachers?

- What is your perception on Black teachers teaching Black students? What is your perception on Black teachers teaching White students?
- What are your expectations of Black teachers working in Title I schools regarding teacher and student relationships?
- How has your virtual communication affected your relationships with Black teachers in your school?
- In what ways do you encourage Black teachers to pursue higher degrees in leadership?
- How do you deepen your relationship with Black teachers?
- Imagine creating the ideal support system for Black teachers: what would it entail?

How do you retain Black teachers at your school site?

- What kind of mentorship, onboarding, induction programs, or affinity groups are provided for Black teachers once they are hired in your school site?
- How do you promote Black teacher talent?
- How do you help Black teachers navigate through challenging district and school policy and procedures?
- How do you develop or support Black teachers with critical professional development?
- How would you begin talking about race with your staff?
- How do you address Whiteness, micro-aggressions, and other race matters among White teachers and Black teachers?
- How would you describe the overall racial climate among your faculty?
- How do you provide emotional support to Black teachers for work related stress?
- In what ways do you advocate for Black teachers when they have negative and/or racial experiences?
- Do you think the BT in your school site have allies? Please explain.
- What supports are provided to assist Black teachers to obtain licenses, endorsement, or higher degrees?

- In what ways do you advocate for Black teachers' promotion and opportunities to lead?
- What other monetary gains or supplemental pay is offered to Black teachers?
- How do you support Black teachers in regard to high-stakes tests and scores?
- What supports do you provide to Black teachers regarding classroom matters reported by families?
- If you could advise a Black college graduate pursuing a teaching career in a White teaching force, what advice would you share?
- What else you would like to share that may not have been asked in this interview?

*Appendix E**Information Letter to Participate in the Focus Group Interview*

Creighton
UNIVERSITY

Creighton University Institutional Review Board

2500 California Plaza, Omaha, NE 68178 • Phone: 402-280-2126

Email: irb@creighton.edu

Focus Group Interview Information Letter

December 10, 2020

Dear Participant,

You were chosen to participate in a **Focus Group Interview** on “How School Leaders in Title I Schools Develop, Influence, and Retain Black Teachers at their current school site. The focus includes 4-6 School Leaders which use practices and strategies to develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at their current school site. This study is voluntary, and you can withdraw at any time.

There is no risk in participating in this study. If mild emotional risks occurs in the process of participation, you may indicate your concern to me. In addition, you can withdraw from the process, and contact a doctor.

All data will remain confidential and secured. The **Focus Group Interview** will be conducted virtually via Zoom at a common time outside of the workday within a secured location of your choice. Pseudonyms will continue to be used for your name, school site, and district for the **Focus Group Interview**. You will be asked to keep your video off and to use the assigned pseudonym as your name on the zoom call.

In addition to participating in this study, your leadership philosophy, beliefs, and values on how to develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at your current school site will be a contribution to other professional educators, educational institutions, Black college students who aspire to become teachers, and teachers who aspire to become School Leaders. There are no financial gains or compensation for your participation of this study. There is the possibility that this study will be published and shared as articles, journals, and as a book.

If there are questions about this study, you may contact me at 720-378-8771, or my chair member, Dr. Paul Moon at pmoon@creighton.edu. If you have questions about research participants' rights, you may contact the Creighton University's Institutional Review Board at 402-280-2126. Thank you for participating in this study.

Sincerely,

Karen Griffen, M.Ed.
Ed. D (c) Candidate
Educational Leadership Interdisciplinary Studies
Creighton University

Bill of Rights for Research Participants[Bill of Rights Link](#)

As a participant in a research study, you have the right:

1. To have enough time to decide whether or not to be in the research study, and to make that decision without any pressure from the people who are conducting the research.
2. To refuse to be in the study at all, or to stop participating at any time after you begin the study.
3. To be told what the study is trying to find out, what will happen to you, and what you will be asked to do if you are in the study.
4. To be told about the reasonably foreseeable risks of being in the study.
5. To be told about the possible benefits of being in the study.
6. To be told whether there are any costs associated with being in the study and whether you will be compensated for participating in the study.
7. To be told who will have access to information collected about you and how your confidentiality will be protected.
8. To be told whom to contact with questions about the research, about research-related injury, and about your rights as a research participant.
9. If the study involves treatment or therapy:
 - a. To be told about the other non-research treatment choices you have.
 - b. To be told where treatment is available should you have a research-related injury, and who will pay for research-related treatment.

*Appendix F**Focus Group Interview Protocol***Introduction Text**

My name is _____ and I will be the facilitator for today's focus group. The purpose of this focus group is to learn more about how you develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at your current school site. All of you have been asked to participate because you are leaders who have an interest to develop, influence, and retain Black teachers in your current school site. It is my hope that your insights and experiences will help me continue my study to bring knowledge, awareness, practices, and strategies for developing, influencing, and retaining Black teachers to other educators and to others who are pursuing school leadership.

Information Letter

Earlier, each of you were emailed an information letter and a non-disclosure form agreeing to participate in this focus group interview and to keep our discussion confidential. This Zoom interview and the information letter both will be stored in a password-protected computer and locked file storage and secured within my home for three years. In the event you feel uncomfortable for any reason, you are free to request to end your participation in the interview at any time. Please take a minute to review the information letter. First, I would like to go over a few norms for the focus group. These norms are in place to ensure that all of you feel comfortable sharing your experiences and insight. Now, I will begin discussing the norms for this interview, and I will start the recording.

Norms:

1. Confidentiality – As per the non-disclosure form, please respect the confidentiality of your peers. I as facilitator will only be sharing the information anonymously with relevant committee members of my dissertation team.
2. One Speaker at a Time – Only one person should speak at a time to make sure we can all hear what is being said. You may use your Zoom tools such as the chat box and the hand signal. Let us practice the use of the tools during this time. It is also your discretion to leave your camera on.
3. Use Respectful Language – Everyone is encouraged to use respectful, professional language and practice basic courtesy even if disagreement arises.
4. Open Discussion -This is a time for everyone to freely express your thoughts, opinions, insight, experiences, and feelings. You will not be asked to reach consensus on the topics discussed. There will be no right or wrong answers.
5. Participation is Important – It is important that everyone’s voice is shared and heard to make this a productive focus group. Please speak up when you have something to say. Please ask questions for clarity if and when needed. Last, please note that I as facilitator will ask you to contribute and you may elect to share or pass.

Welcome Statement

Please take one minute to share who you are, your leadership role, and your experience working within a Title I school site, how many Black teachers are at your current site, and what motivates you to work in a Title I school?

Format and Structure of the Discussion

The interview is composed of five essential open-ended questions regarding your practices and strategies of developing, influencing, and retaining Black teachers at your current Title I school site. Each essential question has a follow-up question to provide clarity and thought of the essential question. Again, as you respond to the question, please remember there is no right or wrong answer. While responding, I ask that you first say your name for so I can know who is speaking when I later review the collected data. *For example:* This is _____. Then include your response to the question being posed. Once you are finish making your point, please say thank you so we know you have completed your response.

Questions

1. How would you motivate a Black teacher to engage in the decision-making and collaboration of goals, instructional practices, student behavioral management, systems and procedures, events, and activities at your current work site?
 - Follow-Up Question: Do you intentionally ensure your practices are inclusive for Black teachers as well as all staff?
2. How do you navigate race matters among a Black teacher and the school community regarding policy, practices, resources, and equitable opportunities at your school site?
 - Follow-Up Question: What practices and strategies do you incorporate to educate and develop your staff about marginalized individuals?
3. What role if any do you think your race plays in the influence and impact of building relationships with Black teachers?

- Follow-Up Question: How does your race matter in building trust, a long-standing commitment, and an enactment as a role model or parent-like figure to Black teachers?
4. How and when do you provide opportunities that allow Black Teachers to become visible and heard while sharing their experiences, perceptions, or realities within the school community?
 - Follow-Up Question: What supports, programs, and initiatives do you provide to Black teachers and their colleagues to understand the impact of inequalities and inequities that are encountered within the educational system and more so at your school site?
 5. How do you develop, promote, or advance Black teachers to become teacher leaders or administrators in your school site or school district?
 - Follow-Up Question: What ways, paths, channels, or intents do you provide for a Black teacher to gain leadership opportunities to spotlight their talents, gifts, skills, and ambitions within your school site or school district?
 6. What else would you like to share or add to this interview?

Closing Statement

Thank you for participating in today's focus group on the topic of developing, influencing, and retaining Black teachers at your current school site. As a reminder, I will be sharing the data collected during this session with my dissertation team as part of analysis. If you think of any additional ideas or comments that you would like to share, please contact me at _____. Once again, thank you participating in this focus group interview, and enjoy the rest of your day!

*Appendix G**Recruitment Email Script*

Creighton
UNIVERSITY

Creighton University Institutional Review Board

2500 California Plaza, Omaha, NE 68178 • Phone: 402-280-2126

Email: irb@creighton.edu

Hello, I am Karen “K.” Griffen, a doctoral student at Creighton University, and I am conducting a study on how school leaders in Title I schools develop, influence, and retain Black Teachers. To gain more iNSight and information on this topic, I would like to interview twelve School Leaders who are principals, assistant principals, directors, assistant directors, coordinators, instructional coaches, or coordinators.

To become a participant of this study, you must meet the following criteria:

- Willing to respond to questions around your leadership philosophy, beliefs, and values on how to develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at your current school site
- Have at least 3 years of school leadership experience
- Currently employed at a Colorado school site for 2 years or more
- Have at least 1 teacher who identifies as African American or Black at your school site and in their second year at the school site.

The risks associated with this study are minimal and are not greater than risks ordinarily encountered in daily life. There will be no cost for taking part in this study, aside from your time. We will begin with a 15 minute phone screener followed by a 45 - 60 minute individual interview. There is the possibility of being invited to a focus groups interview, which will last about 60 - 90 minutes. All information gathered during the study will be confidential. If you are interested in participating in this study, please reach out to me at 720-378-8771 and/or kdgriffen49401@creighton.edu.

Sincerely,
Karen Griffen, M.Ed.
Ed. D (c) Candidate
Educational Leadership Interdisciplinary Studies
Creighton University

Appendix H

Recruitment Phone Script

**Creighton University Institutional Review Board**2500 California Plaza, Omaha, NE 68178 • Phone: 402-280-2126
Email: irb@creighton.edu

Hello, I am Karen “K.” Griffen, a doctoral student at Creighton University, and I am conducting a study on how school leaders in Title I schools develop, influence, and retain Black Teachers. To gain more insight and information on this topic, I would like to interview twelve School Leaders who are principals, assistant principals, directors, assistant directors, coordinators, instructional coaches, or coordinators.

To become a participant of this study, you must meet the following criteria:

- Willing to respond to questions around your leadership philosophy, beliefs, and values on how to develop, influence, and retain Black teachers at your current school site
- Have at least 3 years of school leadership experience
- Currently employed at a Colorado school site for 2 years or more
- Have at least 1 teacher who identifies as African American or Black at your school site and in their second year at the school site.

The risks associated with this study are minimal and are not greater than risks ordinarily encountered in daily life. There will be no cost for taking part in this study, aside from your time. We will begin with a 15 minute phone screener followed by a 45 - 60 minute individual interview. There is the possibility of being invited to a focus groups interview, which will last about 60 - 90 minutes. All information gathered during the study will be confidential. If you are interested in participating in this study, please reach out to me at 720-378-8771 and/or kdgriffen49401@creighton.edu.

Sincerely,
Karen Griffen, M.Ed.
Ed. D (c) Candidate
Educational Leadership Interdisciplinary Studies
Creighton University

*Appendix I**Codebook**Codes Discovered*

Name of Code	Description	Occurrences
Career	This code reference refers to the teaching occupation that a college student would undertake as a life opportunity.	28
Coach	In the teaching profession, coaches help colleagues improve teaching and learning practices through lesson-decision skills of instruction and technology.	86
Comfort		15
Committee	This code reference a group of colleagues appointed for a specific function with assisting the leadership in the decision making process to contribute to the efficient operation of the school community.	54
Commitment	This code represent teachers being dedicated to a cause or activity.	13
Community	This code acknowledges a group of people living in the same place or having a particular characteristic in a school community.	27
Connect	This references a relationship in which a leader or teacher links or associate with one another.	44
Content	In education, the topics, themes, beliefs, behaviors, concepts and facts grouped within each subject or learning area under knowledge, skills, values, and attitudes.	22
Conversations	This code reference a talk, especially an informal one, between two or more people, in which new ideas are exchanged.	111
Culturally Responsive	This code expresses the mindset of teachers in Title I schools being competent and having an awareness of one's own cultural identity and views about difference, and the ability to	55

	learn and build on the varying cultural and community norms of students and their families.	
Culture	In education, This reference where individuals are shaped by influences or where faculty exhibited or developed norms of learning.	106
Curriculum	In the teaching profession, curriculum is a standards-based sequence of planned experiences where students practice and achieve proficiency in content and applied learning skills.	14
Data	Units of information that are collected through observation to collect qualitative and quantitative data.	57
Decisions	In the teaching profession, this code references the action or process of deciding something or of resolving a questions.	30
Development	This code in Education reference development is a growing and vibrant field, defined as: “helping colleges and universities function effectively as teaching and learning communities.	152
Diverse	This code in in reference to variety that includes people from a range of different experiences, identities, and backgrounds.	5
Equity	This code references a measurement of achievement, fairness, and opportunity for marginalized people.	36
Effective	In the teaching force, this code is an act of producing a desired or intended result for positive student outcomes.	10
Expectations	This code references the act or state of looking of anticipating something in the future.	45
Experience	This code is noted as it is defined by practical contact with an observation of facts or events of an individual.	75
Feedback	This references a teacher’s performance of a task or behavior used as a basis for improvement.	93
Focus	This code indicates the center of interest or activity.	45

Goal	In teaching profession, goals are statement that describe the skills, competencies, and qualities that you should possess upon completion of a tasks.	34
Hire	In the teaching profession, this code references the practice of finding, evaluation, and establishing a working relationship with future teacher candidates.	58
Honor	Acknowledge or serve the school community with high respect and great esteem.	38
Identity	This code references the thoughts about your personal characteristics, interests, and skills.	40
Inclusive	In a school setting, the school site allows all kinds of staff members to belong to it, rather than just one kind of member.	16
Individual		6
Influence	This code references the affect or change someone or something in an indirect but usually important way.	68
Interact		20
Instruction	In the teaching profession, the purposeful direction of the learning process along with planning and management in a classroom setting.	65
Interview	This code references a conversation in which one person elicits information from another person to assess whether your qualifications and career ambitions align with the position.	98
Impact	Having a strong effect on someone or something.	55
Marginalized	This code represent a person or a group treated as insignificant compared to a dominate group of people.	5
Leadership	This code references school leaders developing teachers and helping them reach their full potential to maximize the success of the school community.	233
Mentor	This code references a leader helping a teacher mentee or protégé about his or her own career path, as	80

	well as provide guidance, motivation, emotional support, and role modeling.	
Mindset	A mental attitude, disposition, or inclination of your thoughts and beliefs that shape your habits.	7
Mission	In the teaching profession, a school's statement that defines the framework of educational goals, community priorities and the purpose of the school.	16
Motivation	The forces that account for the arousal, selection, direction, and continuation of behavior.	7
Opportunity	In education, this code references a set of circumstances that make it possible for teachers to gain leadership experiences.	7
Perspectives	A teacher's mindset that directly impact students' emotions and their learning.	8
Philosophy	This code references a school leader's set of ideas that identifies and clarifies the beliefs, values, understandings, and focus of a school.	25
Practice	This code references a wide range of educational activities, policies, and programmatic approaches to achieve positive changes in students' attitudes or academic behaviors.	74
Professional Growth	Value-drive, guided by principles, passion, and a purpose bigger than themselves.	130
Program	In the teaching profession, this code references a set of related measures or activities with a particular long-term aim for the development of students increasing creativity and productivity.	265
Race	This code references a category of humankind that shares certain distinctive physical traits.	138
Relationships	In the teaching profession, this code references the need of positive relationships and connections among leaders and teachers to give a strong sense of identity to prevent feeling isolated and disconnected with ourselves.	23

Retain	In the teaching profession, this code represent Black teachers returning to the same school site the following academic school year.	16
Retention	In the field of education, this code refers to research that focuses on how factors of school characteristics and teacher demographics affect whether teachers stay in their schools, move to different schools, or leave the profession before retirement.	6
Strategies	In education, this code represents planned techniques used to retain teachers.	4
Standards	In education, this code represent a repeatable expectation implemented through an organizational designed or guidelines to meet expectations and criteria of the teaching role.	9
Success	This code is noted as it is defined by the individual.	86
Support	The presence of this code indicates the scaffolds provided to Black teachers.	163
Values	This code acknowledges the school leader's moral development through actions to develop teachers' thinking to have a positive direction and shape their future.	63
Voice	This code acknowledges a teacher's voice is an important component of the school community in collaboration for decision making, self-identity, and empowerment.	25
Willing	This code references a mindset to be eager to help others, grow developmentally, and working hard to accomplish a goal.	59

Appendix J

Major Themes and Codes by Participant Group

Participant Group	Major Themes	Codes
Instructional Coaches	The effect of instructional development	Profession Growth, grow, success, support, consistency, focus, feedback, professional development, curriculum, perspective, coaching, mentoring, individual needs, influence, motivate, interact
	The impact of influence	Conversations, Connect, relations, impact, communication, voice, culture, race, culturally responsive, identity, inclusivity, mindset, code-switching
	Supports that foster retention	Leadership, commitment, mission, development, values, experiences, human conditions, trust, relational, appreciation, authentic-self, honor, freedom and latitude, gifts and talents
Assistant Principals	Professional development expectations	Instructional practices, expectations, programs, skill, instruction, curriculum, data, practice, development, goals, professional, develop
	Leadership influence through support	Support, leadership, support, mentor, coach, relationship, success, relations, conversation, influence, success
	How race impact retention	Culture, inclusivity, inclusive, culturally responsive, race, community values, impact, community, connect, value

Principals/Directors	Culturally responsive Develop	Culturally responsive, race, professional, culture, equity, values, honor, identity, leadership philosophy, committee, impact, hire, interview
	Conversations with the principal leader	Influence, leader, conversation, coach, mentor, feedback, decision
	Retention supports for beginning teachers	Career advisement, willing, successful, practice, success, goal
Focus Group Participants	Leadership and Development	Leadership, development, strategies, standards, coach, data, mentor role, model, perspective, needs, goal, focus, feedback practices, professional, models
	The Influence of Equity	Equity, voice, gender, beliefs, benefit, culture, influence, individual, marginalized diverse, honor, community, Impact, conversations
	Retention and Race	Race, commitment, Interview, willing, opportunity, relationship, retain, retention, connect, hire, expectations, standards

Appendix K

Exempt Approval



Office of the Provost
Research Compliance

DATE: 05-Mar-2021
 TO: Griffen, Karen
 FROM: Social / Behavioral IRB Board
 How School Leaders in Title I Schools
 PROJECT TITLE: Develop, Influence, and Retain Black Teachers.
 REFERENCE #: 2001728-01
 SUBMISSION TYPE: Initial Application
 REVIEW TYPE: Exempt
 ACTION: APPROVED
 EFFECTIVE DATE: 05-Mar-2021

Thank you for your Initial Application submission materials for this project. The following items were reviewed with this submission:

- Creighton University HS eForm~

This project has been determined to be exempt from Federal Policy for Protection of Human Subjects as per 45CFR46.101 (b) 2.

All protocol amendments and changes are to be submitted to the IRB and may not be implemented until approved by the IRB. Please use the modification form when submitting changes.

If you have any questions, please contact the IRB Office at 402-280-2126 or irb@creighton.edu. Please include your project title and number in all correspondence with this committee.

Institutional Review Board

☎ 402.280.2126 | ☎ 402.280.3200

Dr. C.C. and Mabel L. Criss Health Sciences Complex |
2500 California Plaza Omaha, NE 68178

creighton.edu

creighton.edu/researchservices/rcocommittees/irb